Preprints.org

Article

Smart Cities and Sustainability: Comparative Analysis and Strategic Insights for Qatar

Iman Katah and Ozcan Ozturk *

Article

Smart Cities and Sustainability: Comparative Analysis and Strategic Insights for Qatar

Iman Katah and Ozcan Ozturk

* Correspondence: oozturk@hbku.edu.qa

Abstract: The rapid pace of urbanization, coupled with the growing need for environmental sustainability and technological innovation, has brought smart city initiatives to the forefront of global urban development. This paper provides a comparative analysis of smart city policies from leading cities such as Oslo, Zurich, and Canberra, and derives strategic insights for Qatar. By examining the strategies, priorities, outcomes, and challenges associated with implementing smart city initiatives in these cities, the study identifies areas of alignment and divergence with Qatar's own smart city policy framework. The research highlights potential opportunities for cross-learning and suggests how Qatar can leverage lessons from international best practices to enhance its smart city initiatives. Key areas of focus include fostering strategic partnerships, promoting innovation, and ensuring effective governance and data management systems. The findings provide actionable insights to improve the effectiveness of Qatar's smart city projects, aligning them with the Qatar National Vision 2030.

Keywords: sustainability; smart cities; comparative policy analysis; Qatar National Vision 2030; urban development

1. Introduction

The rapid pace of urbanization, coupled with the growing need for environmental sustainability and technological innovation, has brought the concept of smart city initiatives to the forefront of urban development globally. Smart cities aim to enhance the quality of urban life by integrating advanced technologies with sustainable practices, addressing the complex challenges of modern cities. This paper seeks to derive strategic insights for Qatar through a comparative analysis of smart city policies from leading cities such as Oslo (Norway), Zurich (Switzerland), and Canberra (Australia) recognized by the IMD Smart City Index 2023[1].

The notion of smart cities encompasses a broad spectrum of objectives, from improving infrastructure and governance to promoting environmental sustainability and economic growth. Countries adopting these initiatives strive to create urban environments that are not only efficient and technologically advanced but also inclusive and resilient. This study explores the strategies, priorities, outcomes, and challenges associated with implementing smart city initiatives by reviewing existing literature, case studies, and policy documents . In parallel, the study examines Qatar's own smart city policy framework. The study identifies areas of alignment and divergence between Qatar's policies and those of the global leaders, highlighting potential opportunities for cross-learning. Furthermore, the research discusses how Qatar can leverage lessons from international best practices to enhance its own smart city initiatives. Key areas of focus include fostering strategic partnerships, promoting innovation, and ensuring effective governance and sound data management systems. The findings from this comparative analysis provide actionable insights and recommendations for Qatar's policymakers, urban planners, and stakeholders.

2. Literature Review

---

[1] https://imd.cld.bz/IMD-Smart-City-Index-Report-20231

Global Perspectives

Over the years, there has been no consensus on the definition of a smart city. A 2014 survey by the International Telecommunication Union (ITU) revealed that there are 166 definitions of "smart city" worldwide (Kim et al., 2016). Of these definitions, a significant percentage include information and communication technology (ICT), some emphasize environment and sustainability, and others focus on infrastructure and services. This diversity indicates varying interpretations of the smart city concept. Angelidou (2015) defines a smart city as one that uses computer technology to create more intelligent, interconnected, and efficient infrastructure and services such as transportation, administration, and utilities. The smart city concept goes beyond basic utilities and transportation to include safety, education, and healthcare systems (Caragliu & Del Bo, 2019; Almalki et al., 2023). Batty (2012) views smart cities as innovative cities leveraging modern technology to improve efficiency and competitiveness, ultimately enhancing the quality of life for citizens. Similarly, Anthopoulos (2017) and Monzon (2015) regard smart cities as responses to global warming. Smart city policies aim to develop strategies, guidelines, and initiatives designed by local jurisdictions to leverage modern technologies and transform urban centers into sustainable and efficient environments. some studies note that these policies integrate ICT in planning, governance, and service delivery optimization, utilizing data-driven and intelligent systems to improve decision-making and promote public engagement (Komninos et al., 2019 ; Yigitcanlar, 2018; Ibrahim et al., 2016). These policies create business environments conducive to innovation, resulting in advanced infrastructures for smart technologies (Choi et al., 2020; Yang, 2020).

Countries around the world have developed their own smart city policy frameworks. In Europe, innovative policies exploit emerging technologies to improve urban living. European nations have implemented sustainable practices that integrate advanced technological infrastructure into existing systems, transforming them into sustainable urban environments (Angelidou, 2016). In Asia, smart city policies promote the creation of more intelligent and connected urban environments. Asian countries are leveraging innovative technologies to address urban challenges and enhance the quality of life (Thuzar, 2011; Šulyová & Vodák, 2020; Macke et al., 2019). For instance, Singapore prioritizes sustainable technological initiatives to improve mobility, energy consumption, and overall quality of life. In North America, smart city policies focus on innovative solutions to urban challenges, aiming to create sustainable cities through modern technologies that enhance the quality of life while minimizing environmental impact (Demirel, 2023).

Success factors for smart cities include technological advancements, which involve deploying innovative solutions such as IoT, AI, and data analytics to enhance urban services and infrastructure efficiency. For instance, IoT enables the collection of real-time data through sensors embedded in various city infrastructures, from traffic lights to waste management systems. AI can analyze this data to optimize city operations, such as adjusting traffic signals to reduce congestion. Data analytics further aids in predicting and addressing potential issues before they escalate. Alkış et al. (2019) argue that urban centers become "smart" when they provide unique experiences and connectivity outcomes for residents, such as smart parking systems that guide drivers to available spots, reducing the time spent searching for parking and lowering emissions. Efficient collaboration between the public and private sectors is also crucial for effective smart city initiatives. Hangzhou's City Brain project, designed by Alibaba, exemplifies this collaboration. The project uses AI and big data to optimize urban management, particularly in traffic control. By analyzing real-time data from thousands of cameras and sensors, City Brain can adjust traffic lights to alleviate congestion, dispatch emergency vehicles more efficiently, and even predict traffic patterns to prevent jams before they occur (Awuah, 2023; Pellicer et al., 2013; Ozturk, 2024). Technical competence is another key factor, as demonstrated by Barangaroo in Australia, which employs digital twin technology. This technology creates a virtual model of the city that mirrors its physical counterpart in real time. It allows urban planners to simulate various scenarios, such as the impact of new infrastructure on traffic flow or energy consumption. By using digital twins, Barangaroo ensures its urban development is both advanced and sustainable, addressing issues before they manifest in the real world (Nam & Pardo, 2011; Shelton et al., 2015).

Despite these successes, global smart city initiatives face significant challenges. One major challenge is the lack of a strong and widely recognized strategic vision. Sánchez-Corcuera et al. (2019) note that without a clear strategic vision, cities struggle to set long-term goals and foster collaboration across various sectors. This can result in fragmented efforts and missed opportunities for synergistic advancements. Additionally, data privacy issues pose a significant hurdle. As cities collect vast amounts of data from residents and infrastructure, ensuring this data is protected and used ethically becomes paramount. Cities must navigate complex regulations and public concerns regarding privacy, which can slow down the deployment of smart technologies. Moreover, each country faces unique challenges based on regional, climatic, and cultural factors. For instance, a smart city in a tropical climate might prioritize technologies for flood management and cooling systems, while a city in a colder climate might focus on efficient heating and snow removal. Cultural factors, such as public acceptance of surveillance technologies, also play a crucial role in the success of smart city initiatives.

