Article

Optical Pumping of TeH⁺: Implications for Search for Varying m_p/m_e

Patrick R. Stollenwerk¹, Mark G. Kokish¹, Antonio G. S. de Oliveira-Filho², Fernando R. Ornellas² and Brian C. Odom^{1*}

- ¹ Department of Physics and Astronomy, Northwestern University, Evanston, Illinois 60208, USA 1
- ² Departamento de Química, Faculdade de Filosofia, Ciências e Letras de Ribeirão Preto, Universidade de São Paulo, 14040-901, Ribeirão Preto-SP, Brazil
- Correspondence: b-odom@northwestern.edu; Tel.: +1-847-467-5452

Academic Editor: name Version July 12, 2018 submitted to Preprints

- Abstract: Molecular overtone transitions provide optical frequency transitions sensitive to variation in
- the proton-to-electron mass ratio ($\mu \equiv m_p/m_e$). However, robust molecular state preparation presents
- a challenge critical for achieving high precision. Here, we characterize infrared and optical-frequency
- ⁴ broadband laser cooling schemes for TeH⁺, a species with multiple electronic transitions amenable
- to sustained laser control. Using rate equations to simulate laser cooling population dynamics, we
- sestimate the fractional sensitivity to μ attainable using TeH⁺. We find that laser cooling of TeH⁺ can
- ⁷ lead to significant improvements on current μ variation limits.
- Keywords: time variation of constants; proton-electron mass ratio; molecular ion; laser cooling

9 1. Introduction

The Standard Model has proven remarkably robust, but it fails to explain many known phenomena 10 such as gravity, dark matter, and dark energy. This quandary has motivated searches for physics 11 beyond the Standard Model, including searches for space-time evolution of the dimensionless constants. 12 Such an evolution could occur over cosmic time scales [1,2] and might be related to the problem of 13 dark energy [3]. Alternatively, oscillatory or transient variations over shorter time scales would be 14 expected to arise in certain proposed models for dark matter [4,5]. 15 Molecular rotational and vibrational energies scale like $E_{\rm h}(M/m_e)^{\beta}$ where $E_{\rm h}$ is the atomic unit 16 of energy defined by the electronic energy scale, *M* is the reduced mass of the molecule, and $\beta = -1/2$ 17 for vibrations and $\beta = -1$ for rotations [6]. Neutrons and protons primarily derive their masses from 18 the strong interaction such that $m_n \approx m_p \approx 3\Lambda_{QCD}$ while electrons derive their mass from the weak 19 scale via the Higgs field vacuum expectation value [6,7]. Consequently, rotational and vibrational 20 transitions of molecules can act as a probe into the variation of $\mu \equiv m_p/m_e$ and therefore the ratio of 21 the strong to weak energy scales. In many models, for example models assuming Grand Unification, 22 μ varies a factor of 30-40 more rapidly than the fine structure constant α . Based on these arguments, 23 there is strong motivation for experimental searches for varying μ [8–10]. 24 Atomic hyperfine transitions also have dependence on μ , but their sensitivity suffers compared 25 with molecules because of the smaller energy interval [10]. However, despite orders of magnitude 26 27 smaller absolute sensitivities to varying μ , the simpler atomic state preparation requirements have allowed atoms to set the current best laboratory constraints. Comparison of two different hyperfine 28 transitions and an optical atomic clock has yielded a limit of $\sim 1 \times 10^{-16}$ /yr [11,12]. The best 29 experimental limit from a molecule, set by comparing a rovibrational transition in SF_6 to a Cs hyperfine 30

- ³¹ transition, is 6×10^{-14} /yr [13].
- In TeH⁺, a vibrational overtone transition has been identified as a potentially promising candidate for μ variation detection [14]. The systematic uncertainties for reasonable experimental conditions are projected at the 1×10^{-18} level or below. Furthermore, TeH⁺ is one of a small but growing class

2 of 15



Figure 1. Low lying electronic states of TeH⁺. Figure generated from [26].

of molecular ions identified as having so-called diagonal Franck-Condon factors (FCFs), offering the
 possibility of rapid state preparation through broadband rotational cooling [15–20].

We envision the μ variation experiment being performed on a single molecular ion, using quantum

³⁸ logic spectroscopy (QLS) [21]. Preparation of the initial spectroscopy state could be accomplished

³⁹ either by optical pumping [22–24] or projectively [25]. The speed at which one can initially prepare and

⁴⁰ reset the spectroscopy state has critical implications for the statistical uncertainty that can be obtained

in a measurement. Here, we evaluate realistic optical pumping state preparation timescales for TeH⁺

⁴² and draw conclusions about statistical uncertainties in a search for varying μ . We also discuss more

⁴³ generally the molecular ion qualities desirable for obtaining low statistical uncertainty and identify

some molecular ion species which can serve as benchmarks for μ variation searches.

45 2. Molecular Structure

The four lowest lying electronic states (Fig. 1) of TeH⁺ (X_10^+ , X_21 , a_2 , $b0^+$) are predicted to have bond equilibrium distances within ~ 0.1 pm of each other [26]. This implies that each of the transitions will have highly diagonal FCFs and nearly identical rotational constants. Consequently, each electronic transition will have well separated P, Q, and R branches allowing a spectrally shaped broadband laser to selectively cover transitions that remove rotational quanta [27]. Highly diagonal FCFs lead to suppressed vibrational excitation during the rotational cooling (Fig. 2). Since experimental data for TeH⁺ structure are not currently available, we attempt to evaluate

the accuracy of the TeH⁺ multireference configuration interaction with single and double excitations

and Davidson correction for higher excitations (MRCISD+Q/aV5Z) calculations [26] by comparing

- theoretical [28] and experimental [29–31] investigations of the isoelectronic species antimony hydride
- ⁵⁶ (SbH). Compared with the TeH⁺ calculation, the MRCISD+Q calculation for SbH uses a smaller basis

3 of 15



Figure 2. Relevant spontaneous emission channels and partial lifetimes of TeH⁺.

