



2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

Traceability of Sustainable and Safe Fisheries Supply Chain Management Systems using Radio Frequency Identification Technology

Labonnah Farzana Rahman ^{1,*}, Lubna Alam ^{1,*}, Mohammad Marufuzzaman ² and Ussif Rashid Sumaila ^{1,3}

- ¹ Institute for Environment and Development, Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia, Bangi, 43600, Selangor, Malaysia
- ² Institute of Energy Infrastructure, Universiti Tenaga Nasional, 43000, Kajang, Selangor, Malaysia; marufsust@gmail.com
- ³ Institute for the Oceans and Fisheries, Faculty of Science, The University of British Columbia, Vancouver, BC V6T 1Z4, Canada; r.sumaila@oceans.ubc.ca (U.R.S.)
- * Correspondence: labonnah.deep@gmail.com (L. F. R.); lubna@ukm.edu.my (L.A.)

Abstract: At present, sustainability and emerging technology are the most expressed issues in any 13 supply chain management (SCM) sector. At the same time, pandemic makes consumers more con-14 cerned regarding health, and safe food with a sustainable way to access the current market. Thus, 15 supervision and monitoring of product quality with symmetric traceability information in fresh 16 food and fisheries SCM is significant. Research on food safety and traceability systems based on 17 blockchain, internet of service (IoT), wireless sensor networks (WSN), and radio frequency identifi-18 cation (RFID) provides the solution of constancy from production to consumption. This review fo-19 cused on the RFID-based traceability systems in fisheries SCM, which have been employed globally 20 in the last fifteen years to ensure fish quality and security. Additionally, a summarized comparison 21 study has presented different sectors' traceability systems using RFID and their advantages over 22 real-time applications. The outcome of this study will help future researchers to solve the crisis in 23 terms of trust between consumers and the fisheries SCM. Thus, this review would be a guideline 24 and solution for enhancing the reliability of RFID-based traceability in food SCM systems to ensure 25 the integrity and reducing the opacity and asymmetry in the product information. 26

Keywords: food safety; sustainability; RFID; technology; fisheries; consumption; traceability

27 28

29

1. Introduction

In this pandemic era, traceability is a vital safety tool for food supply chain manage-30 ment (SCM) systems, especially for fresh food and live products. To maintain a healthy 31 lifestyle, preferences of quality and secure food are highly demanding as a dietary habit. 32 Therefore, the increasing public awareness about product safety and quality leads con-33 sumers concerned about traceable products and foods [1]. Due to the pandemic, aquacul-34 ture and capture fisheries have exaggerated a lot. At present, the movement has a signif-35 icant restriction in many countries of the world as zoonotic disease SARS-CoV-2 (Covid-36 19) is highly contagious [2]. Moreover, in this Covid-19 era, people are paying more at-37 tention to high-quality, secure, and traceable fresh foods, seafood, medicines, etc [3]. 38 However, product information asymmetry, food contamination triggering the outbreak 39 of a crisis in market assurance, disrupted fish production, and logistic chain industries are 40 facing significant losses and the pattern of the client's awareness of safe fish/seafood con-41 sumption has also changed [2]. Thus, supervision and monitoring product safety with 42 quality imposes traceability features from production to distribution. Many countries de-43 veloped and depended on online systems to trace and assess the quality of fresh food in 44

Citation: Rahman, L.F.; Alam, L.; Marufuzzaman, M.; Sumaila, U.R. Traceability of Sustainable and Safe Fisheries Supply Chain Management Systems using Radio Frequency Identification Technology. *Foods* **2021**, *10*, x.

https://doi.org/10.3390/xxxxx

Publisher's Note: MDPI stays neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.



Copyright: © 2021 by the authors. Submitted for possible open access publication under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/). their SCM system to reduce product asymmetry and moral hazards and achieve incessant 45 food value enhancement [3-4].

With the rapid growth of technologies and wireless communications such as block-47 chain, internet of service (IoT), wireless sensor networks (WSN), and radio frequency 48 identification (RFID) to trace and assess the safety measures of fresh food or processed 49 food in their SCM process. RFID is a widely used technology worldwide due to its mobil-50 ity, inventory accuracy, increased security and traceability, real-time information through 51 unique electronic product code (EPC), which is easily accessed online by the customer 52 through a reader [5-7]. Besides, RFID-based traceability in SCM increases asset visibility, 53 expands employee productivity, and mitigates risk, theft, or loss of products. Conse-54 quently, developing a traceability solution with an RFID system would be the priority for 55 the retailers and consumers in the SCM system instead of fresh food tracking, fishing in-56 dustries, and the aquaculture sector [6], [8-9]. At present, the manufacturing/production 57 process involves RFID technology due to its effectiveness and profitability in economic 58 sectors. Additionally, its public acceptability to get all the track records/footprints about 59 obtained foodstuffs and participate in the communication between technology and the 60 entire SCM process [10-13]. As Covid-19 imposes social distancing, so instead of involving 61 large numbers of field workers and administrative staff, the implementation of RFID-62 based SCM and distribution networks have been much studied as a pilot project or in real 63 life for agri-food business, the fisheries sector, warehouse management, hospital manage-64 ment, and SCM [14-17]. However, researchers conducted many kinds of research on im-65 plementing RFID technology in the supply chain, including fresh food SCM, order man-66 agement, inventory system, and aquaculture sector [18-19]. 67