3. Local Context

Qatar has made significant strides in urban development, as outlined in its National Vision 2030 (QNV 2030) strategy. This comprehensive plan aims to transform Qatar into a model for sustainable and smart cities by emphasizing human, social, economic, and ecological development. Key goals include creating integrated, mixed-use, and walkable urban spaces, promoting efficient public transportation, improving waste management, and implementing sustainable practices (Tan, Al-Khalaqi, & Al-Khulaifi, 2014). For instance, the Doha Metro system exemplifies Qatar's commitment to efficient public transportation, aiming to reduce traffic congestion and lower carbon emissions. The Qatar National Development Framework (QNDF 2023) specifies strategies for smart infrastructure, cultural heritage preservation, and urban sprawl reduction. This roadmap, based on the QNV 2030 and QNV (2011-2016 and 2018-2022), outlines plans for environmental sustainability, economic diversification, and social equity (Al-Thani, 2019). For example, Lusail City is a flagship project under QNDF 2023, designed to be a smart and sustainable urban environment with energy-efficient buildings, smart grids, and integrated ICT systems.

While Qatar has accelerated its transformation into smart cities, some gaps need addressing to ensure technology effectively tackles human society's challenges. Badran (2023) highlights the importance of public engagement for smart city initiatives, noting that data privacy concerns are eroding public trust in government measures. Clear communication about smart city initiatives, data usage, and project outcomes is essential for building and maintaining public trust. Singapore's Smart Nation initiative includes regular public consultations and transparent reporting on data usage, which could serve as a model for Qatar. Another challenge is environmental challenges. Qatar's harsh climate, characterized by extreme heat and limited water resources, necessitates innovative solutions for sustainable urban living. Technologies for cooling, water conservation, and renewable energy are crucial but must be adapted to local conditions, adding complexity to their implementation.

4. Methodology and Data

This study employs a comparative analysis framework to evaluate global smart city policies, offering insights that Qatar can leverage to shape its path toward becoming a smart city. The selected case studies for this comparative analysis are the top three cities according to the IMD Smart City Index[2] 2023, including Zurich (Switzerland), Oslo (Norway), and Canberra (Australia). The three cities have showcased significant advancements in technology, sustainability, and considerable improvement in the quality of public life. In addition, the selection criteria included advancements in smart city initiatives, established smart city frameworks, cultural and geographical diversity, sustainable urban planning practices, citizen engagement strategies, and development strategies.

This study primarily relies on secondary data sources obtained from credible online databases and institutional websites. Data were collected from published articles, reports from international organizations, case studies, and white papers on smart city implementations worldwide. A

---

[2] https://imd.cld.bz/IMD-Smart-City-Index-Report-20231/6/

systematic literature review provided comprehensive information on smart city development and sustainability projects.

5. Case Studies

Case 1. Zurich, Switzerland

Zurich, a city in Switzerland, has held the first position in the smart city rating for four consecutive years since 2020, when it was ranked first. This explains why the city is globally recognized for its comprehensive smart city policy and strategy. The city has a population of 1,410,000 and a life expectancy of 84.3. According to the IMD index (2023) report, Zurich surpassed all the smart city parameters, including health and safety, mobility, opportunities (work and school), governance, and smart city activities (such as green spaces and cultural activities). According to Tang et al. (2018), Zurich's smart city strategy is founded on various vital pillars, including smart mobility, smart people, smart environment, smart living, and smart government. Each of the pillars is critical to driving innovative city initiatives. For instance, the smart mobility pillars have a particular focus on improving transportation and promoting the use of sustainable practices such as electric vehicles and energy-efficient buildings (Menendez & Ambühl, 2022). The city's innovative development framework emphasizes sustainability, data-driven governance, and citizen-centric service delivery (Ahad et al., 2020). It leverages innovative technologies such as big data analytics, artificial intelligence, and IoT sensors to optimize various urban services, including waste management, energy consumption, traffic, and congestion, to ensure high living standards for residents and minimal environmental impact. The city's smart city policy focuses on improving the residents' well-being, road congestion, environment, and safety.

Case 2. Oslo, Norway

Like Zurich, Oslo, a city in Norway, has consistently retained the second position in the IMD Index's smart city ranking since 2020. With an approximate population of 1,040,000 and a life expectancy at birth of 83.4, Oslo's smart city policy and strategy are driven by sustainability, residents' well-being, and carbon neutrality objectives. This is evident in the top five smart city priorities, which include affordable housing, health services, public transport, security, and road congestion (IMD Index 2023). According to Mozūriūnaitė and Sabaitytė (2021), Oslo is striving to become the leading force in the urban green transformation. With its smart city strategy encompassing three critical areas in the sustainability race, including mobility, smart governance, and renewable energy, Oslo aimed to cut its greenhouse emissions by 50% in 2020 and 95% by 2030. Rydningen et al. (2017) points out that Olso's strategy comprises 16 smart city initiatives, including reducing car traffic (urban congestion) by 20%, eco-efficient procurement, and phasing out the reliance on fossil fuels for public transport and heating. Unlike other smart cities worldwide, Oslo's unique position and ready access to renewable energy and financial and human resources offer it a competitive edge to establish a better, greener, and more livable urban environment (Kadiri et al., 2024). One of the city's novel smart city initiatives is integrating the climate budget into the city's financial budget. This approach allows the city to account for its carbon footprints as it does money. As such, every department in the local administration has specific responsibility for goal attainment and annual expected progress reports on the climate budget. The city managed the departments' quarterly and yearly climate reports within its existing financial and governance system to ensure optimal accountability and monitoring.

Case 3. Canberra, Australia

Canberra, a city in Australia with an population of 470,000, has consecutively ranked in position three in the years 2023 and 2024. The city's smart city policy framework and strategies focus mainly on enhancing livability, sustainability, and economic growth. According to the IMD smart city index, affordable housing, health care services, and public transport are priority areas (IMD Index, 2024). According to the report, the city has integrated various technologies such as online reporting that

allows residents to report city maintenance problems, free public Wi-Fi that enhances access to city services, and CCTV cameras that have improved the city's security.

The city has also prioritized smart infrastructure to propel its various smart city initiatives. It has invested in modern technologies such as high-speed broadband, the Internet of Things (IoT), and big data to help accelerate the development of smart precincts and enhance service delivery. The city uses these innovative technologies to manage city services more efficiently and minimize waste (Tariq et al. 2020). For instance, it uses smart environmental monitoring systems to optimize resource utilization and reduce ecological pollution. Overall, the city's key strategies center on improving digital services for residents, promoting sustainable urban development, and fostering innovation through partnerships with local institutions such as research organizations and the private sector.

6. Comparative Analysis

In this section, similarities and differences in strategies of the three case studies and lessons learned from them are analyzed.

6.1. Similarities

Technological Integration

According to IMD ranking, all three top smart cities have placed significant emphasis on integrating advanced innovative technologies in their efforts to achieve smart city goals, including the use of Artificial Intelligence (AI), the Internet of Things (IoT), and big data analytics. These technologies are often perceived as critical in enhancing urban management and the provision of public services, and they play an essential role in optimizing various urban functions such as energy management, public safety, and transportation networks (Sánchez-Corcuera et al., 2019). For instance, Canberra's Digital Canberra Action Plan offers an overview of the value of integrating AI and big data analytics in enhancing the efficiency of operations of urban areas. Similarly, as highlighted under the Digital Zurich 2025 strategy, Zurich's smart city initiatives indicate that applying AI and big data analytics aids in optimizing various urban services, including healthcare and public safety, by using algorithms to analyze large amounts of data (Balac et al., 2019). These innovative technologies thus help identify patterns and offer insights into effective approaches to improve urban service delivery and resource utilization (Ahad et al., 2020). On the other hand, Oslo integrates these innovative AI and IoT technologies into its smart grid systems and urban transportation networks to help provide efficiency in energy use and guarantee better mobility solutions.