set (of quadruple zeta quality) and fewer configuration state functions and is expected to be less accurate. FCFs depend most strongly on the difference in equilibrium bond length between electronic states, and the equilibrium bond lengths for SbH were predicted to within 3 pm of the measured values. For optical cooling, we also rely on short lifetimes. The predicted lifetime of the b0⁺ state of SbH was predicted to within a factor of two. Other properties that have a smaller impact on cooling efficiency such as harmonic frequencies, spin-orbit splittings, and electronic energies were also predicted with comparable accuracy. A comparison between the predictions of the MRCISD+Q/aV5Z level of theory for the CAs molecule [32] and experimental measurements [33] shows that calculated bond lengths are within 1 pm of experimental values therefore the calculations for TeH⁺ should be more accurate than the ones for SbH. Typically, multiple low-lying electronic states will complicate cooling. However, in the case of

67 TeH⁺, their shared diagonal FCFs open up possibilities for laser control of the internal state population 68 using multiple broadband light sources. Diagonal transitions between the X states have energies 69 accessible by quantum cascade lasers (QCLs) and diagonal transitions between a₂ and X and b0⁺ and 70 X are predicted to be in the telecom and optical bands respectively. The lifetimes of the three low 71 lying excited states are calculated using the potential energy curves and dipole moment functions 72 from Gonçalves dos Santos et al. and LEVEL 16 [34] and are predicted to be 15 μ s for b0⁺, 2.4 ms for 73 a2, and 460 ms for X_21 . Transition moments between $b0^+$ and a2 and between a2 and X_10^+ will be 74 insignificant as both are quadrupole transitions. 75

76 2.1. Magnetic dipole moments

57

58

59

60

61

62

63

64

65

66

The isoelectronic molecule SbH was observed to have significant magnetic dipole transition 77 moments on $X \rightarrow b$ transitions [29]. Magnetic dipole transitions will connect states of the same 78 parity, so these transitions are useful for state preparation of a single parity state which would 79 otherwise require an additional step to the cooling process. The TeH⁺ magnetic dipole moments for 80 the $b0^+ - X_2 1 (g_s \langle b0^+ | S_x | X_2 1 \rangle)$ and $X_2 1 - X_1 0^+ (g_s \langle X_2 1 | S_x | X_1 0^+ \rangle)$ transitions (Fig. 3) were computed 81 using MOLPRO [35] and input into LEVEL 16 [34] to obtain the Einstein A coefficients. The magnetic 82 dipole spontaneous emission rates for the $b0^+ - X_21$ and $X_21 - X_10^+$ transitions are 70 times slower 83 and 5 times faster than the corresponding E1 transitions, respectively. We therefore include these M1 84

transitions in our simulation of the cooling dynamics.

4 of 15



Figure 3. Magnetic dipole transition moments of TeH⁺.

3. Internal state cooling

Generally speaking, broadband sources of light can be spectrally filtered such that frequencies 87 driving transitions increasing vibrational or rotational energy are removed and only frequencies that 88 drive transitions removing vibrational or rotational energy from the molecule are kept. This concept 89 has been used previously in the cooling of rotational degrees of freedom of AlH⁺ [24] and with cooling 90 the vibrational degrees of freedom of Cs₂ [36]. In particular, electronic transitions with diagonal 91 FCFs undergoing spontaneous decay will tend to preserve their vibrational mode. This means that 92 continuous pumping of rotational or vibrational energy removing transitions will efficiently populate 93 the lowest energy rotational and vibrational states, i.e. efficient internal state cooling. In this paper 94 we consider variants of such a scheme on TeH^+ . When discussing rotational cooling, we assume a 95 thermal population distribution at room temperature where \sim 99% of the population is in J < 12 of 96 the ground electronic and vibrational state. 97

98 3.1. $X_10^+ - X_21$ coupling

The lifetime of the X₂1 state is long compared to excited vibrational state lifetimes of X₁0⁺ so we do not consider rotational cooling via the X₁0⁺ \rightarrow X₂1 transition. For any cooling scheme, however, X₂1 will be important as it is the strongest decay channel of both b0⁺ and a2. Addition of this laser significantly reduces the complexity of the 4 level system by (1) effectively reducing v = 0 of X₁0⁺ and X₂1 into a single state and (2) via the relatively strong M1 transition, providing different parity mixing than in E1 transitions (Fig. 4).

Because each rotational cooling scheme must involve population in X_21 , we propose coupling X_10^+ and X_21 with a broadband laser on the Q branch. The requirements of the broadband source are simplified by the structure of X_10^+ and X_21 which has the first 12 Q branch transitions within one wavenumber of each other. The $X_10^+ \rightarrow X_21$ transition is 9.6 μ m [26] which allows for a single QCL to couple rotational states of the two ground vibrational states.

For cooling to proceed at the maximum rate set by upper state spontaneous emission, the $X_21 - X_10^+$ transition, whose Einstein *A* coefficients are $< 2 \text{ s}^{-1}$, must be driven at well above saturation.

5 of 15



Figure 4. Rotational cooling scheme using $X \rightarrow b0^+$ at 600 nm. Straight arrows show transitions driven by lasers, with arrow width indicating laser linewidth. Wavy arrows represent spontaneous emission channels.

For a2 or b0⁺ as the choice of upper state, this requires coupling $X_2 1 - X_1 0^+$ at ~3 and 5 orders of magnitude above saturation, respectively. Given that saturation occurs with a spectral intensity of ~130 μ W/(mm² cm⁻¹), a 1 cm⁻¹ broad QCL with 50 mW of power focused onto the molecule is easily capable of meeting these requirements.

3.2. Rotational cooling on $X - b0^+$ at 600 nm

The most rapid cooling scheme will involve the optical transitions between X and $b0^+$ as $b0^+$ has the shortest lifetime of the diagonal electronic states. We propose cooling by pumping from X_21 because the transition dipole moment of X_10^+ and $b0^+$ is expected to be an order of magnitude weaker than X_21 and $b0^+$.

