# Mind-Body (Baduanjin) Exercise Prescription for Chronic Obstructive

# Pulmonary Disease: A Systematic Review with Meta-Analysis

Shi-Jie Liu<sup>1</sup>, Lin Wang<sup>1</sup>, Ran Li<sup>2</sup>, Gao-Xia Wei<sup>3</sup>, Zhanbing Ren<sup>4</sup> Liye Zou<sup>5</sup>

- 1. Department of Physical Education, Wuhan University of Technology, Wuhan 430070, China
- 2. Scientific Exercise and Health Promotion Research Center, China Institute of Sport Science, Beijing, 100061, China
- 3. Key Laboratory of Behavioral Science, Institute of Psychology, Chinese Academy of Sciences, Beijing, China 100101
- 4. Department of Physical Education, Shenzhen University, Shenzhen 518060, China
- 5. Department of Sports Science and Physical Education, the Chinese University of Hong Kong, Shatin, Hong Kong, China

Correspondence: liyezou123@cuhk.edu.hk (L.Z)

Department of Sports Science and Physical Education, the Chinese University of Hong Kong, Shatin, Hong Kong, China

 $\odot$   $\odot$ 

#### Abstract

Baduanjin exercise is a traditional Chinese health-Qigong routine, created by an ancient physician for health promotion. Its mild-to-moderate exercise intensity is suitable for individuals with medical conditions. Recently, a large number of trials were conducted to investigate the effects of Baduanjin exercise in patients with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease (COPD). It needs to be determined whether Baduanjin exercise prescription is beneficial for the management of COPD patients. Thus, we conducted a systematic review to objectively evaluate the existing literature on this topic. We searched six databases (PubMed, Web of Science, Cochrane Library, Scopus, CNKI, and Wanfang) from its inception till early May, 2018. The adapted PEDro scale was used for study quality assessment of all randomized controlled trials (RCT). The pooled effect size (Hedge's g) of exercise capability (6-Minute Walking Test, 6-MWT), lung function parameters (forced expiratory volume in first second, FEV1; forced volume vital capacity, FVC; FEV1/FVC ratio), and quality of life were calculated based on the random-effects model. Twenty RCTs (n = 1975 COPD patients) were included in this review, with sum scores of the adapted PEDro scale between 5 and 9. Study results of meta-analysis indicate that Baduanjin is effective in improving exercise capability (Hedge's g = 0.69, CI 0.44 to 0.94, p < 0.001,  $I^2 = 66\%$ ), FEV<sub>1</sub> (Hedge's g = 0.47, CI 0.22 to 0.73, p < 0.001,  $I^2 =$ 68.01%), FEV<sub>1</sub>% (Hedge's g = 0.38, CI 0.21 to 0.56, p < 0.001,  $I^2 = 54.74\%$ ), FVC (Hedge's g = 0.39, CI 0.22 to 0.56, p < 0.001,  $I^2 = 14.57\%$ ), FEV<sub>1</sub>/FVC (Hedge's g = 0.5, CI 0.33 to 0.68, p < 1.5% $0.001, I^2 = 53.49\%$ ), and the quality of life of COPD patients (Hedge's g = -0.45, CI -0.77 to - 0.12, p < 0.05,  $I^2 = 77.02\%$ ), as compared to control groups. Baduanjin exercise as an adjunctive treatment may potentially improve exercise capability and pulmonary function of COPD patients as well as quality of life. Baduanjin exercise could be tentatively prescribed for COPD in combination with the conventional rehabilitation program to quicken the process of recovery. To confirm the positive effects of Baduanjin exercise for COPD patients, future researchers need to consider our suggestions mentioned in this article.

Keywords: Baduanjin, Qigong, COPD, rehabilitation

#### 1. Introduction

Chronic obstructive pulmonary disease (COPD) is a progressive, non-curable disease that causes airflow blockage of lung with breathing-related problems (e.g., dyspnea, wheezing, chest tightness, and frequent coughing with excessive mucus production) [1]. Individuals who suffer COPD have serious complications, including respiratory infection [2], heart problems [3], a higher risk for developing lung cancer [4], pulmonary hypertension [5], and depression [6]. According to the World Health Organization (WHO), individuals with moderate to severe COPD had reached roughly 200 million in 2010 and the number of the patients accounted for 10 percent of total disability [9] and all deaths around the world [10]. It is estimated that by year 2030, the number of deaths caused by COPD would continuously increase to be predictably ranked the third of all-cause mortality [11, 12].

Given that COPD has become one of the most serious public health issue, more and more clinicians and researchers are aware of the importance of pulmonary rehabilitation for COPD patients [13, 14]. Note-worthily, exercise as one of the rehabilitation modalities has been gradually recognized to be effective for symptomatic management of COPD, specifically alleviating the clinical symptoms, preventing the exacerbation of lung functions, and improving quality of life of the COPD patients [15]. Baduanjin exercise is one of ancient Chinese health-Qigong exercise [16-18], which involves training of musculoskeletal relaxation and stretching, breathing control, and mental focus at a slow pace [19, 20]. Because Baduanjin exercise is a mild-to-moderate intensity exercise and consists of eight simple movements [21], it has been commonly prescribed for patients with chronic diseases who have low exercise tolerance at Chinese medicine hospitals [22]. Several systematic reviews with meta-analysis of randomized controlled trials indicate the therapeutic effects of Baduanjin exercise for patients with stroke [23], sleep disturbance and musculoskeletal pain [24, 25], depression and anxiety [26], and hypertension [27].

Likewise, since the Chinese Health-Qigong Association was officially established in 2011 [28], Baduanjin Qigong as exercise prescription has become more popular and is also employed for COPD patients in recent years. In particular, a great number of clinical trials were conducted to investigate the therapeutic effects of Baduanjin exercise program for COPD patients [39-41]. When these studies varied greatly in sample size, study setting, intervention duration and weekly training dosage, and measuring outcome, it remains largely elusive if Baduanjin exercise is beneficial for COPD patients. Thus, we conducted a systematic review to objectively evaluate the existing

literature regarding the effects of Baduanjin exercise for symptomatic management of COPD patients. In this way, study results of this review could provide clinicians with another option to incorporate Baduanjin exercise into the rehabilitation regime of COPD patients, leading to better quality of life.

# 2. Methods

#### 2.1 Data sources

We searched six databases (PubMed, Web of Science, Scopus, CNKI, Wanfang, Cochrane Library) from its inception till early May, 2018. Keywords were entered as follow: Baduanjin, eightsection Brocade, traditional health Qigong, or setting-up exercise was integrated with COPD or chronic obstructive pulmonary disease. Cross-reference search was also used to manually identify relevant studies through reference lists of the articles identified at the initial stage. The detailed information of this systematic review and meta-analysis is reported following the Preferred Repointing items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses (PRISMA) guidelines [29].