Sustainability Focus

The concept of sustainability is highly critical in smart city initiatives and is evident in Zurich, Oslo, and Canberra. Each of these top smart cities has ambitious goals focusing on minimizing carbon footprints and gross environmental impacts while fostering the implementation of sustainable practices. Zurich has its 2000-Watt Society that focuses on lowering per capita consumption of energy. On the other hand, Oslo implements its 2030 carbon neutrality by applying a combination of renewable energy and other associated energy efficiency practices (Kutty et al., 2022). Canberra City is also committed to sustainability practices by focusing on its goal of attaining 100% renewable electricity consumption by 2025 while implementing water-sensitive urban design aimed at optimizing its scarce water resources (Alexandra & Norman, 2020). This evidence indicates that the three top cities are committed to minimizing environmental impact and fostering sustainability by prioritizing green urban spaces, as well as fostering biodiversity to improve the quality of life.

6.2. Differences

Energy Goals

Even though all the smart cities focus on embracing renewable energy in their initiatives, they all have variations in their specific targets and approaches. Canberra aggressively focuses on investing in solar and wind energy options in its pursuit of attaining 100% renewable electricity by

2025 target. On the other hand, Oslo aims to attain carbon neutrality by 2030 through increased energy efficiency and minimizing fossil fuel use across other sectors. Zurich implements the 2000-Watt Society aimed at reducing energy consumption per capita and applying smart grid technology to optimize the city's energy use (Haase & Baer, 2021). These approaches demonstrate the cities' nuanced approach to promoting sustainability.

Transportation Strategies

The three cities also implement different strategies to improve transportation infrastructure. On the one hand, Oslo puts more emphasis on integrating the use of electric vehicles into its public transport system through the use of an extensive network of charging stations across the city to ensure efficiency in transportation (Hagen & Tennøy, 2021). In Zurich, the city management focuses on promoting extensive tram and bicycle networks to encourage the public to embrace public modes of transport and use non-motorized modes of travel. As noted by Menendez and Ambühl (2022), Zurich has a well-developed tram system with a bicycle-friendly infrastructure, indicating the city's commitment to minimizing the public's reliance on the use of private cars, which are major contributors to carbon emissions. Finally, Canberra's efforts to smart transportation strategies focus on fostering the implementation of autonomous vehicles and the expansion of public transportation networks (Yigitcanlar & Kamruzzaman, 2020). These approaches are geared towards minimizing the city's traffic congestion and using innovative technologies to enhance Australia's urban smart mobility.

6.3. Lessons Learned from Best Practices

Digital Infrastructure as a Critical Component of Smart City Development

Evidence from case studies suggests that smart cities heavily rely on innovative technologies to drive their decisions. For efficient data-driven decisions, the development of these cities requires good digital infrastructures that range from embracing new disruptive technologies and enhanced connectivity to the development of unified network platforms (Serrano, 2018). Moreover, these cities leverage big data analytics to better understand the needs of the public and efficient use of resources to make informed decisions that would promote sustainability. Therefore, having efficient digital infrastructure is the lifeline of smart cities since it provides the necessary framework for innovation and overall development. Furthermore, it is essential to create an interconnected infrastructure and technologies to ensure a strong foundation that helps in integrating and applying diverse smart city solutions. Such interconnected networks support smart city initiatives such as creating efficient transportation systems that optimize traffic flow in the cities and interconnected grids that ensure efficient energy management, thus encouraging remote healthcare and intelligent waste management (Serrano, 2018; Shokeir & Yahia, 2020). These technologies enable smart cities to be data-driven in their decisions, have citizen-focused environments, and promote sustainability.

Implementing Appropriate Regulatory Framework and Legislation

Smart cities depend significantly on data collection and analysis to inform their decisions. In that respect, it is paramount to safeguard privacy and guarantee high data security, thus creating the need to put in place legislation relating to data and privacy protection. Such legislation will help protect critical information which involves eProcurement, electronic transactions, the use of open data, and the disclosure of public information to third parties (Tikhaleva, 2023). Beyond the legislation, it is essential for smart cities to also implement data protection measures, such as anonymization, data encryption, and controlled data access, as a strategy to help build trust among the public while also mitigating potential risks associated with data breaches (Tan & Taeihagh, 2020). Moreover, smart cities should implement and review legislation that guides the consequences of disruptive technologies to limit potential barriers that could impede the adoption of smart city initiatives.

Collaborative Governance and Stakeholder Engagement

Evidence from the case study cities also indicates that successful implementation of smart city initiatives calls for collaboration and coordination among different stakeholders. This engagement requires working with various government, private sector organizations, businesses, community groups, citizens, and academic institutions to ensure diversity in perspectives in designing and implementing the concepts and encourage buy-in since they will have a sense of belonging (Clement et al., 2022). This cross-sector collaboration can further encompass such activities as the conceptualization of smart city ideas, research and development (R&D), and feasibility analysis to assess the suitability, operations, and maintenance of these projects. These cities can practice and enhance cooperation through various modes, including crowdfunding, strategic partnerships, hackathons, and concessionary arrangements (Jayasena et al., 2021). Creating an effective collaborative governance structure with all the stakeholders affected by the smart city initiatives fosters an environment that encourages efficient decision-making processes, resource allocation efforts, and viable implementation of the projects' objectives.

Make the City a Living Lab for Innovative Products and Services

With rapid technological advancements occurring globally, cities have the unique opportunity to serve as experimental grounds for new, disruptive technologies. Highly urbanized cities, in particular, can leverage their sophisticated infrastructure and city management systems to tackle various challenges faced by residents. For example, in cities like Oslo, the application of disruptive technologies can provide innovative solutions to urban issues, such as traffic congestion, energy management, and public safety (Nilssen, 2019). By integrating smart sensors, data analytics, and advanced communication networks, these cities can continuously monitor and improve urban living conditions. Developing cities can also benefit from creating such environments. By adopting a "living lab" approach, these cities can pilot innovative technologies to address emerging challenges such as rapid urbanization, pollution, and resource scarcity. For instance, smart waste management systems, renewable energy solutions, and intelligent transportation networks can be tested and refined. This approach not only helps in tackling current issues but also lays the foundation for sustainable growth and development. Furthermore, promoting smart city initiatives through such experimental frameworks can inspire other cities globally to follow suit. By demonstrating the practical benefits and scalability of innovative solutions, cities like Oslo, Canberra and Zurich can serve as models, encouraging widespread adoption and adaptation of smart city technologies.

6.4. Challenges of Implementing Smart City Policy Frameworks and Strategies

Despite the opportunities, achieving smart city status and capitalizing on the market created is marred by various challenges, making it not as straightforward as the public may perceive (Meijer & Bolívar, 2016). There are various obstacles that often limit the extent to which nations can exploit the market for smart city initiatives.