The P branch of $X_2 1 \rightarrow b0^+$ has been predicted to span 612 nm to 618 nm for J < 12 and the 121 spectral intensity at saturation is estimated to be \sim 500 mW mm⁻²/ cm⁻¹ (10 W mm⁻²/nm). Rapid 122 progress on broadband commercial lasers in this spectral region suggests that a light source capable of 123 saturating all the required transitions might soon be available. We note inclusion of P(1) in the coverage 124 of the P branch with a broadband source will lead to sub-optimal cooling as decay from $|b0^+, J = 0\rangle$ can only increase rotational energy. Exclusion of P(1), however, will limit cooling by leaving J = 1126 dark to the cooling laser. As seen in Fig. 4, this can be avoided with the addition of a CW laser tuned 127 to $|X_21, J = 1, +\rangle \rightarrow |b0^+, J = 1, -\rangle$ where J = 0 will become the only dark state. Note that the two 128 $|X, J = 1, -\rangle$ states are not dark because the pump also drives M1 transitions. 129

¹³⁰ 3.2.1. Vibrational repumping

Though branching from $|b0^+, v = 0\rangle$ into $|X_21, v = 1\rangle$ is slow, an additional CW laser and careful choice of the rotational cooling laser spectral cutoff can improve cooling time and fidelity. Because the vibrational constants of X_21 and $b0^+$ are similar, the rotational cooling laser on $|X_21, v = 0\rangle \rightarrow$ $|b0^+, v = 0\rangle$ will also rotationally cool on $|X_21, v = 1\rangle \rightarrow |b0^+, v = 1\rangle$. The spectrum is such that the spectral cutoff can be placed between P(1) and P(2) for both vibrational states. Any decays into $|X_21, v = 1\rangle$ will therefore be pumped into J = 1 where a CW laser can be used as a vibrational repump into v = 0 via the P(1) transition of $|X_21, v = 1\rangle \rightarrow |b0^+, v = 0\rangle$ (~ 700 nm). Peer-reviewed version a<u>vailable at *Atoms* 2018</u>, 6, 53; <u>doi:10.3390/atoms603005</u>

6 of 15



Figure 5. Rotational cooling scheme using $X \rightarrow a2$ at 1300 nm. Straight arrows show transitions driven by lasers, with arrow width indicating laser linewidth. Yellow arrows indicate CW assist lasers. The wavy arrow indicates spontaneous emission channels.

3.3. Rotational cooling on X - a2 at 1300 nm

Rotational cooling with IR frequencies can be done by optical pumping through a2. The relevant $X_21 \rightarrow a2$ P branch transitions at room temperature are predicted to span ~100 cm⁻¹ from 1340 nm to 1360 nm [26], within the telecom O-band. The spectral intensity for saturation of these transitions is <25 mW mm⁻²/ cm⁻¹ meaning a 5 W broadband laser with a 1 mm² collimated beam area is sufficient for saturation.

Cooling via this transition will be limited by the 4 to 7 ms branching decay times of $|a_2, J\rangle \rightarrow |X_21, J-1\rangle$. A rough estimate performed by taking the number of occupied rotational states at room temperature and multiplying by the average branching time places the cooling time scale at ~50 ms. Though cooling on this transition will be slow compared to cooling via the shorter lived b0⁺ state, depending on the application, it may be advantageous given the availability of telecom technology.

A cartoon of the transitions involved in the $X - a^2$ cooling scheme(s) can be seen in Fig. 5. In a 149 more careful analysis of the cooling time scale we note that the $X_2 1 \rightarrow a_2$ transition has no P branch 150 transitions for J < 3. In a cooling scheme relying on a QCL coupling the X states via the Q branch 151 and a broadband laser covering the P branch of $X_2 1 \rightarrow a2$, the lack of P branch transitions for J < 3152 implies rotations will cease being cooled once the population has been pumped into J = 0, 1, 2. If 153 the broadband laser includes the Q branch of $X_2 1 \rightarrow a^2$, then at the cost of a reduced cooling rate, 154 the broadband laser will pump J = 2 such that the population will transfer into J = 0, 1. Over much 155 longer time scales (seconds) determined by the $|X_21, J = 1\rangle \rightarrow |X_10^+, J = 0\rangle$ branching time, the X 156 coupling laser will pump the remaining population into $|X_10^+, J=0\rangle$. The fidelity of this final step 157 will be limited by the much slower rate of blackbody redistribution. 158

159 3.3.1. CW assist

With assistance from the b0⁺ state, it is possible to avoid the rate-limiting steps that were not included in our rough estimate of the cooling time scale. In the scheme relying on pumping the P and Q branch of $X_21 \rightarrow a2$, an additional CW laser tuned to $|X_21, J = 1, +\rangle \rightarrow |b0^+, J = 1, -\rangle$ will more rapidly pump population into *J*=0 than what is allowed for by the $|X_21, J = 1\rangle \rightarrow |X_10^+, J = 0\rangle$ branching time. Similarly, a CW laser tuned to $|X_21, J = 2, +\rangle \rightarrow |b0^+, J = 1, -\rangle$ can replace the role of the less efficient cooling from $X_21 \rightarrow a2$ Q branch pumping. With the simultaneous assistance of both CW lasers, the X - a2 cooling scheme (Fig. 5) recovers the ~50 ms time scale.

doi:10.20944/preprints201807.0212.v1

Peer-reviewed version available at Atoms 2018, 6, 53; doi:10.3390/atoms603005

7 of 15



Figure 6. Vibrational cooling. Straight arrows indicate transitions covered by lasers and wavy arrows indicate spontaneous emission channels.

167 3.4. Vibrational cooling

Depending on the choice of excited spectroscopy state in a μ variation measurement, vibrational 168 cooling may be beneficial. Specifically, we envision our spectroscopy states to be of the form 169 $|X_10^+, v''=0, J''=0\rangle$ and $|X_10^+, v', J'=1\rangle$. As the excited state spontaneously decays, the rotational 170 state population will slowly diffuse as the molecule vibrationally relaxes. For v' = 1, decay can only 171 leave population in the vibrational ground state and so vibrational cooling is not necessary to minimize 172 state re-preparation time. For v' > 1 we propose active vibrational cooling by driving $\Delta v = -1$ 173 transitions of the form $|X_21, v\rangle \rightarrow |b0^+, v-1\rangle$ (see Fig. 6). Similar to the rotational cooling schemes, 174 $|X_10^+,v\rangle \rightarrow |X_21,v\rangle$ must also be coupled, and this is accomplished via the Q branch. However, 175 because there is no Q branch transition for I = 0, we must include R(0) of each vibrational level. As 176 the $X_10^+ \rightarrow X_21$ transitions only span ~100 cm⁻¹ for v = 1 to v = 7 and the rotational spacing is 177 large, a spectral mask blocking unwanted frequencies from a tightly focused broadband QCL should 178 be sufficient. 179

The vibrational overtone $v = 0 \rightarrow v' = 8$ of TeH⁺ has been proposed for a search for varying μ [14]. Cooling vibrational levels v < 8 requires a bandwidth of ~400 cm⁻¹ in the 685-705 nm range. It is in principle possible to cover exclusively all of the vibrational repump transitions with a supercontinuum laser source. Saturating the weakly-coupled off diagonal transitions, however, will require a spectral intensity of >100 W mm⁻²/ cm⁻¹ which is currently not commercially available. Another option is to use multiple narrower, but still broad laser sources, since each set of relevant P branch transitions span ~20 cm⁻¹ per vibrational level.

