

Appendix B. Summary table of results of selected cases and studies

Type of Methodology/ Case	Implementers	Reference	Participation time	Location	Case objective	Design/methodology	Population	Intervention	Control population	Employment results	Other results	Limitations of the case and studies	Observations	Funding	Number of People
<i>Experiences</i>															
<i>Alaska</i>	Alaska National Government via the Permanent Fund Corporation	Jones & Marirescu (2018) [46], Widerquist & Howard (2012) [49], Berman (2018) [50], Goldsmith (2010, 2012) [47][48], Bibler et al. (2019) [107], Feinberg y Kuhn (2018) [106]	From 1982 to today	Alaska, the whole state	Distribution of oil dividends	Traditional observation of results. Survey data and administrative records	All the population resident in Alaska for at least six months	An annual amount that depends on the national oil company profits, to each individual without conditions. The amount is about 2,000 USD. 4% of GDP. In 2020 payment is 992 USD	Other similar states [45]	Increase 17% working p/t (2 pp.); f/t remains the same (Jones & Marirescu). Goldsmith does not find reduction, he does find an increase in salary and employment, nor in early retirement. Berman looks at the effect on Alaska Natives and does not see significant effects either. Babler et al., 2019 found an increase in job demand, a probability of increase of the supply in men and a probability of decrease in women of 0.9 hours per week among young people with young children (decrease of 0.7% overall)	Improved physical and mental health, improvements in education, increase demand for local products and labour demand that increases wages. Reduction of inequality and poverty	Very small amount and dependent on corporation profits. Annual	Proposal to expand the experience with financing through taxes, most of the population agrees	Permanent Fund Dividend Alaska Permanent Fund Corporation	Approximately 600,000
<i>Iran</i>	Iranian government	Solehi-Isfahani & Mostafavi-Delozooei, 2018 [51]	2011-today?, although it has been deteriorating because of the political situation and today the amount is insignificant due to inflation and the non-updating of the amounts	The whole of Iran	Distribute and reorganize the subsidy system that previously existed in the country	Through the Household Income and Expenditure Survey (HIES), 2010 and 2015, the sample households were randomly divided into 12 groups of approximately the same size and were interviewed in different months of the year. Of the 152,291 people (38,285 households) in 2010, 104,703 or 68% of the sample (26,180 households) were randomly selected and designated as a panel to be re-interviewed in 2011, and the remainder were designated to rotate after one year	Iranian citizens	6.5% of GDP and 19% of household income	Not applicable	There are no negative effects on participation or hours worked in the general population. Employment in the lower income population (40% poorest) rises. Lower employment in young people between 20 and 29 years of age mainly to continue studying. Increase entrepreneurship. Women's participation in employment decreases (from 12.1% to 10.0%)	Positive effect on self-employed or self-employment	The goal was not to reduce poverty and inequality, but to reorganize the existing price subsidy system. The amount has fallen drastically (90%) due to inflation and the non-updating of the amounts (from USD 45 in 2011 to USD 5 in 2018). The political situation makes it only assessable with a guarantee for the first year. Although it is an individual payment, it is paid to the head of the family.	The program is financed primarily through the increase in prices of previously subsidised goods and services, mainly fuel	72.5 million (96% population of Iran)	
<i>Cherokee Nation</i>	Eastern Band of Cherokee Indians through Harrah's Cherokee Casino Resort	Akee et al., 2010 [53]; Castello et al., 2010 [108]; Marirescu, 2017 [109]	1997- today	Jackson, Swain and Hayward Counties, North Carolina	Distribute and reorganize the subsidy system that previously existed in the country	A study that was coincidentally being carried out with children and young people in the area was used	The entire population of the Cherokee community (minimum 1/16 Cherokee blood)	Equal amount paid to all members of the community. Estimated amount about USD 10,000 per year in two payments (25% of North Carolina GDP per capita)	Rural white families in the area	Researchers have not found a relevant impact on job offers	There was a drastic decrease in juvenile delinquency and an improvement in variables related to mental and emotional health	The study was not done expressly, but a study with different objectives was used	Start accumulating money from birth. Cannot access money (earned from 0-18) until 18 years of age. Funds accumulated during those years disbursed in three tranches less taxes (18 years, 21 years, and 25 years), on top of receiving bi-yearly payment. Per capita payments based on revenue from casinos	Harrahs Cherokee Casino Resort	15,000