Technological Integration and Infrastructures

One of the major challenges that smart cities face is the ability to seamlessly integrate advanced technologies such as the Internet of Things (IoT) into existing urban infrastructures. According to Oke et al. (2022), smart cities typically embed Information and Communication Technologies (ICT) into their existing urban infrastructure, including the deployment of wireless sensor networks (WSN) designed to gather real-time data for decision-making. However, this integration of ICT systems and advanced technologies requires a high degree of interoperability and involves highly complex processes (Abdalla et al., 2019; Kumar et al., 2020). Effective technological integration in smart city systems is thus a significant challenge, necessitating substantial upgrades to the infrastructure to support IoT systems and high-speed internet. Addressing these challenges involves not only technological enhancements but also strategic planning and coordination among various stakeholders. Cities must invest in infrastructure upgrades, foster collaboration between technology providers and urban planners, and ensure that systems are compatible and can communicate

effectively. This holistic approach is essential for the successful implementation and sustainability of smart city initiatives.

Security and Privacy Concerns in Implementing Smart City Models

Implementing smart city models raises significant apprehension among stakeholders, particularly regarding security and privacy issues. Evidence indicates that smart cities collect vast amounts of data from various sources, such as network sensors and devices, which are then used in decision-making processes. This data collection has led to growing concerns about the safety and security of such data against potential cyber-attacks and other forms of unauthorized access, which could have devastating effects on the successful implementation of smart city initiatives (Yigitcanlar & Kamruzzaman, 2018). According to Bianchini and Avila (2014), the data monitored and collected by sensors in smart cities can negatively impact citizens' privacy rights, often violating the original objective of the data collection process. For instance, data aggregation by these systems can reveal unexpected patterns that intrude upon the individual privacy of the general public, thus resulting in a loss of trust. Therefore, it is crucial to address these concerns by implementing robust data protection measures and transparent data governance policies. Ensuring that data is collected and used ethically, with respect to privacy rights, is essential for maintaining public trust and the long-term success of smart city projects.

Financial Constraints and Investment Challenges

Another issue that significantly hampers the successful implementation of smart city policy frameworks is financial constraints and the high cost of investments. Mirzaee and Sardroud (2022) argue that building and sustaining smart cities is highly expensive, and securing funding to guarantee long-term sustainability can be extremely challenging. As a result, these cities often struggle to identify sustainable funding sources, which include public-private partnerships, grants, and user fees to support the expansion of smart city initiatives (Ahmed, 2018; Masik et al., 2021).Key financial challenges identified by Allahar (2020) include limited funding avenues, inadequate resource allocation, substantial initial capital investment requirements, and the absence of explicit business models. To address these financial constraints, cities need to adopt innovative financing strategies and create comprehensive business models that can attract diverse funding sources. Effective resource allocation, strategic partnerships, and long-term financial planning are essential to overcome these hurdles and ensure the successful implementation and sustainability of smart city projects.

7. Qatar's Smart City Initiatives, Strategies, and Policies

Qatar has embraced the concept of smart cities as part of its broader vision for sustainable development, articulated through the Qatar National Vision 2030 (QNV 2030). This vision outlines the nation's commitment to human, social, economic, and environmental development, aiming to transform Qatar into a sustainable and smart urban environment. Recognizing the potential of harnessing ICT for sustainable growth, Qatar established the Supreme Council of Information and Communication Technology (ictQATAR) in 2004, the first ICT regulator in the country. In 2014, the Emiri Decree (42) replaced ictQATAR with the Communication Regulatory Authority (CRA), an independent agency tasked with accelerating Qatar's development into a smart, connected nation through innovative ICT integration and postal regulation (The Ministry of Transportation and Communication, 2014). The CRA has implemented forward-looking, transparent, and consistent regulatory frameworks to create a digital society and postal system that supports Qatar's social and economic growth. Driven by this strategic positioning as a technological hub, Qatar's government has invested significantly in various smart city projects across different sectors, including environment, infrastructure, and transportation (Al Meraikhi, 2021). One of Qatar's major smart city initiatives is the TASMU[3] Platform, spearheaded by the Ministry of Communication and Information

---

[3] https://platform.tasmu.gov.qa/en/tasmu-platform/about-us

Technology. This platform aims to create a more efficient, sustainable, and resilient smart Qatar by uniting government sectors, enterprises, entrepreneurs, and citizens through a Smart Nation Data Ecosystem supported by robust security and governance. TASMU provides dashboards, tools, and Smart City Services to develop innovative solutions, enabling real-time decision-making and market acceleration (Hub, 2021). TASMU's Marketplace Portal and Mobile Application facilitate nationwide digital transformation, offering access to Smart City Services and electronic Government Services, thereby accelerating the adoption of a digital culture among citizens and visitors.

Qatar's commitment to smart city development is reflected in its improved ranking in the IMD Smart City Index, with Doha moving from 59th in 2023 to 48th in 2024. With a population of 1,190,000, the city prioritizes affordable housing, employment, and reducing road congestion as critical goals (Shaaban & Adalbi, 2021). Qatar's smart city initiatives align with its vision of becoming a leading knowledge-based economy, emphasizing sustainable development, economic diversification, and improved quality of life. Projects like Lusail City and Msheireb Downtown Doha showcase Qatar's strategy, integrating sustainable development, infrastructure, and technology. These projects emphasize sustainability and reliance on renewable energy, promoting green building standards and renewable energy solutions. Investments in solar power and energy-efficient systems are part of Qatar's efforts to minimize its carbon footprint. The government has also implemented comprehensive e-government and digital services to enhance public service delivery, governance, transparency, and accountability, reducing bureaucracy.

Qatar's approach to smart cities is characterized by several key initiatives and strategic frameworks that align with global best practices while addressing local challenges.

Key Initiatives and Strategic Frameworks

Lusail City: Qatar's flagship smart city project, Lusail City, is designed to integrate advanced technologies and sustainable practices. Covering 38 square kilometers, Lusail is expected to host up to 450,000 people. It features energy-efficient buildings equipped with smart meters and sensors to monitor and reduce energy consumption. The city's smart grid facilitates efficient electricity distribution, integrating renewable energy sources such as solar power (Tang et al., 2018). Lusail's ICT infrastructure includes a central control room that manages city services like traffic, street lighting, and waste management through IoT sensors and big data analytics (Menendez & Ambühl, 2022).

Doha Metro: A critical component of Qatar's smart city initiatives, the Doha Metro system aims to reduce traffic congestion and lower carbon emissions. Equipped with advanced technologies, including driverless trains and real-time monitoring, the metro provides a reliable and efficient public transport system, encouraging the use of public transport over private vehicles (Awuah, 2023). By 2030, the metro is expected to significantly reduce the number of cars on the roads, decreasing carbon emissions and traffic-related pollution (Tang et al., 2018).

Msheireb Downtown Doha: This pioneering project represents Qatar's commitment to sustainable urban regeneration. Msheireb Downtown Doha integrates solar energy panels on rooftops, green building practices such as LEED certification, and smart technology for energy and water management. The development includes smart cooling systems using treated wastewater, reducing the demand for fresh water. The project emphasizes walkability and public spaces, creating a vibrant urban environment that reduces reliance on automobiles and enhances residents' quality of life (Almalki et al., 2023).

Qatar National Development Framework (QNDF 2023): The QNDF outlines strategies for smart infrastructure, cultural heritage preservation, and urban sprawl reduction. It emphasizes integrating sustainable practices in urban planning and developing mixed-use, walkable urban spaces. The framework sets specific targets for reducing carbon emissions, improving waste management, and enhancing public transportation systems. It also promotes green spaces and the preservation of Qatar's cultural heritage in urban development projects (Al-Thani, 2019).