187 4. Rate equation simulation

The population distribution as a function of time for different laser cooling schemes was 188 simulated using an Einstein A and B coefficient model similar to that used previously [15,16,22]. 189 The simulation includes up to 864 total states in the set of states including $|X_10^+, v \le 9, J \le 15\rangle$, 190 $|X_21, v \le 7, J \le 15, +/-\rangle, |a2, v \le 8, J \le 15, +/-\rangle, \text{ and } |b0^+, v \le 9, J \le 15\rangle$ to accurately model 191 vibrational cascades and vibrational cooling. The model ignores hyperfine structure and Zeeman 192 states are treated as degenerate with their multiplicities accounted for in the Einstein coefficients. 193 The full set of spontaneous and stimulated rates are described by an 864×864 matrix that can be 194 represented as the sum of a matrix composed exclusively of A coefficients and a separate matrix using 195 B coefficients. The Einstein A coefficients were calculated using LEVEL 16. The B coefficients are 196

8 of 15



Figure 7. Simulation results for the $|X_10^+, v = 0, J = 0\rangle$ population versus cooling time, beginning from a 293 K thermal distribution.

calculated assuming a background blackbody temperature of 293 K and adding the contribution of the input spectral intensity of unpolarized laser sources at every transition wavelength. In this way all possible incoherent coupling between states is included. Each laser source is described assuming a Gaussian line shape with a given spectral width that is modified by a spectral mask if necessary. In Fig. 7 we plot the fractional population of $|X_10^+, v = 0, J = 0\rangle$ as a function of time under various rotational cooling schemes beginning from a 293 K Boltzmann distribution at t = 0.

The simplest 600 nm cooling scheme uses three lasers: (1) a 100 mW, 1 cm⁻¹ broad QCL 203 coupling X_10^+ and X_21 , (2) a 50 mW, 100 cm⁻¹ broad laser source with 3 cm⁻¹ spectral cutoff 204 before the $|X_21, v = 0\rangle \rightarrow |b0^+, v = 0\rangle$ P(1) transition, and (3) a 3 mW CW laser saturating the 205 $|X_21, v = 0, J = 1, +\rangle \rightarrow |b0^+, v = 0, J = 1, -\rangle$ transition. The results of this combination are given 206 by the solid blue line in Fig. 7. As seen in the figure, cooling in this scheme involves two primary 207 time scales. The first time scale is the rapid cooling of rotations for the population that remains in the 208 vibrational ground state during cooling. This results in \sim 85% of the population in the ground state 209 after 25 ms. The remaining population is primarily the consequence of off-diagonal decay into v = 1210 and will slowly relax on the time scale of the v = 1 lifetime (205 ms) such that >99% is in the ground 211 state after 1 s. The dashed blue line in Fig. 7 is the result of our cooling simulation when we add a 212 vibrational repump on $|X_21, v = 1, I = 1, -\rangle \rightarrow |b0^+, v = 0, I = 0, +\rangle$. As the rotational cooling laser 213 is still effective in the excited vibrational state, driving this lone transition is able to efficiently repump 214 $|b0^+, v = 0\rangle$ such that the slower time scale is no longer present. 215

In the 1300 nm cooling schemes we observe a significant reduction in the cooling rate compared 216 to the 600 nm schemes. The simplest and slowest 1300 nm scheme (solid red line Fig. 7) uses only 217 two lasers: (1) the same QCL used in the optical scheme and (2) a 5 W (unfocused) 50 cm⁻¹ broad 218 O-band telecom laser covering the $X_2 1 \rightarrow a2$ P and Q branch with a 3 cm⁻¹ spectral cutoff before the R 219 branch. As expected, ground state preparation time is dominated by the slow $|X_21, J = 1\rangle$ branching 220 time into $|X_10^+, J=0\rangle$. For the two red dashed lines in Fig. 7 we add the CW lasers connecting X₂1 221 to $b0^+$ to the IR cooling scheme as described previously. The longer dashed line shows the results 222 with a laser tuned to $|X_21, J = 1, +\rangle \rightarrow |b0^+, J = 1, -\rangle$. The shorter dashed line shows how we recover 223 cooling rates in line with our naive estimate by adding a laser on $|X_21, J = 2, +\rangle \rightarrow |b0^+, J = 1, -\rangle$ 224 and removing the inefficient contribution of the $X_2 1 \rightarrow a2$ Q branch. 225

5. State Preparation During Spectroscopy Cycle

In a μ variation experiment where we perform repeated measurements on the same molecule, the population distribution will be non-thermal after the spectroscopy transition is driven. We model the scenario where the spectroscopy transition is $|X_10^+, v = 0, J = 0\rangle \rightarrow |X_10^+, v', J' = 1\rangle$, and the spectroscopy probe time is similar to the upper state lifetime τ . To optimize the cooling protocol for

each choice of v', we conservatively consider that spontaneous emission from the upper state occurred 231 at t = 0, and the population subsequently evolved for a time τ . After this simulated evolution, we 232 vibrationally cool and then rotationally cool before the next spectroscopy cycle. It is important to separate the two cooling stages, since simultaneous application of vibrational and rotational cooling 234 lasers will couple separate lower states to the same excited state. This coupling would have the 235 unintended consequence of temporarily pumping the population into higher rovibrational states. (We 236 note that the narrowband vibrational repumping scheme for clearing population from v = 1 avoids 237 this issue by exclusively pumping to $|b0^+, v = 0, J = 0\rangle$, a state to which the rotational cooling lasers do not couple because of where we place the spectral cutoff.) 239

The cooling time for the vibrational cooling stage is determined by minimizing the following expression:

$$\frac{\tau + T_{\rm VC}}{\rho_{\nu=0}(T_{\rm VC})},\tag{1}$$

where τ is the interrogation time (assumed to be equal to the excited state lifetime), T_{VC} is the amount of time the vibrational cooling lasers are on, and $\rho_{v=0}(t)$ is the fraction of the population in v = 0at time t. Vibrational cooling was simulated assuming broadband coverage approximately at the saturation intensity of the relevant $|X_21, v\rangle \rightarrow |b0^+, v - 1\rangle$ transitions. The cooling times for the first 8 excited vibrational states can be seen in Table 1. In every case the vibrational cooling lasers pumped >99% of the population into the ground vibrational state. It is noteworthy that vibrational cooling will not contribute significantly to the overall duty cycle as $T_{VC} << \tau$ for any choice of vibrational state.