#### 2.2 Inclusion criteria and study selection

To be included in this review, potentially relevant studies needed to meet the following inclusion criteria: (1) randomized controlled trials; RCT, (2) individuals diagnosed with COPD; (3) Baduanjin exercise used a primary intervention component and comparator with or without other treatments; (4) a minimum of one outcome (clinical symptoms or health-related parameters) with quantitative data for calculating pooled effect size. Studies did not meet the above-mentioned requirements which were excluded such as case-control with no randomization, cross-sectional studies, a single-group study with pre-test/post-test design, and reviews. An initial screening was performed by the first author (S.L) to remove the obviously irrelevant documents. The remaining of possibly relevant articles were further evaluated by two independent reviewers (S. L and L. Z) to confirm their eligibility. Any disagreement between the two review authors occurred, a third review author (L.W) was invited to verify the eligibility of the uncertain article by discussing with them.

#### 2.3 Study quality assessment for eligible studies selected

4

To assess study quality of studies selected, the Physical Therapy Evidence Database (PEDro) scale was adopted [30]. The original 11-item PEDro scale involves evaluation of eligibility criteria, random assignment, allocation concealment, baseline equivalence, blinding of stakeholders (participants, instructors, and assessors), retention rate of 85% and above, intention-treat-analysis, between-group statistical comparisons, and point measurement and measurement variability. Given the fact that the blinding of participants and instructors are impossible during exercise intervention, these two items are not considered for computing sum scores of methodological quality of each individual eligible study. Since all participants in the eligible studies must be diagnosed with COPD for inclusion of this review, the eligibility criteria of all studies selected are satisfied, so this item is not considered so that one point was removed from the sum scores. Furthermore, Baduanjin exercise as a primary intervention is possibly combined with other treatment (s) like drug therapy or usual care, such this method is ethically reasonable but could affect interpretation of study findings. Thus, "isolated Baduanjin intervention" as a new item is added, which ultimately results in a total of 9 items and each item is worth one point [31].

### 2.4 Data Extraction and Synthesis

Data extraction was independently carried out by two review authors (S.L and L.Z) and a standardized table is used. Features of all RCTs selected are extracted, including reference (author and year of publication), location and language of publication, characteristics of patients (sample size and attrition rate, mean age/age range, and course of disease), intervention protocol (weekly training dosage and duration), measuring outcome and measurement, and adverse event and follow-up assessment. To calculate pooled effect size (Hedge's g, with small effect = 0.2, medium effect = 0.5, and large effect = 0.8), we used a Comprehensive Meta-Analysis Software (Bio. Stat. Inc., Englewood, NJ, USA) based on the number of participants of each group and its quantitative data (mean and standard deviation) at baseline and post-intervention [32]. Given difference in sample size, testing instrument, and course of disease, the random-effects model was used. The value of I-squared was used to determine whether heterogeneity (small = 25%, moderate = 50%, and large = 75%) across studies selected existed. Finally, we used the funnel plot and Egger's regression intercept test to detect publication bias. Based on the visual inspection and data, outlying studies were removed so that symmetrical funnel plot and without statistical significance were observed.

#### 3. Results

5

# 3.1. Study Selection.

The procedures of study selection were shown in figure 1. The electronic and manual searches resulted in 218 articles. Based on the titles of initially identified articles, there were 95 duplicates and therefore they were removed. After looking through the abstract of remaining articles, 86 irrelevant documents were excluded and 37 articles remained. Furthermore, 17 documents were excluded because of non-randomized controlled trials (n = 4), review studies (n=3), non-Baduanjin as the main intervention (n=6), the data duplication (n=1), and no data reported for analysis (n=3) (figure 1). This left only 20 eligible articles to be included for the meta-analysis, including 18 in Chinese and 2 in English.



Figure 1. Flow of study selection.

# 3.2. Study Characteristics

The characteristics of the 20 studies are presented in Table 1. These studies were published between 2009 and 2018. All studies in which there were 1975 COPD patients (age range from 59.67 to 73.12) and sample size across studies selected ranged from 24 to 320. The average duration in course of disease was 1.64 to 16.21 years. Disease severity ranged from mild to very severe, as reported by study authors: (1) four studies [38,41,42,45] recruited participants with disease severity ranging from mild to severe; (2) two studies [37,48] recruited patients with moderate disease, whereas other studies did not specify the severity. Unsurprisingly, Baduanjin training was integrated with either drug therapy [33, 37, 39, 40, 43, 44, 46-48] or usual care [34-36, 41-43]. Baduanjin training was also integrated with convention therapy [47, 48] and breathing technique training [38]. Only two studies [51, 52] used isolated Baduanjin training to compare with other control conditions. Intervention duration in Baduanjin training varied greatly across studies selected, ranging from 3 to 12 months. The frequency of training ranged from 3 to 7 sessions each week, with each session lasting 30 to 60 minutes.