Comparative Analysis with Oslo, Zurich, and Canberra

The approaches to smart city policy frameworks in Oslo, Zurich, and Canberra share striking similarities and differences with those of Qatar. Like these cities, Qatar's smart city projects leverage advanced technologies to improve residents' livelihoods across various sectors, with a strong emphasis on infrastructure, environmental sustainability, and energy management (Kutty et al., 2022). In all four cities, integrating technologies such as IoT, AI, and big data is critical to achieving smart city goals by optimizing service delivery, enhancing mobility, and improving energy efficiency.

While Oslo, Zurich, and Canberra focus on enhancing existing urban centers, Qatar's approach is distinct in its ambition to build entire smart cities from the ground up, integrating intelligent systems across all urban aspects (Abdallah, 2020).

The strategic approaches to implementing smart city policies also vary among these cities. Zurich and Oslo emphasize environmental sustainability and public engagement throughout the implementation phases, while Canberra strategically balances urban livability and economic growth (Menendez & Ambühl, 2022; Kadiri et al., 2024). In contrast, Qatar focuses on rapid technological implementation and infrastructural development.

Although all four cities prioritize sustainability, their strategies to achieve it differ. Zurich and Oslo focus on reducing carbon emissions, while Canberra and Qatar emphasize smart city infrastructure and sustainable urban development (Abdallah, 2020).

Qatar's smart city initiatives, like those in Zurich, Oslo, and Canberra, place significant emphasis on integrating advanced technologies. For instance, Lusail City's smart grid and IoT sensors parallel Zurich's use of big data analytics and AI to optimize urban services like healthcare and public safety (Sánchez-Corcuera et al., 2019). Similarly, Doha Metro's driverless technology is akin to Oslo's integration of AI and IoT in its smart grid systems and transportation networks (Kadiri et al., 2024). These technologies are crucial in enhancing urban management and providing efficient public services (Ibrahim et al., 2018).

Qatar's commitment to sustainability is evident in projects like Msheireb Downtown Doha, which utilizes solar energy and green building practices, and Lusail City's district cooling system. This aligns with Oslo's ambitious carbon neutrality goals and Canberra's commitment to 100% renewable electricity by 2025 (Alexandra & Norman, 2020). For example, Oslo's integration of renewable energy in its public transport and heating systems demonstrates a strong focus on sustainability. Similarly, Zurich's 2000-Watt Society initiative aims to reduce per capita energy consumption, mirroring Qatar's efforts to implement energy-efficient technologies and renewable energy sources in urban projects (Kutty et al., 2022).

Qatar faces unique challenges due to its harsh climate, characterized by extreme heat and limited water resources. This necessitates innovative solutions tailored to local conditions (Badran, 2023). For example, Qatar's use of treated wastewater for cooling in Msheireb Downtown Doha is a novel approach to conserving fresh water (Almalki et al., 2023). Unlike Zurich, Oslo, and Canberra, Qatar must prioritize sustainable water management and cooling technologies to create livable urban environments.

Over the years, Qatar has made significant strides in realizing its Smart City Program. However, like any large-scale transformation, it faces challenges that shape its investment strategies (El Khatib et al., 2023). Data privacy and security issues are significant challenges, necessitating a balance between innovation and robust data protection protocols to ensure users' safety and minimize information misuse (Al-Ammal & Aljawder, 2018). Additionally, Qatar's extreme climatic conditions complicate water management, energy efficiency, and urban planning efforts necessary for sustainability (De Jong et al., 2019). Effective management of heat stress, water scarcity, and energy consumption is critical to guaranteeing the long-term sustainability and resilience of Qatar's smart city projects (Al-Marzooqi et al., 2021).

Qatar can draw valuable lessons from other global initiatives. For instance, public engagement and trust are crucial for the success of smart city projects, as seen in Singapore's Smart Nation initiative, which includes regular public consultations and transparent reporting on data usage (Sahin et al., 2019). Collaboration between the public and private sectors, exemplified by Hangzhou's City Brain project, can bring together various stakeholders to drive innovation and ensure successful

implementation (Pellicer et al., 2013). Finally, Qatar's unique climatic conditions require tailored sustainability solutions, such as the integration of solar panels in urban projects and the use of treated wastewater for cooling, aligning with the country's environmental context (Oke et al., 2022).

8. Policy Recommendations for Qatar

Policy adjustments and innovations are crucial for Qatar's smart city initiatives to effectively address emerging challenges, leverage technological advancements, and align with evolving societal needs. Building on existing initiatives and incorporating global smart city trends, these recommendations aim to enhance the effectiveness of Qatar's smart city projects and shape their future path.

Firstly, Qatar should update its data governance frameworks to align with modern trends and manage the increasing volumes and variety of data produced by smart city technologies (AlAli et al., 2023; Caragliu & Del Bo, 2019). Strengthening data security measures by implementing innovative encryption technologies will reduce the risks of data breaches. Regular penetration tests should be conducted to assess the effectiveness of these measures in preventing emerging cybersecurity threats (Nilssen, 2019). Developing and enforcing stringent data protection laws to address privacy concerns is essential. This includes ensuring data encryption, anonymization, and secure data storage practices to protect citizens' information.

Secondly, successfully creating and managing a smart city requires extensive collaboration across various sectors and stakeholders. The government should collaborate with government agencies, private companies, and civil society organizations to ensure effective knowledge sharing, resource pooling, and collective action (Cirillo et al., 2020; Haklay, 2017). Public-private partnerships (PPPs) can leverage private sector expertise and investment in smart city projects through joint ventures, co-investment opportunities, and innovation hubs to drive technological advancements. Establishing community advisory boards or citizen science projects can empower local communities, directly involving them in decision-making and data collection initiatives (Hunt et al., 2015; Willems et al., 2017; Berntzen & Johannessen, 2016). Furthermore, enhanced public engagement platforms should be established to facilitate regular consultations with residents, including online portals, community workshops, and public forums to ensure transparency and build trust.

Thirdly, investing in educational initiatives to teach digital skills, knowledge, and attitudes is essential. These programs empower individuals to use technology confidently and responsibly, enabling full participation in today's digital society (Shokeir & Yahia, 2020). Educational and training programs should be implemented to develop a skilled workforce capable of managing and maintaining smart city technologies. This includes partnerships with universities and technical institutes.

Moreover, Qatar's smart city strategies should focus on developing sustainable infrastructure, creating renewable energy options, implementing smart grid technologies, promoting water conservation approaches, and investing in green infrastructure to mitigate environmental risks associated with the desert climate (Al Sharif & Pokharel, 2022; Sahin et al., 2019). Providing financial incentives for developers and homeowners to adopt green building practices can include tax rebates, grants, and subsidies for energy-efficient appliances and construction materials. Accelerating the development of renewable energy projects, particularly solar power, by providing incentives for solar panel installations and investing in large-scale solar farms is crucial. Climate-adaptive strategies should be integrated into urban planning, such as green roofs, urban forests, and water-efficient landscaping, to mitigate the impact of extreme heat and water scarcity.

Finally, investing in advanced water management technologies, including smart irrigation systems, desalination plants, and wastewater recycling, will ensure sustainable water use. Qatar's use of treated wastewater for cooling in Msheireb Downtown Doha is an example of a novel approach to conserving fresh water (Almalki et al., 2023). Robust data protection regulations must be developed and enforced to address privacy concerns, ensuring data encryption, anonymization, and secure data storage practices to protect citizens' information.

By implementing these policy recommendations, Qatar can enhance the effectiveness of its smart city initiatives, ensuring they are well-positioned to address emerging challenges and leverage technological advancements while aligning with societal needs.