The fishery supply chain is long and sinuous so the combinations of upstream and 68 **in vnstream components are difficult to manage and trace.** It is mainly because the fish 69 industry includes different production and distribution chains, making the tracing of the 70 information very difficult. Therefore, food traceability becomes demanding worldwide in 71 the food SCM system to cut the perceived food risks and raise the consumer's trust. It 72 brings up the concept from the farm to the table for the food sector and as well as for the 73 fish and fish products [20-24]. As a result, existing food safety needed global expansion of 74 new food regulations, so that these will come up with food safety and trade by ensuring 75 high levels of security [25]. An integrated traceability system for the fishery supply chain 76 delivers wide-ranging, constant monitoring of food safety and quality and traceability at 77 the national level however Romania failed to implement it. In terms of Sustainable De-78 velopment goals (D) s), potential technologies such as blockchain, RFID, and sensors are 79 encouraged to implement in the food supply chain to cut down contamination levels and 80 surplus food supplies to designated bodies. Moreover, these technologies are eventually 81 popular with consumers due to their visibility over the environment and supplies/prod-82 ucts [26-27]. An accurate achievement and implementation of a traceability system signif-83 icantly reduce the risk exposure of the economic agents from the food chain by helping 84 them to identify, isolate and correct any problem in an efficient and fast way. Thus, en-85 suring food safety and reducing the negative economic impact of such an incident [16], 86 [28-29]. Researchers discussed on RFID based traceability solution has come up with ad-87 vantages of persistent monitoring of supply chains, cost reduction, improve and safe pro-88 cessing record with better service [30]. Recent research identified that RFID-based tracea-89 bility had significant development in the food supply chain sector, agri-foods, fisheries 90 sectors, aquaculture, consumer products, and pharmaceutical [31]. Additionally, recent 91 regulations on fresh food should ensure a contamination-free, quality supply of seafood, 92 which can be traceable. Though this traceability solution is expensive, using this solution 93 will ensure sustainable, safe food supplies containing the whole track data [8], [32-33]. 94

This paper focused on traceability solutions based on RFID technology for the last 15 95 years of researches/case studies, which have been studied and implemented in many 96 countries for fresh live fish, aquaculture, frozen food cattle/beef, canned tuna processing 97 to distribution, waterless live fish transport tion, etc. After that, we have compared the 98

2 of 14

presence and absence of this technology in terms of its configuration. As a result, tracing 99 out safety measures is accessible and visible throughout processing, packaging, and seal-100 ing fresh seafood, significantly decreasing worries that foodstuffs might be polluted. 101 However, even the rise of Covid-19 created concerns among the government, consumers 102 about eating safe seafood or fresh food products. Thus, this review article will ensure a 103 safety traceability guideline for aquaculture producers, distributors, and consumers. Re-104 spectively, the whole seafood supply chain process will be automated and vigilant from 105 production to consumption. 106

2. RFID based Traceability Systems in Agri-food and Fisheries SCM

RFID technology has been widely used in agri-food and fisheries SCM to carry out 108 food safety and quality in the context of post-pa dimic conditions. Ensuring trustworthi-109 ness between the consumers and the existing market, traceability has become a hot re-110 rch topic in the field of fisheries SCM for people's health. This section discussed the 111 implemented RFID-based SCM traceability solutions in many countries to collect and 112 track the data history of the fresh fish, seafood, waterless live fish, cold chain, canned fish 113 products, agri-food, cattle/beef, farmed fish. 114

2.1. Sustainable Supply Chains with Blockchain, IoT, and RFID

Tsolakis et al. (2013) studied the blockchain, IoT, and RFID-based food supply chain 116 traceability, which promoted SDGs to align with the Thai fish industry. Researchers con-117 ducted several case studies to test the feasibility of implementing RFID tag-based tracea-118 bility for canned tuna from processing to marketing. The outcome of this research was to 119 contribute in the field of fish SCM systems about the ultimate impacts of the flexibility of 120 fisheries environments and how this sector could bring into line with SDG Goals 1. In 121 addition, a case study used tuna cans labeled with RFID tags and the overall scenario of 122 processing tuna from fillets to canned for production to set up the traceability purpose 123 [34]. 124

2.2. Fisheries Supply Chain Traceability

Coronado Mondragon (2020), proposed a two-layer conceptual approach for the fish-126 eries sector in 2020. This research utilizes a sensor layer based on WSN theory to model 127 the surroun 📅 g energy consumption of a sensor network. This phase collected data from 128 the sensors used for ocean monitoring purposes. The collected data were analyzed using 129 time series/scatter diagrams to get the output. As a result, this identified the trends and 130 patterns of snow crab catch settings. Finally, this approach presents future researchers 131 who can use this approach and develop it as a monitoring tool for fish section SCM with the 132 help of Internet of Things (IoT) solutions to monitor products and track, among others, 133 using RFID technology [35]. 134

2.3. An Intelligent Traceability System for Waterless Live Fish

Zhang et al. proposed an intelligent traceability platform in 2019, based on the regu-136 lation of HACCI at this method, wireless monitoring facilitian between the states with the 137 quality com rol n easily to enhance the quality of fish and safety transparency to carriage 138 waterless fish. Therefore, the QR code and the RFID tag's electronic product code (EPC) 139 were combined to enable traceability functions to users for any query regarding tracking. 140 As a result, a quick query regarding safe transportation was visible to the consumers por-141 trayed from aquaculture to markets. In this regard, sturgeon delivery trials were assessed 142 and studied [36]. 143

Foods 2021, 10, x. https://doi.org/10.3390/xxxxx

125

135

107

2.4. A Supply Chain Traceability System for Food Safety based on HACCP, Blockchain & Internet of Things

Tian builds an information platform for real-time food tracing and supply chain system, bastern Hazard Analysis and Critical Control Points (HACCP) blockchain, and the Internet of this This method intends to provide a single platform h openness, transparency, neutrality, reliability, and security to all the supply chain members. The idea behind this method was based on the concept of big chain DB to fill the gap in the reorganized systems at scale [37].