# Table 1. Summary of randomized controlled thats

	Leasting	Participant Characteristics				Badu	anjin Tr	aining	Orteore	Adverse
Reference	(Language)	Sample Size (Attrition rate)	Mean Age or Age Range	Course of Disease	Intervention Program	Frequency (weekly)	Time (/min)	Duration (week)	Measured	Event; Follow-Up
Zhang et al [33]	Changchun, China (Chinese)	60 (0%)	BJ:68.50 (9.18) CG:68.03 (7.18)	NR	BJ: Baduanjin + Drug Therapy CG: Drug Therapy	7	/	8	Lung function (FEV <sub>1</sub> , FEV <sub>1</sub> %, FVC), Exercise Capacity (6-MWT)	No; No
Deng et al [34]	Fujian, China (Chinese)	60(1.6%)	BJ:66.26 (5.13) CG:66.90 (4.63)	BJ:4.68 (2.54) CG:4.77 (2.52)	BJ: Baduanjin + Usual Care CG: Usual Care	7	30	12	Lung function (FEV1, FEV1%, FVC, FEV1/FVC)	No; No
Liang et al [35]	Guangdong, China (Chinese)	82(0%)	BJ:60.23 (9.32) CG:60.23 (9.32)	BJ:4.25(2.05) CG:4.25(2.05)	BJ: Baduanjin + Usual Care CG: Usual Care	7	30	12	Lung function (FEV <sub>1</sub> , FEV <sub>1</sub> %, FVC, FEV <sub>1</sub> /FVC)	No; No
Chen et al [36]	Fujian, China (Chinese)	60 (3.4%)	BJ:66.26 (5.13) CG:66.90 (4.63)	BJ:4.68 (2.54) CG:4.77 (2.52)	BJ: Baduanjin + Usual Care CG: Usual Care	7	30	12	Exercise Capacity (6-MWT), Quality of life (CAT)	No; No
Yin et al [37]	Guangzhou, China (Chinese)	24 (0%)	BJ:70.40 (7.56) CG:69.17 (7.66)	NR	BJ: Baduanjin + Drug Therapy CG: Breathing training + Drug Therapy	7	30	24	Quality of life (SGRQ), Exercise Capacity (6-MWT)	No; No
Hou et al [38]	Dongwan, China (Chinese)	60 (0%)	BJ:63.34(5.95) CG1:62.87(6.01) CG2:63.77(6.14)	NR	BJ: Baduanjin + Breathing Training CG1: Breathing Training CG2:Unaltered Lifestyle	2	30	12	Lung function (FEV <sub>1</sub> , FVC, FEV <sub>1</sub> /FVC), Exercise Capacity (6-MWT), Quality of life (SGRQ)	No; No
Guo, Gao et al [39]	Qingdao, China (Chinese)	60 (0%)	BJ:63.4 (NR) CG:62.8 (NR)	BJ:4.67 (1.54) CG:4.75(1.52)	BJ: Baduanjin + Drug Therapy CG: Drug Therapy	>4	30	24	Lung function (FEV <sub>1</sub> , FEV <sub>1</sub> %, FVC, FEV <sub>1</sub> /FVC)	No; No
Guo et al [40]	Qingdao, China (Chinese)	320 (0%)	BJ:64.87 (8.86) CG:64.15 (8.97)	BJ:16.19 (5.48) CG:16.21 (5.53)	BJ: Baduanjin + Drug Therapy CG: Drug Therapy	>4	30	24	Lung function (FEV <sub>1</sub> %, FEV <sub>1</sub> / FVC), Quality of life (CAT)	No; No
Liu et al [41]	Chengdu, China (Chinese)	80 (0%)	BJ:59.77 (7.08) CG:60.67 (6.95)	NR	BJ: Baduanjin + Usual Care CG: Usual Care	7	30	12	Lung function (FEV <sub>1</sub> %, FEV <sub>1</sub> /FVC), Exercise Capacity (6-MWT)	No; No
Chen, Liu et al [42]	Chengdu, China (Chinese)	78(0%)	BJ:60.52 (7.24) CG:59.67 (6.91)	NR	BJ: Baduanjin + Usual Care CG: Usual Care	7	30	12	Lung function (FEV1%, FEV1/FVC)	No; No
Huang et al [43]	Nanjing, China (Chinese)	62 (0%)	BJ:68.24 (3.28) CG:69.77 (4.42)	BJ:24.60(10.6) CG:17.32(14.44)	BJ: Baduanjin + Drug Therapy CG: Drug Therapy	7	30	24	Lung function (FEV <sub>1</sub> , FEV <sub>1</sub> %, FEV1/FVC) Quality of life (CAT)	No; No
Wang, Fang et al [44]	Dalian, China (Chinese)	73 (3.9%)	BJ:63.17 (9.95) CG:63.67 (9.75)	BJ:15.17(6.73) CG:14.83(7.89)	BJ: Baduanjin + Drug Therapy CG: Drug Therapy	7	30	12	Lung function (FEV <sub>1</sub> , FEV <sub>1</sub> %, FVC, FEV <sub>1</sub> /FVC), Exercise Capacity (6-MWT), Quality of life (SGRQ),	No; No

TADIC L. COIII.

#### Peer-reviewed version available at Int. J. Environ. Res. Public Health 2018, 15, 1830; doi:10.3390/ijerph15091830

Reference	Location	Pai	Participant Characteristics			Badu	anjin Tr	aining	Outcome	Adverse
	(Language)	Sample Size (attrition Rate)	Mean Age or Age Range	Course of Disease	<ul> <li>Intervention Program</li> </ul>	Frequency (weekly)	Session (/min)	Duration (week)	Measured	Event; Follow-Up
Pan et al [45]	SiChuan, China (Chinese)	82(0%)	BJ:60.7 (5.6) CG:61.8 (7.2)	BJ:6.7 (6.2) CG:8.8 (5.3)	BJ: Baduanjin + Usual Care CG: Usual Care	7	30	24	Lung function (FEV <sub>1</sub> , FEV <sub>1</sub> %, FVC, FEV <sub>1</sub> /FVC) , Exercise Capacity (6-MWT), Quality of life (SGRQ)	No; No
Wang [46]	Beijing, China (Chinese)	73 (0%)	BJ:66.76 (5.80) CG:66.69 (4.60)	BJ:11.02(3.38) CG:10.85(3.53)	BJ: Baduanjin + Drug Therapy CG: Drug Therapy	7	30	48	Lung function (FEV <sub>1</sub> %, FEV <sub>1</sub> ), Exercise Capacity (6-MWT)	No; No
Zhu et a .[47]	ChangSha, China (Chinese)	125 (0%)	BJ:69.00 (8.70) CG:68.00 (9.20)	BJ:12.50(10.70) CG:10.80(8.90)	BJ: Baduanjin + Drug Therapy CG: Drug Therapy	+ Drug Therapy rapy 14 30 24 Lung function (FEV <sub>1</sub> , FEV <sub>1</sub> %, FV0 FEV <sub>1</sub> /FVC), Exercise Capacity (6-		Lung function (FEV <sub>1</sub> , FEV <sub>1</sub> %, FVC, FEV <sub>1</sub> /FVC), Exercise Capacity (6-MWT)	No; No	
Sun et al [48]	ChangChun, China (Chinese)	60 (5.4%)	BJ:62.97 (6.87) CG:63.21 (7.02)	BJ:11.02(3.38) CG:10.85(3.53)	BJ: Baduanjin + Drug Therapy CG: Drug Therapy	7	30	48	Lung function (FEV1%), Exercise Capacity (6- MWT) and Quality of life (CAT)	No; No
Feng et al [49]	GuangZhou, China (Chinese)	60 (0%)	BJ:63 (4.00) CG:62 (5.00)	BJ:5.2(2.2) CG:5.4(1.9)	BJ:Baduanjin + Conventional Therapy CG: Conventional Therapy	104524Lung function (FEV1, FEV1%, F' FEV1/FVC), Exercise Capacity (		Lung function (FEV <sub>1</sub> , FEV <sub>1</sub> %, FVC, FEV1/FVC), Exercise Capacity (6MWT)	No; No	
Lv et al [50]	Beijing, China (Chinese)	160 (0%)	BJ:64.88 (8.87) CG:63.14 (9.12)	BJ:16.21(5.49) CG:16.57(5.17)	BJ: Baduanjin + Conventional Therapy CG: Conventional Therapy	7	20	2	Exercise Capacity (6-MWT), Quality of life (CAT)	No; No
Bobby et al [51]	Hong kong, China (English)	51 (36.25%)	BJ:71.75 (1.05) CG:73.12 (1.33)	NR	BJ: Baduanjin CG:walking training	>4	30	24	Exercise Capacity (6-MWT)	No; No
Liu et al [52]	ShangHai, China (English)	132 (10.60%)	BJ:61.82 (7.69) CG1:62.2 (6.34) CG2:61.34 (8.34)	BJ:7.54 (2.73) CG1:7.75 (2.20) CG2:6.34 (2.34)	BJ:Baduanjin CG1:Health Education CG2: Conventional Pulmonary Rehabilitation (walking + ball training)	3	60	24	Lung function (FEV1%, FEV1/FVC) , Exercise Capacity (6-MWT)	No; No

Note: BJ = Baduanjin; CG = control group; FEV<sub>1</sub> = the forced expiratory volume in one second; FEV<sub>1</sub>% = percentage of the forced expiratory volume in one second; FVC = forced vital capacity;

FEV<sub>1</sub>/FVC = the amount of air exhaled in the first second divided by all of the air exhaled during a maximal exhalation; 6-MWT = 6-minute Walking Test; SGRQ=St. George's breathing questionnaire;

CAT= COPD (Chronic Obstructive Pulmonary Disease) Assessment Test; NR = not reported.