Assuming the rotational cooling stage is applied for time T_{RC} , the average time for a successful experimental cycle is estimated to be

$$T_{\rm c} = 2 \frac{T_p + \tau + T_{\rm VC} + T_{\rm RC}}{\rho_{I=0}(T_{\rm RC})},\tag{2}$$

where T_p is the total time necessary for state readout and hyperfine state preparation, the term $\rho_{J=0}(t)$ is the fraction of the population in $|X_10^+, v = 0, J = 0\rangle$ at time *t* after the start of the rotational cooling stage, and the factor of 2 arises from needing to measure two points to estimate the offset from line center. The optimal rotational cooling time will thus be the time that minimizes T_c .

6. μ variation measurement

In a Ramsey measurement on a single ion, the Allan deviation is given by

$$\sigma_y(T) = \frac{1}{C\Omega T_R} \sqrt{\frac{T_c}{2T}},$$
(3)

where *C* is the fringe visibility, T_R is the Ramsey time, T_c is the cycle time, and *T* is the total measurement time [37,38]. Optimal cycling occurs for $T_c = 2T_R$ and T_R set to about the upper state lifetime τ , for which $C \approx 0.6$ [37]. Laser cooling of the internal molecular state opens up the possibility for efficient state preparation, which can allow for repeated interrogation of the same molecular sample and low dead time. To evaluate the benefit of laser cooling in TeH⁺ we estimate the statistical sensitivity to $\Delta \mu$ when using various laser cooling schemes and different vibrational overtone transitions.

The vibrational interval from v = 0 to v' = n at frequency Ω will vary in response to changing μ as described by

$$\Delta \Omega = S \frac{\Delta \mu}{\mu}.$$
 (4)

10 of 15

п	au (ms)	$\Omega/(2\pi)$	$S/(2\pi)$	$T_{\rm VC}~({\rm ms})$
1	210	62	30	0
2	110	120	58	1.0
3	85	180	83	1.2
4	70	230	110	1.4
5	61	290	130	1.6
6	53	340	140	1.7
7	47	380	160	1.9
8	41	430	170	2.0

Table 1. Properties of vibrational transitions $v = 0 \rightarrow v' = n$. T_{VC} is the simulated optimal cooling time for vibrational cooling. $\Omega/(2\pi)$ and $S/(2\pi)$ are in units of THz.

Before statistics are considered, the absolute sensitivity coefficient $S = \partial \Omega / \partial (\ln \mu)$ provides the most important figure of merit for the transition, since it expresses the shift in the measured frequency [39,40]. It is also convenient to define a relative sensitivity coefficient K_{μ} [10] given by

$$\frac{\Delta\Omega}{\Omega} = K_{\mu} \frac{\Delta\mu}{\mu}.$$
(5)

We must also account for detrimental statistical effects of the finite upper state lifetime. Fluctuations in the frequency measurements are described by an Allan deviation $\sigma_y(T)$ for some overall measurement time *T*. The vibrational frequency measurements yield values for μ itself (albeit with a large theoretical uncertainty), and the square root of the two-sample variance in μ is

$$\sigma_y^{(\mu)}(T) = \frac{\sigma_y(T)}{|K_\mu|}.$$
(6)

Statistical uncertainty in μ variation can be related to $\sigma_y^{(\mu)}(T)$, with numerical factors depending on details of the experimental protocol. Further details of statistical considerations for μ variation measurements using polar molecule overtone transitions are discussed in [14].

262 6.1. Single-Ion TeH⁺ Measurement

In our simulated results for statistical sensitivity of a $\Delta \mu$ measurement using a single TeH⁺ ion, the spectroscopy interval is probed using Ramsey's method, and we take $T_{\rm R} = \tau$ and C = 0.6 [37]. Results for various state preparation schemes are shown in Fig. 8. The results suggest that spectroscopy on a single TeH⁺ ion can be used for a significantly improved search for varying μ .

We find that the attainable precision is most sensitive for the larger overtone transitions. The ultimate decision for which vibrational interval to choose for spectroscopy will depend on how much vibrational cooling laser power is available. In the extreme case where no vibrational cooling is used, v' = 1 is the optimal choice. At the other extreme, with enough vibrational cooling laser power to saturate all the transitions, the best simulated statistical sensitivity to $\Delta \mu$ after one day of averaging is described by $\sigma_y^{(\mu)} = 3.6 \times 10^{-17}$. For this transition, the 600 nm cooling scheme significantly outperforms the 1300 nm cooling scheme.

274 6.2. Multi-Ion Spectroscopy

Besides searching for µ variation with a single-ion QLS measurement, an alternative approach using laser coolable polar molecules is to perform multi-ion spectroscopy. Fluorescence readout is normally not possible for molecular ions, since they usually lack cycling transitions. However, for molecules that can be rapidly laser cooled, there exist quasi-cycling transitions capable of scattering enough light for fluorescence detection. Additionally, negative differential (static) polarizabilities are ubiquitous in polar molecules for transitions starting from the ground rotational state [14]. A negative

11 of 15



Figure 8. Simulation results for statistical uncertainty using various state preparation schemes, a single TeH⁺ ion and for one day of averaging. Squares represent the projection noise-limited outcome, corresponding to instantaneous state preparation with 100% fidelity. 'Optical' indicates results for rotational cooling at 600 nm, with vibrational repump (VR) included. 'IR' refers to rotational cooling at 1300 nm, with two CW assist lasers included. Diamonds indicate results without vibrational cooling, and circles indicate results with each cycle ending with vibrational cooling (VC) followed by rotational cooling.

differential polarizability allows for choosing of a magic RF trap-drive frequency such that the Stark
 shift and micromotion second order doppler shifts cancel one another [14,41].