2.5. Developing a Traceability System for Tuna Supply Chains

Kresna et al., developed an Internet Technology (IT) based tuna traceability system 153 for Indonesia as this country is one of the leading tuna exporters with a complex supply 154 chain network. Due to its characteristics and tendency of high contamination, a traceabil-155 ity system was mandatory which could ensure the standard strand y and quality tuna sup-156 ply chain. By implementing this traceability system which ensures safe handling, manu-157 facturing, packaging, and transporting the product as tuna is sensitive to temperature, the 158content of histamine, quantity of TPC, and contents of bacterial pathogens like Salmonella, 159 and the sanitation for workers, 👼 ipment, and processing room. This reserve proto-160 typed a tracing system, which illustrated the practical proficiencies for backward and for-161 ward tracing required for the tuna supply chain from fishing vessels to retailers. Addi-162 tionally, the system was eligible to permit the biological examination aspects through the 163 monitoring methods of the products [38]. 164

2.6. ePedigree Traceability System for the Agricultural Food Supply Chain

In 2016, Farooq et al. prop d a novel traceability system for the agricultural food 166 supply chain. This research proposed an electronic pedigree (ePedigree) tracking system 167 which employed RFID and sensors to monitor real-time agricultural food, which eventu-168 ally prevented the hazardous and contaminated supply of food products. In this research, 169 a traceability system named" ePedigree (electronic pedigree)" was developed including 170 RFID and sensor technology, which collects information from agricultural foods in real-171 time to distribute hazard-free and safe food products. Also, several design/execution fea-172 tures about this proposed system and a feasible consistent solution based on the perfor-173 mance analysis of this research proposed. Nevertheless, the research presents the system's 174 impact on consumer health and safety [39]. Figure 1 shows the overall flow of ePedigree 175 data traceability. 176

152

165

144



Figure 1. The overall flow of ePedigree data traceability using RFID [39].

2.7. Modeling and Implementation of Cattle/Beef Supply Chain Traceability

In 2015, Liang et al. proposed a cattle/beef supply chain traceability model based on 180 RFID technology along with the EPC global network. The research defines all the trans-181 formations of traceability units and the cattle/beef supply chain. After that, the research 182 describes internal acquisition, transformation, and transmission of information. Finally, 183 the authors explained a model for traceability information, collected using the electronic 184 product code information service (EPCIS) framework. In addition, both the software pack-185 ages Fosstrak and FreePastry used for cattle/beef traceability was implemented based on 186 EPC data. As a result, a case study for real-life implementation including from breeding 187 business, slaughter, process, distribution to sales outlet to evaluate the supply chain for 188 cattle/beef [40]. Figure 2 shows the architectural model of the cattle/beef traceability 189 model. 190

177

178



Figure 2. Cattle/beef traceability system architectural model [40]. = 2.8. Advanced Traceability System in Aquaculture Supply Chain

Parreño-Marchante et al., in 2014, presents a web-based traceability system that cap-194 tures data utilizing the RFID systems. The system integrates environmental data that were 195 collected through wireless sensor networks (WSN) into that web-based service. Two pilot 196 companies conducted this research with different sizes in the aquaculture sector. The aim 197 was to showcase how the overall business process in the aquaculture sector was benefitted 198 and improved by this solution. The results found that, implementing the traceability so-199 lution those companies achieved higher efficiency up to 89-95%, along with activity time 200 reduction. Therefore, KPIs are presented as the time reduction of activities and can im-201 prove the efficiency companies by 89–95%. However, the acceptance of electronic 202 traceability systems was not as fast as expected for the food supply chain [41]. 203

2.9. Agrifood Supply Chain Traceability using RFID Technology

In 2013, Costa et al. came up with a survey on agri-food supply chain traceability 205 solutions using RFID technology, which provided an extensive overview of the merits and 206 demerits of broad adoption of RFID. This survey aimed to provide an updated analysis 207 on the development of RFID-based technologies, which were designed mainly for agri-208 food industries. The results of these surveys came up with the information that, implan-209 tation of RFID technology in the agri-food sector is growing faster with applicability and 210 opportunities. However, various technical and economic bindings limit real applications 211 of implementing RFID [42]. 212

2.10. Temperature Alerts in Cod Supply Chains Technology

Hammervoll et al, (2021) examined different schemes and selection criteria to create 214 an alert as a decision support medium for fresh food supply chains. Therefore, a cod sup-215 ply chain was chosen in this research for real-time implementation, where logistic and 216 temperature mapping were measured to collect data to establish temperature alerts. So, 217 temperature data for the environment and the expanded polystyrene boxes contains the 218 packed products were collected. In this scheme, single criteria for ambient temperature 219 resulted in a false alarm compared with the measures of product temperature. Therefore, 220 WSN employed in an authentic supply chain of chilled cod was monitored to get the real 221 scenario and reduce quality losses and minimize waste [43]. 222

2.11. Towards RFID Traceability Systems of Farmed Fish Supply Chain

This research highlights two different examples of farmed fish tracking systems suitable of small and medium-sized enterprises (SMEs). The first one involved changing a 225

6 of 14

191

192

193

204

213

244

259

271

manual data collection method to an electronic RFID-enabled scheme implemented in a 226 small company. This project performed a complete SCM solution for farm fish to selling 227 agencies and private customers. On the other hand, the second example handled a part of 228 the automated process of packing fish labeled with a barcode upgraded by RFID technol-229 ogy. In this case, the aim was to extend the traceability to breeding and on-growing fish 230 farms from a manual data collection process to RFID enabled solution data collection 231 method. The pilot implementation identified as modules that used few mobile RFID read-232 ers were fixed and selected in different steps in this proposed design. These modules in-233 tend to use a general approach for an automated business procedure [44]. 234

2.12. RFID Based Traceability for Seafood Supply Chain

Mai et al. were investigated the cost-benefit analysis on the fish supply chain in 2010 236 using RFID-ba raceability solution. They aimed to conduct a case study for two $\overline{\mathcal{T}}^{1}$ rms 237 dealing wit equiferent operating steps of the seafood supply chain. In this research, the 238 aim was also to obtain preliminary knowledge regarding the cost/benefits distribution of 239 the project actors. This research provided the tangible, quantifiable benefits of implement-240 ing RFID traceabi we solutions to seafood trading companies. Also, this research suggests 241 the RFID tracking implementation cost beard by the firms and the behavior of using this 242 RFID based solution for using as a future marketing tool with food safety regulations [45]. 243