Author [Reference]	Item 1	Item 2	Item 3	Item 4	Item 5	Item 6	Item 7	Item 8	Item 9	Score
Zhang et al.[33]	1	1	1	0	1	1	1	1	0	7
Deng et al.[34]	1	0	1	1	1	1	1	1	0	7
Liang et al.[35]	1	0	1	0	1	0	1	1	0	5
Chen et al.[36]	1	0	1	0	1	1	1	1	0	6
Yin et al.[37]	1	1	1	0	1	0	1	1	0	6
Hou et al.[38]	1	0	1	0	1	0	1	1	0	5
Guo, Gao et al.[39]	1	0	1	0	1	1	1	1	0	6
Guo et al.[40]	1	0	1	0	1	1	1	1	0	6
Liu et al.[41]	1	0	1	0	1	1	1	1	0	6
Chen, Liu et al.[42]	1	1	1	0	1	1	1	1	0	7
Huang et al.[43]	1	0	1	0	1	1	1	1	0	6
Wang, Fang et al.[44]	1	0	1	0	1	1	1	1	0	6
Pan et al.[45]	1	0	1	0	1	1	1	1	0	6
Wang [46]	1	0	1	0	1	1	1	1	0	6
Zhu et al.[47]	1	1	1	0	1	1	1	1	0	7
Sun et al.[48]	1	1	1	0	1	1	1	1	0	7
Feng et al.[49]	1	1	1	0	1	1	1	1	0	7
Lv et al.[50]	1	0	1	0	1	1	1	1	0	6
Bobby Ng et al.[51]	1	1	1	1	0	1	1	0	1	7
Liu et al.[52]	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	9

Note: Item 1 = randomization; Item 2 = concealed allocation; Item 3 = similar baseline; Item 4= blinding of assessors; Item 5 = more than 85% retention; Item 6 = missing data management (intention-to-treat analysis); Item 7 = between-group comparison; Item 8 = point measure and measures of variability; Item 9 = isolated Baduanjin intervention; 1 = explicitly described and present in details; 0 = absent, inadequately described, or unclear.

# 3.3. Methodological Quality

Based on the adapted PEDro scale, methodological quality of all eligible RCTs were scored, ranging from 5 to 9. Allocation concealment [34-36, 38-41, 43-46, 50], blinding of assessors [33, 35-50], and isolated Baduanjin exercise intervention [33-50] were absent. Intention-to-treat analysis for missing data was not employed in three studies [35, 37, 38]. One study [51] reported more than 15% attrition rate, along with the unclear description of point measure and measures of variability.

# 3.4 Effects of Baduanjin on 6-minute Walking Test

Fourteen studies examined the effects of Baduanjin exercise on the 6-MWT (longer distance indicates better exercise capability). Four outlying studies [38,46,47,48] were visually detected through the Funnel Plot along with the Egger's Regression Test. After removing these outliers, symmetrical funnel plot (Figure 2) was observed (Egger's regression intercept =2.156, p = 0.339). The meta-analysis of the 10 RCTs has shown that Baduanjin training was effective in improving performance of the 6-MWT (Hedge's g = 0.69, CI 0.44 to 0.94, p < 0.001,  $I^2 = 66\%$ ; Figure 3), as compared to control groups.



Figure 2. Funnel plot of publication bias for the 6-Minute Distance Test



#### Effects of Baduanjin on Exercise Capability

Meta Analysis

# **Figure 3**. Effects of Baduanjin on exercise capability measured by the 6-MWT (BT=breathing technique; PRP = Conventional pulmonary rehabilitation)

#### 3.5 Effects of Baduanjin on Lung functions

Table 3. Study results of meta-analysis regarding Lung function parameters

Outcomes	-4	Sample	e Size	Hodgo's g	059/ CI	Heterogeneity		
	studies	Baduanjin group	Control group	neuge's g	95% CI	I2(%)	P value	
FEV1 value	10	398	411	0.47	0.22-0.73	68.01%	P<0.001	
FEV1% value	13	711	706	0.38	0.21-0.56	54.74%	P<0.001	
FVC	8	330	344	0.39	0.22-0.56	14.57%	P<0.001	
FEV1/FVC value	/C value 13 629		655	0.5	0.33-0.68	53.49%	P<0.001	

Note: Lung functions consisted of  $FEV_1$  (forced expiratory volume in one second, n =12 RCTs),  $FEV_1$ % (n = 16 RCTs), FVC (forced vital capacity, n = 10 RCTs), and  $FEV_1$ /FVC (n = 14 RCTs).

For the FEV<sub>1</sub>, we used the funnel plot to visually detect publication bias and one outlying study [43] was removed, leading to a non-significant symmetry (Egger's regression intercept = 5.81, p = 0.062; Figure 4). Meta-analysis of 10 remaining RCTs has shown that Baduanjin was effective in improving FEV<sub>1</sub> (Hedge's g = 0.47, CI 0.22 to 0.73, p < 0.001,  $I^2 = 68.01\%$ ; Figure 5), as compared to control groups.



Figure 4. Funnel plot of publication for FEV1



#### Effects of Baduanjin on FEV1

Meta Analysis

**Figure 5**. Effect of Baduanjin on FEV<sub>1</sub> (BT = Breathing Technique training)

When we performed the meta-analysis regarding FEV<sub>1</sub>%, we used the funnel plot to visually detect two outlying studies [39,46] and they were removed, leading to a non-significant symmetry (Egger's regression intercept = -0.57, p = 0.719; Figure 6). The meta-analysis of the 14 remaining RCTs has shown that Baduanjin was effective in improving FEV<sub>1</sub>% (Hedge's g = 0.38, CI 0.21 to

0.56, p < 0.001, *I*<sup>2</sup> = 54.74%; Figure 7).