<i>Field experiments</i>															
<i>Finland</i>	KELA	Kangas et al., 2019, 2020 [63] [64]	2017-2018 Period of evaluation of effects on employment: November 2017- October 2018	Finland	If the conditionality is removed, does labour activation increase? Then the study of other consequences of its implementation is introduced	RCT with control group. Registration data, survey and in-depth interviews.	2,000 unemployed people with benefits aged 25 to 58	€ 560 per month for two years without conditions or means test	All the population with these conditions in Finland	Increase of days of work activity than the control group: total: 6.63, households with children: 13.7, single unemployed: 9.5, households without children: 1.6, native: 3.6, immigrants: 13, rural: 7.8, Helsinki: 1.8. Attitude to employment improves	Improvement in health, self-confidence, in others and in institutions; increase in economic security and freedom of choice; reduction of the bureaucracy trap	Only applies to unemployed with benefits (not universal). In 2018, an activation model was introduced that makes it difficult to interpret the results	Shows that if you change from a conditional benefit to an unconditional one, it does not reduce the motivation to look for work, rather the contrary, apart from improving well-being	Kela, Finland social security institution	2,000
<i>Ontario (Canada)</i>	Government of Ontario, Ministry of Children, Community and Social Services	Ferdosi et al. (2020) [65]	April 2017 to March 2019 (planned until April 2020)	Hamilton, Brantford and Brant County	Experiment with the aim of replicating it in the whole country	Online surveys and in-depth interviews	4,000 people with low incomes aged 18 to 64	Negative income tax (NIT) for 3 years	Not applicable	Improved labour participation and economic activity. Moving from bad to better jobs	Improvements in physical and mental health, food security, housing stability, financial situation and relationships, reshaping their living standards, as well as their sense of self-esteem and hope for a better future	It was abruptly interrupted by the change of government in August 2018. Subsidiary evaluation in 2020 with survey of beneficiaries, without control group		Government of Ontario, Canada	4,000
<i>Kenya</i>	GiveDirectly Foundation	Innovations for Poverty Action; Abdul Latif Jameel Poverty Action Lab (MIT); https://www.givedirectly.org/ubi-study/	2018-2019; 2018-2030	Western and Rift Valley of Kenya	Is international aid more efficient if it is given directly to the poor as cash?	Combines RCT and saturation, with a control group. Follow-up surveys: first in 2019, then every 3 to 5 years. They analyse a large number of items: use of time, risk taking, economic status, gender, aspirations and life prospects	20,000 out of 197 villages, plus 100 from control.	Payment of 2.250 Kenyan shillings per month (0.75 USD per day) to the entire population of the selected village, for 2 years (80 villages), for 12 years (44 villages) or all at the beginning in two payments (71 villages) (50 USD in total). The control group (100 villages) receives nothing	100 villages	To be determined. Results of the first survey of 2019 not yet available	To be determined. Results of the first survey of 2019 not yet available	Long-term results will not be available until after 2030	The first results of the 2019 survey should be ready in mid-2020. We are still waiting for them	GiveDirectly Foundation	20,000
<i>India</i>	Self-Employed Women's Association (SEWA)	Davala et al (2015) [75], Standing (2015) [76], SEWA Bharat (2014), Davala et al. (2017) [111]	June 2011- November 2012	Madhya Pradesh	Determine the effects of UBI implementation in the short-term, long term and in a single payment	Analysis through RCT, with several rounds of surveys: an initial one (census), an intermediate one, another at the end and one 4 years after the end (2017)	All the residents of 9 random villages	Rs 200 per month is given to each adult, 100 to children the first year, 300 and 150 respectively the second year	12 villages	Increase productive work: 21% (9% in control), increase of economic activity: 19.4% (7.2% in control), increase of self-employment 40% to 62% (35% in control). Child labour reduced by 20% compared to 5% in the control population	Increase food sufficiency from 52% to 78% (59% to 57% in control); increase infant nutrition from 39% to 58% (48% to 58% in control); increase food consumption; improved health; debt reduction by 73%			UNICEF	Approximately 6,000 people plus others from the control group