2.13. RFID Traceability for Fresh Fish Logistic Chain

This research developed a real-time RFID smart tag for tracing and monitoring cold 245 chai do applications. A smart tag and a reader/writer were involved in this method, 246 where the smart tag was attached to the products. These tags consisted of integrated 247 lights, sensors (temperature and humidity), a memory to store product data, and an an-248 tenna for RFID tag communications. The memory chip stored the traceability data col-249 lected using the sensors. Following this, the research utilizes a wireless reader to read the 250 collected data of the food chain from a 10 cm distance with a mobility option. This method 251 was able to read product data and track records automatically online and monitor tem-252 perature conditions of the cold chain. Besides, there is no issue of opening the polystyrene 253 boxes containing the fish and the smart tag in this system so that many tags read simulta-254 neously when they pass through a fully automated reader. Also, the system monitors, 255 using temperature sensors resisted temperature to go down below 0°C for frozen foods to 256 maintain a steady temperature condition. Additionally, humidity sensors made the sys-257 tem sensitive to changes in the storage surroundings [46]. 258

2.14. An RFID-Enabled Traceability System for the Supply Chain of Live Fish

Hsu et al. proposed an RFID-enabled SCM tracking system for live fish. In this re-260 search, the necessing information was collected for live fish processing and plans drawn 261 up for the overall management system architecture, targeting small and medium enter-262 prise solutions. In this method, the RFID tag is inserted into each live fish to monitor its 263 movement linked to living fish logistic centers, selling restaurants, and the consumers for 264 identification purposes. To collect all the agribusiness-related information and automated 265 transferring procedure sensors were required, controlled by the PLC. Finally, a web-based 266 solution was involved in this research, which stored all the transferred tracking infor-267 mation of farmers and consumers. In this method, the overall system was implemented 268 and arranged as a trial basis to collect all the valuable live fish information of logistic cen-269 ters [47]. 270

2.15. RFID-Enabled Traceability in the Food Supply Chain

Kelepouris et al. (2007) determined the fundamental requirements of a traceability 272 solution and the way of addressing the requirements of the RFID technology. They investigated the outline of an information data model of the system architecture, which 274

Foods 2021, 10, x. https://doi.org/10.3390/xxxxx

provided a feasible supply chain for easy implementation. This research demonstrated that the implementation cost of any traceability system mainly depends on the technological approaches involved. Additionally, this research provided insight into RFID-based traceability solutions for real-life practitioners to meet the requirements along with an appropriate, feasible solution [48].

3. Discussion

Currently, seafood consumers and importing countries have become more vigilant 281 n in previous times to assure food safety and disease-free seafood/fish supplies. Even 282 in this pandemic era, Covid-19 or other zoonotic diseases could readily spread if food 283 safety is not adequately maintained. In July 2020, demand for "Chilean salmon" jumped 284 to "practically zero" in China after tracing an outbreak due to Covid-19 to imported 285 salmon. Besides, experts believe that there is no evidence of the virus transmission 286 through food even though "Ecuadorian shrimp" was also linked to the outbreak [49-51]. 287 Nevertheless, food traders and buyers are still cautious about imported seafood products; 288 even at low prices, seafood/fish demand has reduced due to uncertain food safety. At pre-289 sent, the food supply has been disrupted due to the existence of agrochemicals and the 290 chance of reformation (the Genetically Modified Food). These might be linked with not 291 only for Covid-19 but a consecutive incident due to bird's flu, foot-and-mouth disease, 292 mad cow disease (the Bovine Spongiform Encephalopathy, BSE), and inferior food flood 293 [52-53]. Therefore, in 1997, Euro-Retailer Produce Working group of the EU retail trade 294 group was formed by the European trade groups, which formally created a system again 295 in 2000. The system was formed to work out with the food safety and disease-free agricul-296 tural products and provided a standard on "the good agriculture standard (Euro-Retailer 297 Produce Working group, EurepGAP) [54-55]. Also, United States adds and Japan has con-298 tinuously implemented food traceability solution for ensuring safe consumption. Besides, 299 Australia, India, and China, etc., are in the process of establishing "food security" stand-300 ards [56-57]. Therefore, it is essential to reinforce the safety measures for a risk-free food 301 supply and increase consumers' self-confidence. As a result, the European Union subsi-302 dized the EU project "RFID from Farm to Fork" (RFID-F2F) to establish the internet-based 303 practice of RFID traceability system in the food and drink supply chain [58]. Conse-304 quently, various pilot projects developed in several fisheries and cold chain analysis sec-305 tors based on temperature monitoring datasets using RFID to improve quality and safety 306 [59]. 307

Modern supply chains have evolved from trace and track to highly complex value 308 networks problem to allow connection between environment to machine, machine to ma-309 chine, and machine to human. Technology has become a vital source of competitive ad-310 vantages among suppliers, distributors, manufacturers, and retailers. However, it also 311 creates a challenging task to form a feasible and versatile SCM system. This system expects 312 to verify raw materials, store the product in a limited space in the inventory, maintain the 313 visibility of the product along the chain, and enhance the customer experience in the retail 314 shop. This research highlights numerous challenges encountered by recent literature. An 315 RFID-IoT system includes RFID and IoT technology that emphasizes the connection of all 316 components based on sensors, cheaper processors, and ubiquitous computing. The desire 317 is to improve the technology from the hardware aspect, increase its reliability and mini-318 mize the deficiencies during trace and track the product. Therefore, a summarized way of 319 comparing recent research based on their merits and target applications in fish industries 320 is discussed and shown in Table 1. 321