Reference	Stati	stics for	each s	study		Hedges	s's g and	1 95% CI	
н	edges':	s Lower	Upper						
	g	limit	limit	p-Value					
Zhang et al [33]	0.01	-0.49	0.51	0.98		I —	-	— I	
Deng et al [34]	0.06	-0.43	0.56	0.81			<b>_</b>		
Liang et al [35]	0.01	-0.42	0.44	0.96		-	<b></b>	-	
Guo et al [40]	0.37	0.15	0.59	0.00			_ I –		
Liu et al [41]	0.22	-0.22	0.65	0.33				<u> </u>	
Chen et al [42]	0.30	-0.14	0.74	0.18					
Huang et al [43]	0.75	0.24	1.26	0.00			- I -	<b>\</b>	-
Wang, Fang et al [44]	0.68	0.21	1.15	0.00			<b>–</b> –		
Pan et al [45]	0.44	0.01	0.87	0.04					
Zhu et al [47]	0.90	0.53	1.27	0.00					-
Sun et al <mark>[</mark> 48]	0.99	0.53	1.45	0.00					—I
Feng et al [49]	0.41	-0.10	0.91	0.11			-	•	
Liu et al [52]	0.01	-0.50	0.52	0.97		<u> </u>	<b>•</b> _	— I	
Liu et al [52] PRP	0.08	-0.43	0.59	0.76		I –		— I	
	0.38	0.21	0.56	0.00			◄	◆	
					-1.50	-0.75	0.00	0.75	1.50
						Control		Baduanjin	

# Effects of Baduanjin on FEV1%

Meta Analysis

Figure 7. Effects of Baduanjin on FEV1% (PRP = Conventional Pulmonary Rehabilitation)

When we performed the meta-analysis regarding forced volume vital capacity (FVC), we used the funnel plot to visually detect one outlying study [33] and then it was removed, leading to a non-

significant symmetry (Egger's regression intercept = 2.022, p = 0.367; Figure 8). The meteanalysis of the 8 RCTs has shown that Baduanjin was effective in improving FVC (Hedge's g = 0.39, CI 0.22 to 0.56, p < 0.001,  $I^2$  = 14.57%; Figure 9).



Figure 8. Funnel plot of publication bias for FVC

Reference	Statist	ics for							
He	edges's g	Lower limit	Upper limit	p-Value					
Deng et al [34]	0.13	-0.36	0.63	0.60		-		-1	
Liang et al [35]	0.14	-0.29	0.57	0.53				-	
Hou et al [38] BT	0.42	-0.19	1.03	0.18			+	•	
Hou et al [38]	0.88	0.23	1.53	0.01			-	<b>—</b>	
Guo, Gao et al [39]	0.75	0.23	1.26	0.00			-	<b>_\</b>	-
Wang et al [44]	0.46	0.00	0.92	0.05				•+•	
Pan et al [45]	0.60	0.17	1.04	0.01			I —		
Zhu et al [47]	0.33	-0.02	0.69	0.06					
Feng et al [49]	0.04	-0.46	0.54	0.87		-	<b>_</b>	-	
	0.39	0.22	0.56	0.00					
					-1.50	-0.75	0.00	0.75	1.50
						Control	В	aduanji	n

# Effects of Baduanjin on FVC

Meta Analysis

**Figure 9**. Effects of Baduanjin on FVC (BT = Breathing technique training)

When we performed the meta-analysis regarding FEV<sub>1</sub>/FVC%, we used the funnel plot to visually detect one outlying study [38]and then it was removed, leading to a non-significant symmetry (Egger's regression intercept = -1.737, p = 0.23; Figure 10). The mete-analysis of the 13 remaining RCTs has shown that Baduanjin was effective in improving FEV<sub>1</sub>/FVC% (Hedge's g = 0.5, CI 0.33 to 0.68, p < 0.001,  $I^2$  = 53.49%; Figure 11).







# Effects of Baduanjin on FEV1/FVC

Figure 11. Effects of Baduanjin on FEV<sub>1</sub>/FVC% (BT = Breathing technique training).

3.6 Effects of Baduanjin on quality of life

Both the SGBQ and the CAT were used to evaluate quality of life, with lower sum scores indicating better quality of life. Given that two studies [38,44] did not report the sum scores of the SGRQ, a total of 7 RCTs [36,37,40,43,45,48,50] was included for meta-analysis. Because the

symmetrical funnel plot was visually observed along with a non-significant value (Egger's regression intercept = -3.479, p = 0.094; Figure 12), study findings of 7 studies included for meta-analysis have shown that Baduanjin was effective in improving the quality of life of COPD patients (Hedge's g = - 0.45, CI -0.77 to - 0.12, p < 0.05,  $I^2 = 77.02\%$ ; Figure 13).



Figure 12. Funnel plot of publication bias for quality of life

# Effects of Baduanjin on quality of life

Reference	Measure	Statist	tics for	each s	tudy	Ŀ	ledges'	s g and	d 95% C	<u>; </u>
		Hedges's g	Lower limit	Upper limit	p-Value					
Chen et al [36]	CAT	-0.69	-1.20	-0.18	0.01	- I -	-	- 1	Ĩ	Ĩ
Guo et al [40]	CAT	-0.01	-0.23	0.20	0.90			•		
Huang et al [43]	]CAT	-0.92	-1.44	-0.40	0.00	—	•	0.00		
Sun et al [48]	CAT	-0.69	-1.14	-0.24	0.00			-		
Lv et al [50]	CAT	-0.04	-0.34	0.27	0.82		i i rest	-•		
Yin et al [37]	SGRQ	-0.01	-0.82	0.80	0.98		-			
Pan et al [45]	SGRQ	-0.83	-1.28	-0.39	0.00	-				
		-0.45	-0.77	-0.12	0.01					
						-1.50	- <mark>0.75</mark>	0.00	0.75	1.50
						E	Baduanji	n	Control	

Meta Analysis

Figure 13. Effects of Baduanjin on quality of life of COPD patients

# 4. Discussion

To the best of our knowledge, this is the first systematic review with meta-analytical method to objectively evaluate the therapeutic effects of Baduanjin training for COPD patients. Study findings of the current review indicate that Baduanjin exercise as an adjunctive treatment in the management of COPD patients may have the potential to improve exercise capability, lung function, and quality of life. All eligible RCTs were published between 2009 and 2018, suggesting that it is a newly expanding research field.

Exercise capability and lung function of COPD patients gradually declines, which can prevent them from participating in physical activities or even activities of daily living. Sedentary lifestyle and physical inactivity would worsen these physical functions, leading to reduced quality of life [53]. To escape this vicious circle, a mild-to-moderate aerobic exercise program should be prescribed for pulmonary rehabilitation of COPD patients. The purpose of this current review was to evaluate the efficacy and safety of Baduanjin exercise training in the symptomatic management of COPD patients. While adverse event occurred in none of studies , positive findings in the current review are in line with previous meta-analysis of randomized controlled trials investigating the beneficial effects of other mind-body exercises (Tai Chi, Yoga, and Qigong) for COPD patients [57-59].

Overall, improved exercise capability and lung function as well as quality of life of COPD patients may be due to movement patterns of Baduanjin routine. First, slow-paced Baduanjin routine as a mild-to-moderate intensity aerobic exercise is presumably suitable for COPD patients who have low exercise tolerance [22]. Furthermore, training in Baduanjin routine involves musculoskeletal stretching and relaxation, diaphragmatic breathing (inhaling and exhaling through your nose), and mental concentration in a coordinated way. These components of movements may be the key to strengthen lung capability and diaphragm of COPD patients. For instance, Movement 1 (Two Hands Hold Up the Heavens) and 2 (Drawing the Bow to Shoot the Eagle) in Baduanjin routine involve a large number of upper-limb stretching. These musculoskeletal stretching training in the upper body could expand the thoracic, diaphragm and abdominal muscles. In the meanwhile, respiratory muscles are trained and the contraction force is enhanced to concentrate on the stretching of the patient's trunk and limbs, so it is given the opportunity to potentially strengthen muscle, improve limb coordination, and to improve their exercise performance. In addition, mental focus and relaxation are also integrated in Baduanjin training where COPD patients may feel less fatigue and

19

more pleasant, which may build better mental health and increase adherence to this exercise protocol. As exercise capability and lung function improved, COPD patients naturally experienced better quality of life.