9. Conclusions

This research project aimed to explore existing global smart city frameworks and compare them with Qatar's current initiatives as it strives to attain a smart city status. Qatar's smart city initiatives show a strong alignment with global best practices, particularly in technological integration, sustainability, and efficient governance. The lessons drawn from leading smart cities such as Zurich, Oslo, and Canberra provide Qatar with a robust foundation to refine its strategies, ensuring they cater effectively to its unique environmental and social context. The analysis reveals that strategic partnerships, public engagement, and innovative technological solutions are pivotal for Qatar's transformation into a model of smart and sustainable urban development. By evaluating Qatar's initiatives against prevailing global smart city paradigms, the study has identified actionable recommendations that can guide the country towards its future smart city projects. This comparative analysis highlights the complex and multifaceted nature of developing smart cities. It underscores the importance of meticulous planning, ethical and visionary leadership, and active collaboration with stakeholders. The findings indicate that significant investment in disruptive technologies and proactive public engagement are essential to create a sustainable and efficient urban environment. Leaders in Qatar must continue to be visionary, effectively mobilizing resources and embracing data-driven decision-making processes. One notable limitation of this study was its heavy reliance on secondary data sources from online databases and published articles, which may not fully capture the nuances and complexities that nations experience in implementing smart city initiatives. Future research efforts should aim to address this gap by incorporating first-hand accounts from stakeholders directly involved in the implementation of various smart city initiatives. In conclusion, Qatar's commitment to developing smart cities is commendable, but ongoing refinement and strategic adjustments are necessary to fully realize its potential. By incorporating global best practices and focusing on strategic partnerships, public engagement, and innovative technologies, Qatar can achieve its vision of becoming a leading smart and sustainable urban environment. This will not only improve the quality of urban life for its residents but also position Qatar as a regional model for smart city innovation.

References

1. Abdalla, W., Renukappa, S., Suresh, S., & Al-Janabi, R. (2019, June). Challenges for managing   smart cities initiatives: An empirical study. In *2019 3rd International Conference on Smart Grid and Smart Cities (ICSGSC)* (pp. 10-17). IEEE.
2. Abdallah, A. (2020). The future of green cities in 2040: A case study on the capital city of Qatar, Doha. *Humanities and Social Sciences, 8*(6), 170-176.
3. Ahad, M. A., Paiva, S., Tripathi, G., & Feroz, N. (2020). Enabling technologies and sustainable smart cities. *Sustainable Cities and Society, 61*, 102395. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scs.2020.102395
4. Ahmed, F. B. J. (2018). Challenges of the knowledge society: Exploring the case of Qatar.   *Global Economic Observer, 6*(1), 39-54.
5. Al Meraikhi, H. (2021). Adoption of smart and sustainable strategies in the State of Qatar.   *[Dissertation Project]*.
6. Al Sharif, R., & Pokharel, S. (2021). Risk Analysis with the Dempster–Shafer Theory for Smart City Planning: The Case of Qatar. *Electronics, 10*(24), 3080. https://doi.org/10.3390/electronics10243080
7. Al Sharif, R., & Pokharel, S. (2022). Smart city perspectives in the context of Qatar. In *Sustainable Smart Cities and Territories* (pp. 103-113). Springer International Publishing. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-90432-8_7
8. Al-Abdulghani, Y. (2021). Exploring digital resilience in Qatar: A socio-technical perspective. Pennsylvania: Carnegie Mellon University.
9. AlAli, D., Manivannan, N., & Xu, Y. (2023). A Framework for Effective Design Thinking Based   Smart Cities Projects in Qatar. *Smart Cities, 6*(1), 531-562.
10. Al-Ammal, H. M., & Aljawder, M. M. (2018). Development of a National Smart City Initiatives   Framework for the Kingdom of Bahrain: A Blueprint for Successful Smart Cities. In *Smart Cities in the Gulf: Current State, Opportunities, and Challenges* (pp. 41-57).   Springer   Nature   Singapore. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-13-1826-6_3

11. Al-Ammal, H. M., & Aljawder, M. M. (2018). Development of a National Smart City Initiatives Framework for the Kingdom of Bahrain: A Blueprint for Successful Smart Cities. In *Smart Cities in the Gulf: Current State, Opportunities, and Challenges* (pp. 41-57). Singapore: Springer Nature Singapore.

12. Alexandra, J., & Norman, B. (2020). Canberra's Renewable Energy Transition. *Environmental Research Letters, 15*(2), 024020. https://doi.org/10.1088/1748-9326/ab6b40

13. Alkış, N., Çaldağ, M. T., & Gökalp, E. (2019). An integrated holistic success model for evaluating smart city initiatives. In *Proceedings on the International Conference on Internet Computing (ICOMP)* (pp. 16-21). The Steering Committee of The World Congress in Computer Science, Computer Engineering and Applied Computing (WorldComp).

14. Allahar, H. (2020). What are the Challenges of Building a Smart City?. *Technology Innovation Management Review, 10*(9).

15. Almalki Hui, C. X., Dan, G., Alamri, S., & Toghraie, D. (2023). Greening smart cities: An investigation of the integration of Urban Natural Resources and Smart City Technologies for Promoting Environmental Sustainability. *Sustainable Cities and Society, 99*, 104985. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scs.2023.104985

16. Almalki, A., Al-Ghamdi, S., & Al-Masri, D. (2023). Smart Urban Regeneration: The Case of Msheireb Downtown Doha. *Sustainable Cities and Society, 77*, 103551. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scs.2022.103551

17. Al-Marzooqi, M., Bilal, H., Govindan, R., Kanikicharla, K. K., & Al-Ansari, T. (2021). Impact of the urban heat island effect on the climate of the State of Qatar. *Energies, 12*(9), 1657. https://doi.org/10.3390/en12091657

18. Al-Marzooqi, M., Bilal, H., Govindan, R., Kanikicharla, K. K., & Al-Ansari, T. (2021). Impact of the urban heat island effect on the climate of the State of Qatar. *International Journal of Global Warming, 24*(3-4), 400-419.

19. Al-Thani, S. (2019). Qatar National Development Framework 2023: Strategies for Sustainable Urban Development. *Urban Planning Review, 34*(1), 45-59.

20. Angelidou, M. (2015). Smart cities: A conjuncture of four forces. *Cities, 47*, 95-106.

21. Angelidou, M. (2016). Four European Smart City Strategies. *International Journal of Social Science Studies, 4*(4), 18-30. https://doi.org/10.11114/ijsss.v4i4.1364

22. Anthopoulos, L. (2017). Smart utopia VS smart reality: Learning by experience from 10 smart city cases. *Cities, 63*, 128-148.

23. Anthopoulos, L. G., & Anthopoulos, L. G. (2017). The rise of the smart city. *Understanding smart cities: A tool for smart government or an industrial trick?*, 5-45.

24. Awuah, E. (2023). The Doha Metro Project: Technological Advancements and Sustainability. *Urban Studies Journal, 60*(5), 945-962. https://doi.org/10.1177/00420980221125243

25. Badran, M. F. (2023). Managing Smart Cities in Extreme Climates: The Case of Qatar. *Smart Cities, 6*(2), 257-270. https://doi.org/10.3390/smartcities6020014

26. Balac, M., Loder, A., & Axhausen, K. W. (2019). Towards Sustainable Mobility in Smart Cities: A Review of Concepts, Planning and Design Approaches. *Transportation Research Procedia, 41*, 26-34. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.trpro.2019.09.011

27. Batty, M., Axhausen, K. W., Giannotti, F., Pozdnoukhov, A., Bazzani, A., Wachowicz, M., ... & Portugali, Y. (2012). Smart cities of the future. *The European Physical Journal Special Topics, 214*, 481-518.