Technology	Application	Advantage	Reference
Blockchain, IoT, and RFID based traceability system	Fish industry	-The outcome of this research will help to implement a real-time process for traceability in blockchain empowered fish supply chains Provide a link between blockchain and traceability design for the fish supply chain	[34]
WSN and RFID based traceability system	Fisheries Sector	-Promoted the visibility of the supply chain without line-of-sight scanning process, which not only saves the excessive workforce cost but also maximizes the business opportunities	[35]
RFID based intelligent traceability system	Waterless fish or aqua- culture transportation	 -Reduced contamination level and risks by maintaining temperature level. -Provide a quality control solution with low implementation cost and high endurance outcome -Enhance effectiveness through proper technical references 	[36]
Blockchain & Internet of Things (IoT) traceability system	HACCP, Blockchain & Internet of Things (IoT)	-Provides a monopolistic, asymmetric, and opaque structure -Data can be protected from fraud, exploitation, alteration, falsifying, etc.	[37]
IT-based Traceability system	Tuna supply chain	-Permits the monitoring of methods and goods based on microbiological investigation and current SOPs are preserved	[38]
ePedigree traceability system	Agricultural Food Supply Chain	-Ensures social sustainability for customer health and safety	[39]
RFID along with the EPC global network traceability system	Cattle/beef supply chain	-Shares the effective solution and find out the gaps in busi- ness information's and traceability of the cattle/beef supply chain	[40]
RFID based traceability using WSN system	Aquaculture supply chain	 -Increase the consumer belief through the enhancements in product regulation, groups, supervision of time, and automated process. -An easy traceable solution of the farmed business supply chain by offering a supple, scalable, and interoperable structure 	[41]
RFID based traceability system	Agri-food sectors	-Organized literature delivers an effective outline and simplifies a quick content analysis for future researchers to identify the problems	[42]
WSN and RFID based traceability and temperature alert system	Cod supply chain	-Set up of temperature tracking offers a theoretical framework to implement in actual decision support systems	[43]
RFID enabled traceability system	Small and medium-sized enterprises (SMEs) and farm fish industries	-Proposed a flexible, scalable, and interoperable system for traceability -Easily transferrable to farmed fish-based business method	[44]
RFID traceability cost/benefit analysis	Seafood SCM system	-Provides a solution to retain existing customers, improves the product quality, and reduced consumer complaints	[45]
RFID traceability system	Fresh fish logistic chain Cold chain management	-RFID is a conventional traceability tool, which can be used in future business without engaging the human workforce.	[46]

 Table 1. Comparative summary of different traceability schemes in SCM systems.

		-Able to read many tags at the same time without tag	
		visibility	
		-More flexible technology in terms of humidity and	
		ecological conditions	
RFID-enabled	Live Fisheries	-To evaluate the benefits of utilizing RFID technology	[47]
traceability system	industries	-A valuable guideline for a traceability solution	[4/]
RFID-enabled	Food supply chain	-Suggested a precise high-tech method, by assessing the	[48]
traceability system		execution cost based on RFID system	

Table 1 compares the research outcomes of the last 15 years from 2007 to 2021 that 323 have been implemented globally. Though different sectors had chosen to implement trace-324 ability solutions using RFID technology in different countries, most pilot cases were ex-325 panded their pilot projects to real-time SCM systems. The summary table discusses that 326 the development of the RFID traceability systems is for several sectors of food SCM, in-327 cluding fresh fish, aquaculture, cattle/beef, waterless fish supply, cold chain, seafood sup-328 plies from packaging to consumptions. Nevertheless, few research results have been dis-329 cussed who deal with the RFID traceability solution in the fisheries industry, cold chain, 330 and fresh fish. These results found that RFID-based application in SCM system has bene-331 fitted in many ways such as conventional traceability tool, required no engagement of the 332 human workforce, can read many tags information at the same time, maintain visibilities, 333 maximize business opportunities [34-35, 46-47]. In addition, RFID possesses a flexible so-334 lution to trace temperature and humidity continuously throughout the SCM process, 335 which have been come up with the research projects mentioned for seafood, aquaculture, 336 cod, tune, and waterless fish SCM system [36, 38, 43, 45]. Moreover, RFID-based tracea-337 338 Standard Operating Procedures (SOPs). Nevertheless, traceability systems for cattle/beef 339 SCM, agri-food, farmed fish, etc. are also able to provide social sustainability for customer 340 health and safety [39-40, 42, 44, 46, 48]. In addition, utilizing RFID in SCM delivers a com-341 pelling solution and finds out the gaps in business pieces of information and trace data. 342 Besides, it would be an effective and simplified solution for quick content analysis to fu-343 ture fish consumers. Moreover, using RFID based traceability system for future SCM will 344 protect track data from fraud, exploitation, alteration, falsifying, etc. [37]. 345

At present, RFID is one of the wireless technologies widely used in many countries 346 for various reasons to track product information remotely with the help of IoT. It is pos-347 sible to trace and resist the temperature going down below 0°C for frozen fish logistic 348 chain monitoring. Moreover, maintaining specific humidity is necessary for fresh fish and 349 seafood during the storage process. The feature of sensing the humidity condition also 350 makes RFID more ubiquitous in the fisheries industry. The feature of having real-time 351 demonstration and validation makes it a real-time application in the fresh fish logistic 352 chain. Moreover, it easily tracks the automated system of tracking through RFID tag and 353 reader data and integrated into an online database with the actual condition. Besides, the 354 system reads fresh fish, seafood, frozen food, or even canned food and RFID tag data 355 without exposing any packaging boxes (polystyrene boxes). Additionally, it also reads 356 many RFID tag information simultaneously while automatically passing the reader. It is 357 possible to achieve real-time traceability information from production to consumption to 358 the different food/fish SCM systems. As a result, this maintains safety and quality along 359 with the fisheries logistic chain; this improves the SCM and strengthens the consumers' 360 confidence and belief regarding the fish/seafood logistic chain. 361

To increase the efficiency of resources and cost, there is a need to further analyze the collected data. Although several studies have proposed RFID data processing and sharing solutions in the supply chain, the cost of computing and efficiency of storage is always neglected [60]. Fortunately, with the emergence of cloud technology these days, the cloud provides an accessible platform of on-demand computing microservices especially on 366 data exchanging and integration with another system at a lower cost. Instead of develop-367 ing their system infrastructure from scratch, developers can deploy their applications by 368 "renting" the technology from a cloud service provider. As a result, this helps save the 369 cost of development from software, hardware, and human resources. Furthermore, the 370 developer can also save high maintenance fees as the cloud provider handles many ser-371 vices and can be customized based on the requirement. Additionally, a cloud service pro-372 vider such as Google Cloud Platform offers "pay-as-you-go" without any up-front and 373 termination fees [61]. This process has encouraged the fast development of Proof of Con-374 cept in many applications using minimal cost and resources [62]. 375