When overall results of meta-analysis are in supportive of the effect of Baduanjin training on improving exercise capability of COPD, the positive effect in some studies [33, 37, 50, 52] did not reach statistical significance that should be interpreted with caution. Specifically, in two studies where Baduanjin training was compared with active controls, one with breathing technique training [37] and another with conventional pulmonary rehabilitation program (walking plus ball exercise) [52]. Baduanjin training is possibly comparable to these two research-based rehabilitation methods [56], so it is reasonable to observe non-statistical significance in these two comparisons. In addition, intervention duration of less than 6 months was applied in other two studies [33, 50] in which a trend of increasing exercise capability after Baduanjin training was observed, but it was not statistically significant. It suggests that Baduanjin training of more than 6 months with an optimal training intensity may be more preferable in this special population.

Impaired lung function (e.g., FEV<sub>1</sub> and FVC) of COPD patients is commonly recognized. Overall, statistically significant positive effects were observed in these lung function parameters while Baduanjin training as a core intervention component was compared with control groups. Taking a closer look inside the individual studies, statistically significant differences were not reached in some studies in which Baduanjin training was integrated with usual care, drug therapy, conventional therapy, or breathing technique training to compare with its active control alone. This synergistic effect between Baduanjin training and drug therapy may produce Baduanjin-drug interaction, leading to comparable influence on these parameters. Thus, Baduanjin training intervention protocol is independently applied that should be considered in future studies. Similarly, this synergistic effect existed in those studies where outcome of "quality of life" was meta-analyzed.

#### 5. Limitations

Study limitations in this current review need to be pointed out. First, Baduanjin training in 90% of studies selected was integrated with other components, particularly drug therapy and usual care. Undoubtedly, this combination is ethically preferable because drug therapy is a mainstream rehabilitation method. In this way, it must be admitted that the positive effects of Baduanjin training may be due to a synergistic effect but Baduanjin training alone. Second, Baduanjin

intervention protocol (duration, frequency, and intensity) varied greatly across studies. It could, to greater extent, affect the reliability of the pooled effect sizes and make review authors difficult to draw a firm conclusion about the optimal training recommendation. Furthermore, none of studies selected used follow-up measurement, so positive results regarding the long-term effects of Baduanjin training still remains elusive. Third, style (standing or sitting) of Baduanjin routine or its individual movement was applied in these intervention studies, these factors may exaggerate the statistical heterogeneity of the pooled results. Positive results from most of studies selected with high risk of bias (the lack of allocation concealment, blinded assessors, intention-to-treat analysis, and isolated Baduanjin training) should be extrapolated with caution. Finally, study participants recruited in the studies selected were Chinese (mainland and Hong Kong). It is unknown whether the similar results regarding the positive effect of Baduanjin training in COPD patients with other races would be observed.

#### **6.**Conclusion

Study results of this current review indicate that Baduanjin training as an adjunctive treatment may potentially improve exercise capability and pulmonary function of COPD patients as well as quality of life. Baduanjin training could be tentatively prescribed for COPD in combination with the conventional rehabilitation program to quicken the process of recovery. To confirm the positive effects of Baduanjin training for COPD patients, future researchers need to consider our suggestions as mentioned above.

**Author Contributions:** S.L and L.Z. contributed to the conception and design of the review. S.L and L.Z applied search strategy. S.L, L.Z, and LW applied the selection criteria and completed study quality assessment of all randomized controlled trials All authors analyzed the data and interpreted data. L.Z and S.L wrote this manuscript. All authors edited this manuscript.

**Funding:** Research on Wushu Overseas Communication Application Framework Based on Audience Exchange (17YJA890025); the Fundamental Research Funds for the Central Universities (WUT: 2018VI014).

Conflicts of Interest: No conflict of interest existed in this study.

# Reference

- 1. Guidelines for the diagnosis and treatment of chronic obstructive pulmonary disease(revised in 2007). *Chinese Journal of Tuberculosis and Respiratory* **2007**, 1, 18-27. DOI:10.3760/j:issn:1001-0939.2007.01.004.
- 2. Miravitlles, M.; Anzueto, A. Chronic Respiratory Infection in Patients with Chronic Obstructive Pulmonary Disease: What Is the Role of Antibiotics? *Int. J. Mol. Sci.* **2017**, 18, 1344. DOI:10.3390/ijms18071344.
- 3. Falk,J.A.;Kadiev, S.; Criner ,G.J.; Scharf ,S.M.;Minai ,O.A.;Diaz ,P. Cardiac Disease in Chronic Obstructive Pulmonary Disease. *Proceedings of the American Thoracic Society* **2008**,5,543-548. DOI:10.1513/pats.200708-142ET.
- 4. Durham ,A.L.; Adcock,I.M.The relationship between COPD and lung cancer. *Lung Cancer* (*Amsterdam,Netherlands*) **2015**,90,121-127.DOI:10.1016/j.lungcan.2015.08.017.
- 5. Barberà ,J.A.;Peinado,V.I.;Santos ,S. Pulmonary hypertension in chronic obstructive pulmonary disease. *European RespiratoryJournal* **2003** ,21, 892-905.DOI:10.1183/09031936.03.00115402.
- Hynninen,K.M.;Breitve,M.H.;Wiborg,A.B.;Pallesen,S.;et al.Psychological characteristics of patients with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease: a review. *J Psychosom Res.* 2005,59,429-431.DOI:10.1016/j.jpsychores.2005.04.007
- 7. World Health Organization. Global Burden of Disease (GBD) 2002 estimates. In: World Health Report 2004. Geneva:WHO,**2004**. Available: http://www.who.int/healthinfo/global\_burden

\_disease/estimates\_regional\_2002/en/. (Accessed: 18 June 2018)

- World Health Organization. Burden of COPD. Geneva: WHO, 2014. Available: http://www.who.int/respiratory/copd/burden/en/. (Accessed: 16 June 2018)
- Murray, C.J.; Vos ,T.; Lozano,R.;Naghavi, M.; Flaxman, A.D.;Michaud ,C.; Ezzati,M.; Shibuya,K.Disability-adjusted life years (DALYs) for 291 diseases and injuries in 21 regions, 1990-2010: a systematic analysis for the Global Burden of Disease Study 2010. *Lancet*. 2012,380,2197-2203.DOI:10.1016/S0140-6736(12)61689-4.
- Lozano,R.;Naghavi, M.; Foreman,K.; Lim,S.; Shibuya,K.; Aboyans,V.; Abraham, J.; Adair,T. Global and regional mortality from 235 causes of death for 20 age groups in 1990 and 2010: a systematic analysis for the Global Burden of Disease Study 2010. *Lancet.* 2012, 380,2095-2128. DOI:10.1016/S0140-6736(12)61728-0.
- Lopez ,A.D.; Shibuya, K.; Rao,C.; Mathers,C.D.; Hansell ,A.L.; Held, L.S.; Schmid, V.; Buist, S. Chronic obstructive pulmonary disease: current burden and future projections. *Eur Respir J.* 2006 ,27,397-412.DOI:10.1183/09031936.06.00025805.
- Mathers,C.D. Uncertainty and data availability for the global burden of disease estimates 2000-2002. In: Evidence and Information for Policy Working Paper. *Geneva, Switzerland: WHO*, 2005. Available: http://www.who.int/healthinfo/global\_Burden\_disease/en/index.html. (Accessed: 18 June 2018.)
- 13. Fabbri, L.M.;Hurd, S.S.;For the GOLD Scientific Committee. Global strategy for the diagnosis,

management and prevention of COPD: 2003 update . *Eur Respir J.* **2003**,22,1-2.DOI:10.1183/09031936.03.00063703.