In TeH⁺ there do exist quasi-cycling transitions amenable to state detection via fluorescence. 283 For example, population in $|X_10+, J=0\rangle$ can be left dark while $|X_10+, J=1\rangle$ can be driven in a 284 quasi-cycling scheme by using one laser driving E1 and M1 coupling between $|X_10+, I=1, -\rangle \leftrightarrow$ 285 $|X_21, J = 1, \pm \rangle$ and a second laser to couple $|X_21, J = 1, + \rangle \leftrightarrow |b0^+, J = 0, + \rangle$. The simulated results, 286 using the same QCL discussed previously for the first laser and a CW laser at saturation for the second, 287 are plotted in Fig. 9. On average there will be approximately 400 spontaneously emitted photons at a 288 rate of \sim 5 photons per ms before an off-diagonal $\Delta v > 0$ decay occurs. In a large ensemble the result 289 would be a rapid decrease in the scattering rate after \sim 80 ms. 290

291 6.3. Homonuclear Molecule Benchmarks

It is interesting to note that the logic of choosing the optimal overtone transition in TeH⁺ also sets 292 a bound on the statistical sensitivity attainable for any molecule. The strongest known chemical bond 293 is that of CO, with $D = 90,000 \text{ cm}^{-1}$ [42]. Molecular ion dissociation energies can approach this range; 294 N_2^+ and O_2^+ have $D = 54,000 \text{ cm}^{-1}$ and $D = 74,000 \text{ cm}^{-1}$, respectively. For a Morse potential, the 295 upper bound on the sensitivity S is given by D/4, where D is the dissociation energy [39]. Although 296 calculations are not generally available to describe broadening of overtone linewidths from coupling to 297 other electronic states, the measured linewidths are expected to be limited by laser coherence. Statistical 298 sensitivity of these species, using probe times set by currently available laser coherence, is shown in 299 Table 2. Stark shifts for nonpolar species are favorably small, and other systematic uncertainties can be 300 low as well [43–45]. 301

Homonuclear molecules can be loaded into the trap in the desired quantum state [46,47], and one can imagine an experimental cycle approaching zero dead time using a quantum logic protocol. Simple projective measurements within the two-level manifold can be used to reset to the lower spectroscopy state at the beginning of each cycle [25]. Trapped N₂⁺ prepared in its ground rotational state lifetime has been demonstrated to have lifetimes as long as 15 minutes, limited by the collisions with background gas [48]. After a collision changes the rotational state, a new molecule could be

12 of 15



Figure 9. The total number of photon scatters from $|b0^+, v = 0, J = 0\rangle$ as a function of time, in the two-laser fluorescence state detection scheme described in the text.

Table 2. Benchmark candidates for μ variation measurement. The upper vibrational states *n* that maximize the absolute sensitivities are calculated from molecular constants [51], and achievable precision for zero dead time, *C* = 0.6, an averaging time *T* = 1 day, and a coherence time of 6 s [52]. $\Omega/(2\pi)$ and $S/(2\pi)$ are in units of THz.

	п	$\Omega/(2\pi)$	$S/(2\pi)$	$\sigma_y^{(\mu)}(1 \text{ day})/10^{-19}$
N_2^+	33	1700	540	6.7
O_2^{\mp}	28	1200	390	9.1

loaded. Alternatively, one could use a quantum logic state preparation approach that sequentially
transfers population from all possible populated states [49,50]. In the latter approach, the problem
of recovery of the pre-collision parity must also be addressed, possibly by two-photon excitation
of a short-lifetime electronic transition and then cleanup of resulting vibrational excitation. Since
either state recovery approach might be time consuming, it could be preferable to operate at cryogenic
temperatures to reduce the rate of collision with background gases.

Comparing the ideal zero dead time performance of TeH⁺ and the homonuclear benchmarks in Table 2, we find that the best TeH⁺ statistical uncertainty is nearly two orders of magnitude larger. However, since simpler optical pumping state preparation is available for TeH⁺, its experimental statistical uncertainty should be less sensitive to the vacuum environment. Furthermore, the quasi-cycling transitions of TeH⁺ or other polar species offers the possibility of fluorescence readout in multi-ion spectroscopy.

320 7. Conclusions

We have identified vibrational overtone transitions in TeH⁺ as candidates for a spectroscopic 321 search for varying μ , taking advantage of the optical pumping protocols for state preparation. Rate 322 equation simulations show that TeH⁺ can be optically pumped from room temperature to the rotational 323 ground state in ~ 100 ms using telecom wavelengths or ~ 10 ms using optical wavelengths. In an 324 overtone spectroscopy experiment, we find that realistically achievable experimental cycle times yield 325 a statistical uncertainty as low as 4×10^{-17} for a day of averaging. This demonstrates the possibility 326 for significant improvement on the best laboratory limit of $\sim 1 \times 10^{-16}/\text{yr}$ [11,12] and the current 327 limit set by a molecule at 6×10^{-14} /yr [13]. 328

We primarily limited our investigation to the performance of single ion spectroscopy using quantum logic, but simulations also support the potential for fluorescence state read-out of TeH⁺. Preprints (www.preprints.org) | NOT PEER-REVIEWED | Posted: 12 July 2018

Peer-reviewed version available at Atoms **2018**, 6, 53; <u>doi:10.3390/atoms60300</u>

13 of 15

- Large Coulomb crystals of polar molecules, with state detection performed by fluorescence, could have
- ³³² favorably small systematic uncertainties because negative differential polarizabilities can allow for
- cancellation of Stark and second-order Doppler shifts [41]. Our analysis suggests that the possibility of
- searching for μ variation using multi-ion spectroscopy on laser-coolable polar species warrants further
- 335 investigation.
- Acknowledgments: We thank Vincent Carrat for helpful discussions about laser sources. This work was supported
 by ONR Grant No. N00014-17-1-2258, ARO Grant No. W911NF-14-0378, and NSF GRFP DGE-1324585.
- Author Contributions: A. O.-F. and F.O. calculated the potential energy curves and transition moments; P.S. M.K.
 and B.O. developed the rotational cooling ideas and performed the cooling simulations.
- Conflicts of Interest: The authors declare no conflict of interest.MDPI Multidisciplinary Digital Publishing Institute
- DOAJ Directory of open access journals
 - TLA Three letter acronym
 - LD linear dichroism