In the future, we look forward to more research into innovative SCM processes using 376 RFID tags and readers with higher sensitivity, feasibility, and adaptability. A large 377 amount of data transmission can cause system delay, communication error, and conflict 378 between the retailers and consumers. The challenge has become more complicated when 379 most of the data is collected in real-time by connected devices simultaneously. Once data 380 is collected, the process of analyzing the data, including data validation, cleaning, mining, 381 exploring, and loading requires highly skilled workers and powerful computing hard-382 ware such as the Computer Processing Unit (CPU) or Graphic Processing Unit (GPU). 383 Furthermore, the design of the hardware is favorable in miniature, low energy consump-384 tion, embedded, and easy to implement with other technologies. Besides that, the lack of 385 seamless integration between the current existing system and the newly developed open-386 source-based system would be one of the targeted issues. Many proposed systems are in 387 a position of large-scale supply chain production in the fisheries sector. However, the 388 maintenance of the system pipeline, network architecture, and data management is com-389 plex, and it causes the plausibility to redesign the whole architecture. At the same time, 390 with the increasing development of RFID devices, it remains a significant challenge to 391 develop a fisheries SCM system infrastructure that can manage massive data within the 392 same network. 393

4. Conclusions

In this review article, the traceability systems of sustainable and safe fisheries SCM 395 using RFID technology have been discussed. The last 15 years' research outcomes have 396 been discussed that have been implemented in many countries around the world based 397 on traceability using RFID technology. Due to the benefits of RFID technology, it has been 398 found that most pilot cases were expanded to real-time implementation in fisheries SCM. 399 However, fisheries or seafood traceability involving RFID technology has limited execu-400 tion compared to other food industries. The findings from the literature review show that 401 most of the systems aimed to implement a solution with sensing capability that allows 402 information transfer through RFID technology. The use of RFID technology in fisheries 403 SCM is required to regulate food safety and quality. However, the system's current exe-404 cution relies on multiple technologies, which causes an increase in the cost of developing 405 the system infrastructure. RFID-based fish or seafood traceability in SCM also will resolve 406 potential technological issues like customer requirements and fast changes in orders. In 407 addition, the cost of operation and adoption of new systems is increased owing to the 408 incompatibility and feasibility of such existing systems. A smooth and feasible project 409 workflow with many coordination efforts is needed to ensure the efficiency of the fisheries 410 SCM while maintaining the overall cost of RFID-based systems. This review explored the 411 rise of sustainable and safe fisheries traceability systems based on RFID technology and 412 consumer's acceptability in SCM. In this way, the fisheries SCM will be able to examine 413 the achievable profit, ensuring sustainable, safe supply, maintaining storage conditions, 414 temperature/humidity, and compare them against the cost of adoption to make a wiser 415 decision. 416

Supplementary Materials: NA

3.