- Nici, L.;Donner,C.;Wouters ,E.ATS/ERS Pulmonary Rehabilitation Writing Committee. American Thoracic Society/European Respiratory Society statement on pulmonary rehabilitation. *Am J Respir Crit CareMed*. 2006,173,1390-1413. DOI:10.1164/rccm.200508-1211ST.
- 15. Singh, S.; Harrison, S.;Houchen, L.; Wagg, K. Exercise assessment and training in pulmonary rehabilitation for patients with copd. *European Journal of Physical & Rehabilitation Medicine* **2011**,47, 483-497.
- Zou, L.; Wang, H.; Xiao, Z.; Fang ,Q.; Zhang,M.; Li ,T.; et al. Taichi for health benefits in patients with multiple sclerosis: A systematic review. *PLOS ONE* 2017,12,17-21. DOI:10.1371/journal.pone.0170212.
- Zou, L.; Wang, C.; Chen, K.; Shu, Y.; Chen, X.; Luo, L.; Zhao, X. The Effect of Taichi Practice on Attenuating Bone Mineral Density Loss: A Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis of Randomized Controlled Trials. *Int. J. Environ. Res. Public Health* 2017, 14, 1000.DOI:10.3390/ijerph14091000.
- Zou, L.;Wang, H.;Li, T. Effects of Traditional Chinese Mind-Body Exercise on Disease Activity, Spinal Mobility, and Quality Of Life in Patients with Ankylosing Spondyliti . *Le Travail Humain* 2017, 80,1585-1597.
- Zou, L.; Sasaki, J.; Zeng, N.; Wang, C.;Sun, L.A Systematic Review with Meta-Analysis of Mindful Exercises on Rehabilitative Outcomes among post-stroke patients. *Archives of Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation* 2018,4,25-31. Doi:10.1016/j.apmr.2018.04.010
- Zou, L.; Yeung, A.; Zeng, N.; Wang, C.; Sun, L.; Thomas, G.; Wang, H. Effects of Mind-Body Exercises for Mood and Functional Capabilities in Post-Stroke Patients: An Analytical Review of Randomized Controlled Trials. *Int J Environ Res Public Health* 2018, 15, 721. DOI: 10.3390/ijerph15040721.
- Zou, L.; SasaKi, J.;Wang, H.; Xiao, Z.; Fang, Q.; Zhang, M.A Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis Baduanjin Qigong for Health Benefits: Randomized Controlled Trials. *Evidence-Based Complementary and Alternative Medicine* 2017, 4548706, 17.DOI: 10.1155/2017/4548706.
- 22. Zou, L.;Wang, C.;Yeung, A.; Liu, Y.; Pan, Z. A Review Study on the beneficial effects of Baduanjin. *J Altern Complement Med*, 2018,24,324-335.DOI: 10.1089/acm.2017.0241
- Zou, L.; Wang, C.; Chen, X.; Wang, H. Baduanjin Exercise for Stroke Rehabilitation: A Systematic Review with Meta-Analysis of Randomized Controlled Trials. *Int. J. Environ. Res. Public Health* 2018, 15, 600.DOI:10.3390/ijerph15040600
- Zou, L.; Albert,Y.; Quan, X.; Wang, H. A Systematic review and Meta-analysis of Mindfulnessbased (Baduanjin) exercise for alleviating musculoskeletal pain and improving sleep quality in people with chronic diseases. *Int. J. Environ. Res. Public Health* 2017, 14, 1000. DOI: 10.3390/ijerph15020206

- 25. Jiang, H.; Tan, C.; Yuan, S. Baduanjin exercise for insomnia: A systematic review and metaanalysis.*Behav Sleep Med* .2017,4,1-13.DOI: 10.1080/15402002.2017.1363042.
- Zou, L.; Yeung, A.; Quan, X.; et al.Mindfulness-based Baduanjin exercise for depression and anxiety in people with physical or mental illnesses: A Systematic Review and Meta-analysis of randomized controlled trials. *Int J Environ Res Public Health* 2018, 15, 321.DOI: 10.3390/ijerph15020321.
- 27. Lin,J.H.Systematic evaluation and meta-analysis of the effect of badanjin combined with conventional treatment for primary hypertension. *Journal of guangzhou university of traditional Chinese medicine* **2017**, 34, 774-780.DOI: 10.13359/j.cnki.gzxbtcm.2017.05.033.
- 28. Yeung, A.; Chan, J.; Cheung, J.; Zou, L. Qigong and Tai-Chi. For mood regulation. Focus-*The Journal of Lifelong Learning in Psychiatry* **2017**,16, 40-47. DOI: 10.1176/appi.focus.20170042.
- Moher, D.; Liberati, A.; Tetzlaff, J.; et al. Preferred reporting items for systematic reviews and meta-analyses: the PRISMA statement. *PLoS Med*. 2009, 18,123.DOI: 10.1016/j.jclinepi.2009.06.005.
- 30. Maher, C.; Sherrington, C.;Herbert, T. Reliability of the PEDro scale for rating quality of randomized controlled trials. *Phys. Ther.* **2003**, 83, 713-721.
- Foley,N.C.;Teasell, R.W.;Bhogal,S.K.; et al. Stroke Rehabilitation Evidence-Based Review: methodology. *Topics in Stroke Rehabilitation*, 2003, 10,1-7.DOI:10.1310/Y6TG-1KQ9-LEDQ-64L8.
- Zou,L.;Yeung ,A.;Quan.X.; et al.A Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis of Mindfulness-Based (Baduanjin) Exercise for Alleviating Musculoskeletal Pain and Improving Sleep Quality in People with Chronic Diseases. *Int J Environ Res Public Health* 2018, 15,206.DOI: 10.3390/ijerph15020206.
- Zhang,L.; Wang,T.; Shi,L.; et al. Effects of Ba Duanjin's "Zong Zongqi" on nutritional status and cardiopulmonary rehabilitation in patients with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease. *Journal* of Changchun University of Traditional Chinese Medicine 2017, 33: 954-956. DOI:10.13463/j.cnki.cczyy.2017.06.031.
- Deng, Y.; Chen, J. Effect of Baduanjin single-lift on rehabilitation of patients with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease. *Chinese Journal of Nursing* 2015, 50, 1458-1463.DOI:10376/j.issn.0254-1796.2015.12.009
- Liang, X. Effect of Baduanjin Single-lifting Exercise on Rehabilitation of Patients with Chronic Obstructive Pulmonary Disease. *Journal of Nursing Practice and Research* 2016, 13,156-157.DOI:10.3969/j.issn.1672-9676.2016.17.070
- Chen,J.;Deng,Y.; et al. Effects of Baduanjin on the quality of life and exercise tolerance of patients with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease with pulmonary spleen qi deficiency syndrome. *Journal of Rehabilitation* 2015, 25, 13-17.DOI: 10.13261/j.issn.2096-0328.2015.03.003
- 37. Yin,G. Clinical study on the effect of Baduanjin and respiratory exercises on quality of life in

patients with moderate to severe COPD. *Guangzhou University of Traditional Chinese Medicine* **2013**.