342

- Uzan, J.P. The fundamental constants and their variation: observational and theoretical status. *Rev. Mod. Phys.* 2003, 75, 403.
- Calmet, X.; Keller, M. Cosmological evolution of fundamental constants: From theory to experiment. *Mod. Phys. Lett. A* 2015, 30, 1540028.
- Fritzsch, H.; Sola, J. Fundamental constants and cosmic vacuum: the micro and macro connection. *Mod. Phys. Lett. A* 2015, 30, 1540034.
- Stadnik, Y.; Flambaum, V. Can dark matter induce cosmological evolution of the fundamental constants of Nature? *Phys. Rev. Lett.* 2015, 115, 201301.
- Roberts, B.M.; Derevianko, A. Precision measurement noise asymmetry and its annual modulation as a dark matter signature. *arXiv:1803.00617 [physics.atom-ph]* 2018.
- Flambaum, V.; Kozlov, M. Limit on the Cosmological Variation of m p/m e from the Inversion Spectrum of
 Ammonia. *Phys. Rev. Lett.* 2007, *98*, 240801.
- Flambaum, V.; Kozlov, M. Enhanced sensitivity to the time variation of the fine-structure constant and m
 p/m e in diatomic molecules. *Phys. Rev. Lett.* 2007, *99*, 150801.
- Calmet, X.; Fritzsch, H. The cosmological evolution of the nucleon mass and the electroweak coupling
 constants. *Eur. Phys. J. C* 2001, 24, 639–642.
- 9. Flambaum, V.V.; Leinweber, D.B.; Thomas, A.W.; Young, R.D. Limits on variations of the quark masses,
 QCD scale, and fine structure constant. *Phys. Rev. D* 2004, *69*, 115006.
- Jansen, P.; Bethlem, H.L.; Ubachs, W. Perspective: Tipping the scales: Search for drifting constants from
 molecular spectra. *The Journal of Chemical Physics* 2014, 140, 010901.
- Huntemann, N.; Lipphardt, B.; Tamm, C.; Gerginov, V.; Weyers, S.; Peik, E. Improved limit on a temporal
 variation of m p/m e from comparisons of Yb+ and Cs atomic clocks. *Phys. Rev. Lett.* 2014, *113*, 210802.
- Godun, R.; Nisbet-Jones, P.; Jones, J.; King, S.; Johnson, L.; Margolis, H.; Szymaniec, K.; Lea, S.; Bongs, K.;
 Gill, P. Frequency Ratio of Two Optical Clock Transitions in \$^{171}{\mathrm{Yb}}^{171}{\mathrm{Yb}}^{+}\$ and Constraints
 on the Time Variation of Fundamental Constants. *Phys. Rev. Lett.* 2014, *113*, 210801.
- Shelkovnikov, A.; Butcher, R.J.; Chardonnet, C.; Amy-Klein, A. Stability of the proton-to-electron mass
 ratio. *Phys. Rev. Lett.* 2008, 100, 150801.
- Kokish, M.G.; Stollenwerk, P.R.; Kajita, M.; Odom, B.C. Optical Frequency Trapped Ion Probe for a Varying
 Proton-to-Electron Mass Ratio. *arXiv:1710.08589 [physics.atom-ph]* 2017.
- Nguyen, J.; Odom, B. Prospects for Doppler cooling of three-electronic-level molecules. *Phys. Rev. A* 2011, 83, 053404.
- 16. Nguyen, J.H.; Viteri, C.R.; Hohenstein, E.G.; Sherrill, C.D.; Brown, K.R.; Odom, B. Challenges of laser-cooling molecular ions. *New J. Phys.* **2011**, *13*, 063023.
- 376 17. Stollenwerk, P.R.; Odom, B.C.; Kokkin, D.L.; Steimle, T. Electronic spectroscopy of a cold SiO+ sample:
 377 Implications for optical pumping. *J. Mol. Spectrosc.* 2017, 332, 26–32.