	Author Contributions: Conceptualization, L.F.R.; methodology, L.F.R.; investigation, L.F.R.; writ- ing—original draft preparation, L.F.R.; writing—review and editing, L.F.R., M. M., U. R. S., and L. A.; supervision, L.A.; funding acquisition, L.A.	418 419 420
	Funding: This research was funded by the Ministry of Higher Education Malaysia and Universiti	421
	Kebangsaan Malaysia, grant number TRGS/1/2015/UKM/02/5/2.	422
	Data Availability Statement: NA	423
	Advante: The authors would like to express sincere gratitude to the Institute for Envi-	124
	ronment and Development (LESTARI) for conducting this research. The authors would like to thank the Ministry of Higher Education Malaysia and Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia (UKM) for sup- porting this research.	424 425 426 427
	Conflicts of Interest: The authors declare no conflict of interest.	428
Ref	ferences	429
1.	Cao, Y., Liu, X., Guan, C., Mao, B. Implementation and current status of food traceability system in Jiangsu China. Procedia	430
	computer science, 2017 , 122, 617-621.	431
2.	Jamwal, A., Phulia, V. Multisectoral one health approach to make aquaculture and fisheries resilient to a future pandemic-like	432
2	situation. <i>Fish and Fisheries</i> , 2021 , 22(2), 449-463.	433
3.	ysis. Food Policy, 2012 , 37(1),102-113.	434 435
4.	Zhang, S., Liao, J., Wu, S., Zhong, J., Xue, X. A Traceability Public Service Cloud Platform Incorporating IDcode System and	436
_	Colorful QR Code Technology for Important Product. <i>Mathematical Problems in Engineering</i> , 2021 , 2021, 15 pages.	437
5.	Iftekhar, A., Cui, X., Hassan, M., Afzal, W. Application of blockchain and Internet of Things to ensure tamper-proof data avail-	438
6	Rahman, L.F.: Marufuzzaman, M.: Alam, L.: Sidek, L.M.: Reaz, M.B.L.A. low power and low ripple CMOS high voltage generator	439
	for RFID transponder EEPROM. <i>PloS One</i> 2020 , <i>15</i> , e0225408.	441
7.	Rahman, L. F., Reaz, M. B. I., Ali, M. A. M., Marufuzzaman, M. Design and Implementation of a Low Supply Voltage Voltage	442
	Type Sense Amplifier with Spinelli Low Current Consumption for RFID Transponder. Automatika, 2013, 54(2), 210-216.	443
8.	Varriale, V., Cammarano, A., Michelino, F., & Caputo, M. Sustainable Supply Chains with Blockchain, IoT and RFID: A Simu-	444
0	lation on Order Management. <i>Sustainability</i> , 2021 , <i>13</i> (11), 6372.	445
9.	Mphande, 1. A secure patient monitoring and tracking system using KFID and internet of things for the university teaching hospital, Doctoral dissertation, University of Zambia, July 2020 .	446 447
10.	Gladysz, B., Ejsmont, K., Kluczek, A., Corti, D., Marciniak, S. A Method for an Integrated Sustainability Assessment of RFID	448
	Technology. <i>Resources</i> , 2020 , <i>9</i> (9), 107.	449
11.	Rahman, L. F., Marufuzzaman, M., Alam, L., Mokhtar, M. B. Design Topologies of a CMOS Charge Pump Circuit for Low Power Applications. <i>Electronics</i> , 2021a , <i>10(6)</i> , 676.	450 451
12.	Spinelli, F. R., Ceccarelli, F., Di Franco, M., Conti, F. To consider or not antimalarials as a prophylactic intervention in the SARS-	452
	CoV-2 (Covid-19) pandemic. Annals of the rheumatic diseases, 2020 , 79(5), 666-667.	453
13.	Zhao, J., Li, A., Jin, X., Pan, L. Technologies in individual animal identification and meat products traceability. <i>Biotechnology & Biotechnological Equipment</i> , 2020 , <i>34</i> (1), 48-57.	454 455
14.	Nicolae, C. G., Neculita, M., Cristea, D. S. Trends in the development of traceability systems for fish products. Calitatea, 2014,	456
	15(143), 95.	457
15.	Kelepouris, T., Pramatari, K., Doukidis, G. RFID-enabled traceability in the food supply chain. Industrial Management & data	458
16	systems, 2007, 107(2), 183-200. Wang X. Li D. Value added on food traceability: a supply chain management approach. In 2006 IEEE International Conference	459
10.	on Service Operations and Looistics, and Informatics, Shanghai, China, 21-23 June, 2006, pp. 493-498.	461
17.	Juskalian, R. The place where life hangs by a chain. <i>MIT Technology Review</i> , 2018 , 121(3), 42–51.	462
18.	Banks, J.; Pachano, M.; Thompson, L.; Hanny, D. RFID Applied, 1st ed.; John Wiley & Sons: Hoboken, NJ, USA, 2007.	463
19.	Rahman, L. F., Alam, L., Marufuzzaman, M. Design of a Low Power and High-Efficiency Charge Pump Circuit for RFID Tran-	464
	sponder EEPROM. Informacije MIDEM, 2021b, 50(4), 255-262.	465
20.	Ab Rashid, N., Bojei, J. The relationship between halal traceability system adoption and environmental factors on halal food	466
7 1	supply chain integrity in Malaysia. <i>Journal of Islamic Marketing</i> , 2019 , 11(1), 117-142.	467
∠1.	food supply chains based on social media: A focus group study in Spain Foods 2020 9(1) 22	408 469
22.	Wognum, P. N., Bremmers, H., Trienekens, J. H., Van Der Vorst, I. G., Bloemhof, I. M. Systems for sustainability and transpar-	470
	ency of food supply chains–Current status and challenges. Advanced Engineering Informatics, 2011 , 25(1), 65-76.	471
23.	Galvez, J. F., Mejuto, J. C., Simal-Gandara, J. Future challenges on the use of blockchain for food traceability analysis. TrAC	472
	Trends in Analytical Chemistry, 2018 , 107, 222-232.	473