- 38. Hou,D.; Huang,F.; Yu ,S.;et al. Study on the efficacy of Baduanjin combined with respiratory training in patients with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease in the community. *Guangzhou Pharmaceutical* **2017**,29-32.DOI:10.3969/j.issn.1000-8535.2017.06.009
- Guo,J.; Gao,Y.; et al. Effects of Baduanjin exercise on rehabilitation of patients with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease in stable phase. *Qi Lu Nursing Journal* 2016,22,97-98.DOI:10.3969/j.issn.1006-7256.2016.07.051.
- Guo, J. Analysis of the efficacy of traditional fitness exercise Baduanjin in promoting pulmonary rehabilitation in patients with stable COPD. *Journal of Shandong Medical College* 2016, 38,171-174.DOI:10.3969/j.issn.1674-0947.2016.03.005
- Liu ,S.; Chen,Y. Clinical studies on Qigong Baduanjin 6min walking in patients with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease improved from stable. *Sichuan Medicine* 2013, 34,1090-1092.DOI:10.16252/j.cnki.issn1004-0501-2013.08.018
- 42. Chen ,Y.;Liu,S. Effect of Health Qigong Baduanjin on Pulmonary Function in Patients with Chronic Obstructive Pulmonary Disease in Stable Phase. *Chinese Medicine Modern Distance Education* **2015**, 13,16-18.DOI:10.3969/j.issn.1672-2779.2015.17.007
- 43. Huang,B.;Yao,Q. Therapeutic effect of Health Qigong Baduanjin on the treatment of chronic obstructive pulmonary disease with stable lung and spleen deficiency. *Hubei Journal of Traditional Chinese Medicine* **2017**, 39, 4-6.
- Wang,L.; Fang,L. Effects of practiced Baduanjin on stable lung function in patients with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease. *TCM Herald* 2018,3.DOI: 10.13862/j.cnki.cn43-1446/r.2018.03.029
- 45. Pan,M.; Luo,J. Observation on the Curative Effect of Stationary Baduanjin Rehabilitation Exercise on Patients with Chronic Obstructive Pulmonary Disease in Stable Phase. *Journal of Chengdu University of Traditional Chinese Medicine* **2016**, 39,49-52.DOI:10.13593/j.cnki.51-1501/r.2016.03.049
- 46. Wang,J.Y. Clinical observation of herbal administration and eight-section brocade in treating chronic obstructive pulmonary disease of stable stage. *Shanghai Journal of Traditional Chinese Medicine* **2015**,7,41-42.DOI: 10.16305/j.1007-1334.2015.07.013.
- Zhu, Z.G.; Chen,Y. Impacts of Baduanjin Qigong of Sitting Style on Lung Function in COPD Patients. World Journal of Integrated Traditional & Western Medicine 2014,8,846-848.DOI:10.13935/j.cnki.sjzx.140817.
- Sun,Y. Therapeutic effect of Health Qigong "Baduanjin" on patients with stable stage II chronic obstructive pulmonary disease . *Changchun University of Traditional Chinese Medicine* 2014.
- 49. Feng,Y.;Pan,H. Observation of the efficacy of Baduanjin exercise on elderly patients with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease at stable stage. *New Journal of Traditional Chinese*

Medicine 2009,8,36-37.DOI:10.13457/j.cnki.jncm.2009.08.017

- 50. Yan, L.U.; Jiazhen,L.I.; Zhang,L.;et al. Effect of gymnastic qigong Baduanjin on the quality of life and satisfac-tion of patients with chronic obstructive pulmonary diseases. *China Medical Herald* **2015**,30,161-164.
- Ng,B.H.;Tsang,H.W.;Jones,A.Y.;et al. Functional and psychosocial effects of health qigong in patients with COPD: a randomized controlled trial. *J Altern Complement Med* 2011, 17,3,243-251.DOI: 10.1089/acm.2010.0215.
- Liu,X. D.; Jin, H.Z.;Ng,H.P.;et al. Therapeutic Effects of Qigong in Patients with COPD: A Randomized Controlled Trial. *Hong Kong Journal of Occupational Therapy* 2012, 22,38-46.DOI:10.1016/j.hkjot.2012.06.002
- 53. Gao,X.;Wang,Y. Application of aerobic exercise in patients with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease// *China Rehabilitation Medical Association National Rehabilitation Academic Annual Conference* **2012**.
- 54. Wu,L.L.; Lin,Z.K.; Weng, H.D.; et al. Effectiveness of meditative movement on COPD: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *International Journal of Chronic Obstructive Pulmonary Disease* **2018**, 13,1239-1250.DOI: 10.2147/COPD.S159042.
- Ståhl ,E.;Lindberg,A.; Jansson,S.A.; et al. Health-related quality of life is related to COPD disease severity. *Health and Quality of Life Outcomes* 2005, 3,56-61.DOI: 10.1186/1477-7525-3-56.
- 56. Puhan,M.A.; Guyatt,G.H.;Goldstein,R.; et al. Relative responsiveness of the Chronic Respiratory Questionnaire, St. Georges Respiratory Questionnaire and four other health-related quality of life instruments for patients with chronic lung disease. *Respiratory Medicine* 2007, 101,308.DOI:10.1016/j.rmed.2006.04.023
- 57. Ding,M.; Zhang, W.;Li, K.;Chen,X. Effectiveness of T'ai Chi and Qigong on Chronic Obstructive Pulmonary Disease: A Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis. *Journal of Alternative and Complementary Medicine* **2014**,20,79-86. doi:10.1089/acm.2013.0087.
- Wu, L.L.; Lin, Z.K.; Weng,H.D.; Qi, Q.F.; Lu, J.; Liu, K.X. Effectiveness of meditative movement on COPD: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *International Journal of Chronic Obstructive Pulmonary Disease* 2018,13, 1239 – 1250. DOI:10.2147/COPD.S159042.
- Liu, X.C.;Pan, L.; Hu, Q.;Dong, W.P.; Yan, J.H.; Dong, L. Effects of yoga training in patients with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *Journal of Thoracic Disease* 2016,6, 795 - 802. DOI:10.3978/j.issn.2072-1439.2014.06.05.