<i>Namibia</i>	Committee formed by an alliance of churches, unions and civil society coordinated and promoted by the Evangelical Lutheran Church of Namibia	Haarmann et al. (2008, 2009) [77] [78]	January 2008 to December 2009	Otjivero-Omitara	The basic objective of this coalition was to convince the Namibian government that the introduction of a UBI throughout the country would reduce poverty and inequality, in addition to serving as an economic catalyst	100 Namibian dollars (7 USD) per month for all adults and children. Monthly monitoring on 398 individuals, 52 households	Everyone who resided in the location the previous year except those over 60 with a public pension	Cash payment to the entire population of Otjivero first and then also of Omitara: 100 Namibian dollars per month, for two years	Not applicable	Increase work activity and entrepreneurship	Decrease child malnutrition from 42% to 10%, decrease poverty, decrease petty crime, increase schooling by 92%, increase medical assistance	Possible impartiality problem as the analysts were the promoters of the experiment. The promoter of the initiative was invited to be part of the government and the project stalled	Evangelical Lutheran Church in the Republic of Namibia (ELCRN) and donations	1,000
Laboratory experiments														
		Haigner et al., 2012 [89]										There is no difference in choice between work/leisure with or without UBI	Decrease in inequality	
		Kawagoe, 2019 [90]										The introduction of a UBI increases work offer and incentives; and, furthermore, more than a NIT (experiment 1). Secondly, although the offer rises in all of them, it rises more in people with more competitive and individualistic characters (experiment 2); and, finally, it does not necessarily follow that there is a liberation effect for the subject groups, such as women, children or the disabled (experiment 3).		
Simulations														
<i>Australia</i>		Scutella (2004) [103] Creedy & Dawkins (2002) [115]										Participation and hours worked decrease when tax neutrality and very high income tax rates are imposed, and yet they rise with more moderate tax rates [103]. Labour supply increases due to those who received a benefit that rises despite the fact that those who have increased taxes (much less in net terms) could be discouraged from employment [115]		
<i>Germany</i>		Sommer 2016 [116], Gilroy et al. (2013) [117], Horststraer et al. 2010 [118], Colombo (2008) [119]										It shows that, despite the fact that for different groups the results are different in terms of the increase or reduction of the labour supply (different elasticity), the overall net effect is favourable [116]. The introduction of a UBI instead of the current conditional system in Germany would eliminate the unemployment trap and increase labour participation, in addition to the positive effects on well-being [117].		
<i>Italy</i>		Colombino & Nazaret, 2013 [121]; Colombino, 2015 [122]										The result is not significant (variation in annual average hours of work for both men (between -0.1% and -0.6%) and women (between -0.1% and -2.6%).		
<i>United Kingdom</i>		Martinelli, (2017 a y b) [123][124], Kallioma-Puha et al. (2016) [125]										Although the results in general may be ambiguous, they are favourable as a greater incentive to employment in the poorest population (1st and 2nd quintiles) [123] [124], especially those who are currently receiving some type of conditional aid due to the elimination of the effects of poverty, unemployment and bureaucratic traps, due to the uncertainty of getting back the lost benefit or undergoing an unaffordable delay [125]. Disincentives are also observed for women in a couple with part-time jobs		
<i>European Union</i>		Islam y Colombino (2018) [126], Colombino et al. (2010) [127]										The effects on employment are very low in all cases: it falls slightly in some and rises slightly in other mechanisms and for different countries		
<i>Ecuador</i>		Mideros, A., & O'Donoghue, C. (2015) [129]										Increases the work incentives for the primary income earners in couples and decreases for the secondary, usually women		