- Alam, L., Mokhtar, M., Ta, G. C., Halim, S. A., Ahmed, M. F. Review on Regional Impact of Climate Change on Fisheries Sector. 474 Novelty J., 2017, 4(1), 1-5.
- Härtel, I., Yu, H. Food security and food safety law. In Handbook of Agri-Food Law in China, Germany, European Union, 2018 pp. 57-126, Springer, Cham.
 476
- 26. Ahmed, S., Broek, N. T. Blockchain could boost food security. Nature, 2017, 550(7674), 43.
- Afrianto, I. R. A. W. A. N., Djatna, T. A. U. F. I. K., Arkeman, Y. A. N. D. R. A., Hermadi, I. R. M. A. N., Sitanggang, I. S. Block Chain Technology Architecture for Supply Chain Traceability of Fisheries Products in Indonesia: Future Challenge. *Journal of Engineering Science and Technology Special Issue on INCITEST2020*, 2020, 41-49.
- 28. Nicolae, C. G., Moga, L. M., Bahaciu, G. V., Marin, M. P. Traceability system structure design for fish and fish products based on supply chain Actors needs. Scientific Papers: Series D, *Animal Science-The International Session of Scientific Communications of the Faculty of Animal Science*, **2017**, 60.
- Bevilacqua, M., Ciarapica, F. E., Giacchetta, G. Business process reengineering of a supply chain and a traceability system: A 485 case study. *Journal of Food Engineering*, 2009, 93(1), 13-22.
- 30. Berti, R.; Semprebon, M. Food traceability in China between law and technology. *Eur. Food Feed Law Rev.* 2018, 13, 522–531.
- 31. Hartley, G. L. The efficacy of using the EPCIS standard for livestock and meat traceability: thesis for Master of Logistics and Supply Chain Management at Massey University, Palmerston North, New Zealand, **2013**.
- 32. Wei, Z., Yuan, X., Jia, D., Wang, G. An aquatic product traceability system based on RFID technology. In 2010 IEEE International Conference on Software Engineering and Service Sciences, Beijing, China, 16-18 July, **2010**, pp. 154-157.
- 33. Lee, D.; Park, J. RFID-based traceability in the supply chain. Ind. Manag. Data Syst. 2008, 108, 713–725.
- Tsolakis, N., Niedenzu, D., Simonetto, M., Dora, M., Kumar, M. Supply network design to address United Nations Sustainable
 Development Goals: A case study of blockchain implementation in Thai fish industry. *Journal of Business Research*, 2021, 131, 494
 495-519.
- Coronado Mondragon, A. E., Coronado Mondragon, C. E., Coronado, E. S. Managing the food supply chain in the age of digitalisation: a conceptual approach in the fisheries sector. *Production Planning & Control*, 2021, 32(3), 242-255.
- Zhang, Y., Wang, W., Yan, L., Glamuzina, B., Zhang, X. Development and evaluation of an intelligent traceability system for waterless live fish transportation. *Food control*, **2019**, *95*,283-297.
- Tian, F. An information system for food safety monitoring in supply chains based on HACCP, blockchain and internet of things, Doctoral dissertation, WU Vienna University of Economics and Business, **2018**.
 501
- Kresna, B. A., Seminar, K. B., Marimin, M. Developing a Traceability System for Tuna Supply Chains. *International Journal of Supply Chain Management*, 2017, 6(3), 52-62.
- 39. Farooq, U., Tao, W., Alfian, G., Kang, Y. S., Rhee, J. ePedigree traceability system for the agricultural food supply chain to ensure consumer health. *Sustainability*, **2016**, *8*(9), 839.
- 40. Liang, W., Cao, J., Fan, Y., Zhu, K., Dai, Q. Modeling and implementation of cattle/beef supply chain traceability using a distributed RFID-based framework in China. *PloS one*, **2015**, *10*(*10*), e0139558.
- Parreño-Marchante, A., Alvarez-Melcon, A., Trebar, M., Filippin, P. Advanced traceability system in aquaculture supply chain. Journal of food engineering, 2014, 122, 99-109.
- 42. Costa, C., Antonucci, F., Pallottino, F., Aguzzi, J., Sarriá, D., Menesatti, P. A review on agri-food supply chain traceability by means of RFID technology. *Food and bioprocess technology*, **2013**, *6*(2), 353-366.
- 43. Hammervoll, T., Jensen, L. M., Hafliðason, T., Ólafsdóttir, G., Bogason, S., Stefánsson, G. Criteria for temperature alerts in cod supply chains. *International Journal of Physical Distribution & Logistics Management*, **2012**, 42(4), 355-371.
- Trebar, M., Grah, A., Melcon, A. A., Parreno, A. Towards RFID traceability systems of farmed fish supply chain. In SoftCOM 514 2011, 19th IEEE International Conference on Software, *Telecommunications and Computer Networks*, 2011, pp. 1-6. 515
- 45. Mai, N., Bogason, S. G., Arason, S., Árnason, S. V., Matthíasson, T. G. Benefits of traceability in fish supply chains–case studies. *British Food Journal*, **2010**, 112(9), 976-1002.
- 46. Abad, E., Palacio, F., Nuin, M., De Zarate, A. G., Juarros, A., Gómez, J. M., Marco, S. RFID smart tag for traceability and cold chain monitoring of foods: Demonstration in an intercontinental fresh fish logistic chain. *Journal of food engineering*, **2009**, *93*(4), 394-399.
- 47. Hsu, Y. C., Chen, A. P., Wang, C. H. A RFID-enabled traceability system for the supply chain of live fish. In 2008 IEEE International Conference on Automation and Logistics, Split, Croatia, 15-17 September, **2008**, pp. 81-86.
- 48. Kelepouris, T., Pramatari, K., & Doukidis, G. RFID-enabled traceability in the food supply chain. *Industrial Management & data systems*, **2007**, *107*(2),183-200.
- 49. Minahal, Q., Munir, S., Kumal, W., Fatima, S., Liaqat, R., Shehdzadi, I. Global impact of COVID-19 on aquaculture and fisheries: A review. *International Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Studies*, **2020**, *8*(6), 1-7.
- Boughton, D., Goeb, J., Lambrecht, I., Headey, D., Takeshima, H., Mahrt, K.,Diao, X. Impacts of COVID-19 on agricultural production and food systems in late transforming Southeast Asia: The case of Myanmar. *Agricultural Systems*, 2021, 188, 103026.
- 51. Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO), The impact of COVID-19 on fisheries and aquaculture food systems Possible responses, Information paper, November **2020.** 530
- Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO). Available Online: http://www.fao.org/in-action/globefish/news-events/trade-andmarket-news/may-2021/en/ (May, 2021).

479

480

481

482

483

484

487

488

489

490

491

492

504

505

506

507

510

511

512

513

516

517

518

519

520

521

522

523

524

525

- Valentin, S. Extraction and combination of epidemiological information from informal sources for animal infectious diseases surveillance, Doctoral dissertation, Université Montpellier, 24 September, 2020.
 534
- Dracea, R., Vladulescu, C. Comparative study of certification schemes for food safety management systems in the European Union context. *The Amfiteatru Economic Journal*, 2018, 20(47), 1-9.
- Pop, S. Z., Dracea, R., Vlădulescu, C. Comparative study of certification schemes for food safety management systems in the European Union context. *Amfiteatru Economic*, 2018, 20(47), 9-29.
 538
- Amekawa, Y. Reflections on the growing influence of good agricultural practices in the global south. *Journal of Agricultural and* 539 *Environmental Ethics*, 2009, 22(6),531.
- 57. FAO, F. The future of food and agriculture–Trends and challenges. Annual Report, 2017, 296.
- Cuiñas, I., Expósito, I., Gay-Fernández, J. A., Alejos, A. V., Sánchez, M. G. From Farm to Fork: Traceability based on RFID, In SIGMAP, 2012, pp. 265-270.
- Trebar, M., Lotrič, M., Fonda, I. Use of RFID temperature monitoring to test and improve fish packing methods in styrofoam
 boxes. *Journal of Food Engineering*, 2015, 159, 66-75.
- Dabbene, F., Gay, P., Tortia, C. Traceability issues in food supply chain management: A review. *Biosystems engineering*, 2014, 546 120, 65-80.
- Lim, M. K., Bahr, W., Leung, S. C. RFID in the warehouse: A literature analysis (1995–2010) of its applications, benefits, challenges and future trends. *International Journal of Production Economics*, 2013, 145(1), 409-430.
- Tan, W. C. Survey of RFID-IoT in Supply Chain Management. *Turkish Journal of Computer and Mathematics Education (TUR-COMAT)*, 2021, 12(3), 1754-1762.