14 of 15

378	18.	Kang, S.Y.; Kuang, F.G.; Jiang, G.; Li, D.B.; Luo, Y.; Feng-Hui, P.; Li-Ping, W.; Hu, W.Q.; Shao, Y.C. Ab initio
379		study of laser cooling of AIF+ and AlCl+ molecular ions. J. Phys. B: At., Mol. Opt. Phys. 2017, 50, 105103.
380	19.	Zhang, Q.Q.; Yang, C.L.; Wang, M.S.; Ma, X.G.; Liu, W.W. The ground and low-lying excited states and
381		feasibility of laser cooling for GaH+ and InH+ cations. Spectrochim. Acta, Part A 2018, 193, 78–86.
382	20.	Zhang, Q.Q.; Yang, C.L.; Wang, M.S.; Ma, X.G.; Liu, W.W. Spectroscopic parameters of the low-lying
383		electronic states and laser cooling feasibility of NH+ cation and NH- anion. Spectrochim. Acta, Part A 2017,
384		185, 365–370.
385	21.	Schmidt, P.O.; Rosenband, T.; Langer, C.; Itano, W.M.; Bergquist, J.C.; Wineland, D.J. Spectroscopy using
386		quantum logic. <i>Science</i> 2005 , 309, 749–752.
387	22.	Staanum, P.F.; Højbjerre, K.; Skyt, P.S.; Hansen, A.K.; Drewsen, M. Rotational laser cooling of vibrationally
388		and translationally cold molecular ions. Nat. Phys. 2010, 6, 271–274.
389	23.	Schneider, T.; Roth, B.; Duncker, H.; Ernsting, I.; Schiller, S. All-optical preparation of molecular ions in the
390		rovibrational ground state. Nat. Phys. 2010, 6, 275–278.
391	24.	Lien, C.Y.; Seck, C.M.; Lin, Y.W.; Nguyen, J.H.V.; Tabor, D.A.; Odom, B.C. Broadband optical cooling of
392		molecular rotors from room temperature to the ground state. Nat. Commun. 2014, 5, 4783.
393	25.	Chou, C.w.; Kurz, C.; Hume, D.B.; Plessow, P.N.; Leibrandt, D.R.; Leibfried, D. Preparation and coherent
394		manipulation of pure quantum states of a single molecular ion. <i>Nature</i> 2017, 545, 203–207.
395	26.	Gonçalves dos Santos, L.; de Oliveira-Filho, A.G.S.; Ornellas, F.R. The electronic states of TeH+: A
396		theoretical contribution. The Journal of chemical physics 2015, 142, 024316.
397	27.	Lien, C.Y.; Williams, S.R.; Odom, B. Optical pulse-shaping for internal cooling of molecules. Phys. Chem.
398		Chem. Phys. 2011, 13, 18825–18829.
399	28.	Alekseyev, A.B.; Liebermann, H.P.; Lingott, R.M.; Bludsky, O.; Buenker, R.J. The spectrum of antimony
400		hydride: An ab initio configuration interaction study employing a relativistic effective core potential. J.
401		Chem. Phys. 1998 , 108, 7695–7706.
402	29.	Shestakov, O.; Gielen, R.; Pravilov, A.; Setzer, K.; Fink, E. J. Mol. Spectrosc. 1998, 191, 199–205.
403	30.	Beutel, M.; Setzer, K.; Shestakov, O.; Fink, E. J. Mol. Spectrosc. 1996, 179, 79 – 84.
404	31.	Yu, S.; Fu, D.; Shayesteh, A.; Gordon, I.E.; Appadoo, D.R.; Bernath, P. Infrared and near infrared emission
405		spectra of SbH and SbD. J. Mol. Spectrosc. 2005, 229, 257–265.
406	32.	de Lima Batista, A.P.; de Oliveira-Filho, A.G.S.; Ornellas, F.R. Excited electronic states, transition
407		probabilities, and radiative lifetimes of CAs: a theoretical contribution and challenge to experimentalists. J.
408		<i>Phys. Chem. A</i> 2011 , <i>115</i> , 8399–8405. doi:10.1021/jp204497p.
409	33.	Yang, J.; Clouthier, D.J. Electronic spectroscopy of the previously unknown arsenic carbide (AsC) free
410		radical. J. Chem. Phys. 2011, 135, 054309. doi:10.1063/1.3618955.
411	34.	Le Roy, R.J. LEVEL: A computer program for solving the radial Schrödinger equation for bound and
412		quasibound levels. J. Quant. Spectrosc. Radiat. Transfer 2017, 186, 167–178.
413	35.	Werner, H.J.; Knowles, P.J.; Knizia, G.; Manby, F.R.; Schütz, M.; others. MOLPRO, version 2015.1, a package
414		of ab initio programs, 2015.
415	36.	Viteau, M.; Chotia, A.; Allegrini, M.; Boulouta, N.; Dulieu, O.; Comparat, D.; Pillet, P. Optical pumping
416	07	and vibrational cooling of molecules. <i>Science</i> 2008 , <i>321</i> , <i>232–234</i> .
417	37.	Riis, E.; Sinclair, A.G. Optimum measurement strategies for trapped ion optical frequency standards. J.
418	20	Phys. B: At., Mol. Opt. Phys. 2004, 37, 4719.
419	38.	Hollberg, L.; Oates, C.W.; Curtis, E.A.; Ivanov, E.N.; Diddams, S.A.; Udem, T.; Robinson, H.G.; Bergquist,
420		J.C.; Kafac, K.J.; Itano, W.M.; others. Optical frequency standards and measurements. <i>IEEE J. Quantum</i> .
421	20	Electron. 2001, 37 , $1502-1513$.
422	39.	DeMille, D.; Sainis, S.; Sage, J.; Bergeman, I.; Kotochigova, S.; Hesinga, E. Enhanced sensitivity to variation
423	40	of m e/m p in molecular spectra. <i>Phys. Rev. Lett.</i> 2008 , 100, 043202.
424	40.	Zelevinsky, I.; Kotocnigova, S.; Ye, J. Precision lest of Mass-Katio Variations with Lattice-Confined
425	<i>1</i> 1	Unracola Molecules. Phys. Rev. Lett. 2008, 100, 045201.
426	41.	ATTIOIU, N., Hajiyev, E.; Faez, E.; Lee, C.H.; Darrett, WI.; Dollinger, J. Prospects for atomic clocks based on
427	10	large 1011 Crystals. Flys. Nev. A 2013, 32, 032100.
428	4∠.	Luo, 1.K. Comprenensive nunuvook oj chemicui vonu energies; CKC press, 2007.

- 420 43. Kajita, M. Evaluation of variation in \left (m_\mathrm $\{p\}/m_\mathrm \{e\}\right)$ mp/me from the 430 frequency difference between the $\{\{\}^{15}\hox \{N\}_{2}\}^{+}\}$ 15 N2+ and $\{\}^{87}\hox \{Sr\}$ 87 Sr 431 transitions. *Appl. Phys. B* **2016**, 122, 203.
- 432 44. Kajita, M.; Gopakumar, G.; Abe, M.; Hada, M.; Keller, M. Test of m p/m e changes using vibrational
 433 transitions in N 2+. *Phys. Rev. A* 2014, *89*, 032509.
- 434 45. Kajita, M. Accuracy estimation of the O 2 16+ transition frequencies targeting the search for the variation
 435 in the proton-electron mass ratio. *Phys. Rev. A* 2017, 95, 023418.
- 436 46. Tong, X.; Winney, A.H.; Willitsch, S. Sympathetic cooling of molecular ions in selected rotational and
 437 vibrational states produced by threshold photoionization. *Phys. Rev. Lett.* 2010, 105, 143001.
- 438 47. Loh, H.; Stutz, R.P.; Yahn, T.S.; Looser, H.; Field, R.W.; Cornell, E.A. REMPI spectroscopy of HfF. *J. Mol.* 439 Spectrosc. 2012, 276, 49–56.
- 440 48. Tong, X.; Wild, D.; Willitsch, S. Collisional and radiative effects in the state-selective preparation of 441 translationally cold molecular ions in ion traps. *Phys. Rev. A* **2011**, *83*, 023415.
- 442 49. Ding, S.; Matsukevich, D. Quantum logic for the control and manipulation of molecular ions using a
 443 frequency comb. *New J. Phys.* 2012, *14*, 023028.
- 50. Leibfried, D. Quantum state preparation and control of single molecular ions. New J. Phys. 2012, 14, 023029.
- ⁴⁴⁵ 51. Laher, R.R.; Gilmore, F.R. Improved fits for the vibrational and rotational constants of many states of ⁴⁴⁶ nitrogen and oxygen. *J. Phys. Chem. Ref. Data* **1991**, *20*, 685–712.
- ⁴⁴⁷ 52. Bishof, M.; Zhang, X.; Martin, M.J.; Ye, J. Optical Spectrum Analyzer with Quantum-Limited Noise Floor.
 ⁴⁴⁸ *Phys. Rev. Lett.* 2013, 111, 093604.