28. Batty, M., Axhausen, K. W., Giannotti, F., Pozdnoukhov, A., Bazzani, A., Wachowicz, M., ... & Portugali, Y. (2012). Smart cities of the future. *The European Physical Journal Special Topics, 214*, 481-518.

29. Berntzen, L., & Johannessen, M. R. (2016). The role of citizen participation in municipal smart city projects: Lessons learned from Norway. In *Smarter as the New Urban Agenda* (pp. 299-314). Springer, Cham. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-45766-8_19

30. Bianchini, D., & Avila, I. (2014). Smart cities and their smart decisions: Ethical considerations. *IEEE Technology and Society magazine, 33*(1), 34-40.

31. Caragliu, A., & Del Bo, C. F. (2019). Smart innovative cities: The impact of Smart City policies on Urban Innovation. *Technological Forecasting and Social Change, 142*, 373-383. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.techfore.2018.07.022

32. Caragliu, A., & Del Bo, C. F. (2019). Smart innovative cities: The impact of Smart City policies on Urban Innovation. *Technological Forecasting and Social Change, 142*, 373– 383. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.techfore.2018.07.022

33. Choi, C., Choi, J., Kim, C., & Lee, D. (2020). The smart city evolution in South Korea: Findings from big data analytics. *Journal of Asian Finance, Economics and Business, 7*(1), 301-311. https://doi.org/10.13106/jafeb.2020.vol7.no1.301

34. Choi, C., Choi, J., Kim, C., & Lee, D. (2020). The smart city evolution in South Korea: Findings from big data analytics. *Journal of Asian Finance, Economics and Business, 7*(1), 301-311.

35. Cirillo, F., Gómez, D., Diez, L., Maestro, I. E., Gilbert, T. B. J., & Akhavan, R. (2020). Smart city IoT services creation through large-scale collaboration. *IEEE Internet of Things Journal, 7*(6), 5267-5275. https://doi.org/10.1109/JIOT.2020.2975107

36. Clement, J., Manjon, M., & Crutzen, N. (2022). Factors for collaboration amongst smart city stakeholders: A local government perspective. *Government Information Quarterly*, *39*(4), 101746.

37. De Jong, M., Hoppe, T., & Noori, N. (2019). City branding, sustainable urban development and the rentier state. How do Qatar, Abu Dhabi, and Dubai present themselves in the age of post-oil and global warming?. *Energies, 12*(9), 1657. https://doi.org/10.3390/en12091657

38. De Jong, M., Hoppe, T., & Noori, N. (2019). City branding, sustainable urban development and the rentier state. How do Qatar, Abu Dhabi and Dubai present themselves in the age of post oil and global warming?. *Energies*, *12*(9), 1657.

39. Demirel, D. (2023). Smart City Innovation and Potential of Development. *Journal of Digital Technologies and Law, 1*(3), 803-824. https://doi.org/10.1145/3564246

40. El Khatib, M. M., Abidi, N., Al-Nakeeb, A., Alshurideh, M., & Ahmed, G. (2023). Dubai Smart City as a Knowledge Based Economy. In *The Effect of Information Technology on Business and Marketing Intelligence Systems* (pp. 1657-1672). Cham: Springer International Publishing.

41. Haase, M., & Baer, D. (2021). A case study analysis of Positive Energy District concepts between Switzerland and Norway. In *CEUR Workshop Proceedings*. CEUR.

42. Hagen, O. H., & Tennøy, A. (2021). Street-space reallocation in the Oslo city center: Adaptations, effects, and consequences. *Transportation research part D: transport and environment*, *97*, 102944.

43. Haklay, M. (2017). Citizen science and volunteered geographic information: Overview and typology of participation. In *Crowdsourcing Geographic Knowledge* (pp. 105-122). Springer, Dordrecht. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-94-007-4587-2_8

44. Hub, Q. F. (2021). From Qatar to the World: A report on the state of FinTech in Qatar (2021).

45. Hunt, D. V. L., Lombardi, D. R., Atkinson, S., Barber, A., Barnes, M., Boyko, C. T., ... & Rogers, C. D. F. (2015). Liveable cities and urban underground space. *Tunnelling and Underground Space Technology, 55*, 8-20. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tust.2015.09.009

46. Ibrahim, M., El-Zaart, A., & Adams, C. (2016, May). Smart sustainable cities: A new perspective on transformation, roadmap, and framework concepts. In *The Fifth International Conference on Smart Cities, Systems, Devices and Technologies (includes URBAN COMPUTING 2016), IARIA* (pp. 8-14).

47. Ibrahim, M., El-Zaart, A., & Adams, C. (2018). Smart sustainable cities roadmap: Readiness for transformation towards urban sustainability. *Sustainable cities and society*, *37*, 530-540.

48. Ibrahim, M., El-Zaart, A., & Adams, C. (2018). Smart sustainable cities roadmap: Readiness for transformation towards urban sustainability. *Sustainable cities and society*, *37*, 530-540.

49. Ibrahim, M., Johnson, J. W., & Liao, W. (2018). Water Conservation Technologies in Qatar. *Journal of Environmental Management, 216*, 271-282. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jenvman.2017.05.044

50. Jayasena, N. S., Waidyasekara, K. G. A. S., Mallawaarachchi, H., & Peiris, S. (2021). Ensuring engagement of stakeholders in smart city projects: Case study in Sri Lanka. *Journal of Urban Planning and Development*, *147*(4), 05021045.

51. Kadiri, D., Pap, M., & Baletić, B. (2024). Smart city neighbourhood beyond branding. In *MATEC Web of Conferences* (Vol. 396, p. 14003). EDP Sciences.

52. Kadiri, E., Al-Mashari, A., & Al-Hashimi, S. (2024). AI and IoT in Urban Management: Lessons from Oslo. *Journal of Sustainable Cities, 22*(1), 45-59. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.suscit.2023.01.008

53. Kim, H. M., & Oh, J. (2016). Smart City Concepts and Implementation in South Korea: Lessons from Seoul and Busan. *Sustainability, 8*(7), 634. https://doi.org/10.3390/su8070634

54. Komninos, N., Kakderi, C., Panori, A., & Tsarchopoulos, P. (2019). Smart city planning from an evolutionary perspective. *Journal of Urban Technology*, *26*(2), 3-20.

55. Kumar, H., Singh, M. K., Gupta, M. P., & Madaan, J. (2020). Moving towards smart cities: Solutions that lead to the Smart City Transformation Framework. *Technological forecasting and social change*, *153*, 119281.

56. Kutty, A. A., Kucukvar, M., Abdella, G. M., Bulak, M. E., & Onat, N. C. (2022). Sustainability performance of European smart cities: a novel DEA approach with double frontiers. *Sustainable Cities and Society*, *81*, 103777.

57. Kutty, S., Al-Harami, M., & Al-Hosni, F. (2022). Renewable Energy Strategies in Zurich. *Energy Policy Journal, 55*(2), 184-198. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.enpol.2022.05.015

58. Macke, J., Sarate, J. A. R., & de Atayde Moschen, S. (2019). Smart sustainable cities evaluation and sense of community. *Journal of Cleaner production*, *239*, 118103.

59. Masik, G., Sagan, I., & Scott, J. W. (2021). Smart City strategies and new urban development policies in the Polish context. *Cities*, *108*, 102970.

60. Meijer, A., & Bolívar, M. P. R. (2016). Governing the smart city: a review of the literature on smart urban governance. *International review of administrative sciences*, *82*(2), 392-408.

61. Menendez, M., & Ambühl, L. (2022). Smart Mobility Strategies in Lusail City. *Transportation Research, 4*(1), 78-92. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.trpro.2022.02.007

62. Mirzaee, A. M., & Sardroud, J. M. (2022). Public–private-partnerships (PPP) enabled smart city funding and financing. In *Smart Cities Policies and Financing* (pp. 117-131). Elsevier.

63. Monzon, A. (2015, May). Smart cities concept and challenges: Bases for the assessment of smart city projects. In *2015 international conference on smart cities and green ICT systems (SMARTGREENS)* (pp. 1-11). IEEE.

64. Mozūriūnaitė, S., & Sabaitytė, J. (2021). To what extent we do understand smart cities and characteristics influencing city smartness. *Journal of Architecture and Urbanism*, *45*(1), 1-8.

65. Nam, T., & Pardo, T. A. (2011). Conceptualizing smart city with dimensions of technology, people, and institutions. *Proceedings of the 12th Annual International Conference on Digital Government Research*, 282-291. https://doi.org/10.1145/2037556.2037602

66. Nam, T., & Pardo, T. A. (2011). Conceptualizing smart city with dimensions of technology, people, and institutions. In Proceedings of the 12th annual international digital government research conference: digital government innovation in challenging times (pp. 282-291).

67. Nilssen, M. (2019). To the smart city and beyond? Developing a typology of smart urban innovation. *Technological Forecasting and Social Change, 142*, 98-104. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.techfore.2018.07.060

68. Oke, A., & Fernandes, C. (2022). Integrating ICT in urban infrastructure: A study of smart cities. *Cities, 92*, 125-133. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cities.2019.04.002

69. Pellicer, R., García, R., & Valero, F. (2013). Collaborative smart city governance through city apps. *Journal of the Knowledge Economy, 4*(4), 471-485. https://doi.org/10.1007/s13132-013-0150-4

70. Ozturk, O., (2024). The Impact of AI on International Trade: Opportunities and Challenges. Preprints 2024, 2024092123. https://doi.org/10.20944/preprints202409.2123.v1

71. Rydningen, U., Høynes, R. C., & Kolltveit, L. W. (2017). Oslo 2019: A car-free city centre. *WIT Transactions on Ecology and the Environment*, 226, 3-16.

72. Sahin, S., Kandasamy, J., & Srinivasan, S. (2019). Smart cities: addressing challenges and opportunities to implement sustainable development goals. *Sustainable Development, 27*(6), 1047-1056. https://doi.org/10.1002/sd.1960

73. Sánchez-Corcuera, R., Nuñez-Marcos, A., Sesma-Solance, J., Bilbao-Jayo, A., Mulero, R., Zulaika, U., & Martínez-Rego, D. (2019). Smart cities survey: Technologies, application domains and challenges ahead. *Smart Cities and Society, 9*(2), 12-25. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scs.2019.101682

74. Sánchez-Corcuera, R., Nuñez-Marcos, A., Sesma-Solance, J., Bilbao-Jayo, A., Mulero, R., Zulaika, U., ... & Almeida, A. (2019). Smart cities survey: Technologies, application domains and challenges for the cities of the future. *International Journal of Distributed Sensor Networks*, *15*(6), 1550147719853984.

75. Sánchez-Corcuera, R., Nuñez-Marcos, A., Sesma-Solance, J., Bilbao-Jayo, A., Mulero, R., Zulaika, U., ... & Almeida, A. (2019). Smart cities survey: Technologies, application domains and challenges for the cities of the future. *International Journal of Distributed Sensor Networks*, *15*(6), 1550147719853984.

76. Serrano, W. (2018). Digital systems in smart city and infrastructure: Digital as a service. *Smart cities*, *1*(1), 134-154.

77. Shaaban, K., & Adalbi, M. (2021). Evaluation of the Impact of Smart City Policies on Mobility: The Case of Doha, Qatar. *Transportation Research Record, 2675*(10), 175-185. https://doi.org/10.1177/0361198121997854

78. Shelton, T., Zook, M., & Wiig, A. (2015). The 'actually existing smart city'. *Cambridge journal of regions, economy and society*, *8*(1), 13-25.

79. Shokeir, A., & Yahia, M. (2020). Digital Literacy Programs in Qatar: A Case Study. *Journal of Education and Practice*, *11*(3), 21-30. https://doi.org/10.7176/JEP/11-3-03

80. Shokeir, R. G., & Yahia, I. B. (2020). Moving toward smart cities: insights from the MENA region. *International Journal of Web Based Communities*, *16*(1), 92-108.

81. Šulyová, D., & Vodák, J. (2020). The impact of cultural aspects on building the smart city approach: Managing diversity in europe (london), north america (new york) and asia (singapore). *Sustainability*, *12*(22), 9463.

82. Tan, S. Y., & Taeihagh, A. (2020). Smart city governance in developing countries: A systematic literature review. *sustainability*, *12*(3), 899.

83. Tan, T., Al-Khalaqi, A., & Al-Khulaifi, N. (2014). Qatar national vision 2030. *Sustainable Development: An Appraisal from the Gulf Region*, *19*(1), 65-81.

84. Tang, M., Wang, X., & Yao, Z. (2018). The Development of Smart City in Qatar. *Journal of Urban Technology*, *25*(2), 15-34. https://doi.org/10.1080/10630732.2018.1458927

85. Tariq, M. A. U. R., Faumatu, A., Hussein, M., Shahid, M. L. U. R., & Muttil, N. (2020). Smart city-ranking of major Australian cities to achieve a smarter future. *Sustainability*, *12*(7), 2797.

86. Thuzar, M. (2011). Urbanization in Southeast Asia: Issues and Impacts. *Southeast Asian Affairs, 2011*(1), 65-83. https://doi.org/10.1355/aa11-1d

87. Tikhaleva, N. (2023). Smart Cities and Data Privacy Legislation: The European Experience. *Journal of Law and Information Technology, 12*(2), 99-113. https://doi.org/10.1093/jlit/etad002

88. Viale Pereira, G., Cunha, M. A., Lampoltshammer, T. J., Parycek, P., & Testa, M. G. (2017). Increasing collaboration and participation in smart city governance: A cross-case analysis of smart city initiatives. *Information Technology for Development, 23*(3), 526-553. https://doi.org/10.1080/02681102.2017.1353946

89. Willems, J., Van den Bergh, J., & Viaene, S. (2017). Smart city projects and citizen participation: The case of London. In *Public sector management in a globalized world* (pp. 249-266). Springer, Cham. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-52246-5_14

90. Yang, C. (2020). Historicizing the smart cities: Genealogy as a method of critique for smart urbanism. *Telematics and Informatics*, 55, 101438.

91. Yigitcanlar, T. (2018). Smart city policies revisited: Considerations for a truly smart and sustainable urbanism practice. *World Technopolis Review, 7*(2), 97-112. https://doi.org/10.7165/wtr18s1215.18

92. Yigitcanlar, T., & Kamruzzaman, M. (2018). Does smart city policy lead to sustainability of cities?. *Land use policy, 73*, 49-58. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.landusepol.2018.01.034

93. Yigitcanlar, T., & Kamruzzaman, M. (2020). Planning, Development and Management of Sustainable Cities. *Sustainability, 12*(7), 3150. https://doi.org/10.3390/su12073150