

Review

Not peer-reviewed version

Advanced Routing Protocols for Underwater Wireless Sensor Networks: Energy Optimization and Quality of Service Enhancement

Li Wenhao , Huang Qiming , Chen Yufei ^{*} , Zhang Meiling , Liu Rong

Posted Date: 26 August 2025

doi: 10.20944/preprints202508.0998.v2

Keywords: underwater wireless sensor networks; routing protocols; energy optimization; quality of service; fuzzy logic; network lifetime; marine communication; IoT networks; metaheuristic optimization



Preprints.org is a free multidisciplinary platform providing preprint service that is dedicated to making early versions of research outputs permanently available and citable. Preprints posted at Preprints.org appear in Web of Science, Crossref, Google Scholar, Scilit, Europe PMC.

Copyright: This open access article is published under a Creative Commons CC BY 4.0 license, which permit the free download, distribution, and reuse, provided that the author and preprint are cited in any reuse.

Disclaimer/Publisher's Note: The statements, opinions, and data contained in all publications are solely those of the individual author(s) and contributor(s) and not of MDPI and/or the editor(s). MDPI and/or the editor(s) disclaim responsibility for any injury to people or property resulting from any ideas, methods, instructions, or products referred to in the content.

Review

Advanced Routing Protocols for Underwater Wireless Sensor Networks: Energy Optimization and Quality of Service Enhancement

Li Wenhao ¹, Huang Qiming ¹, Chen Yufei ¹, Zhang Meiling ² and Liu Rong ^{3,*}

- ¹ Department of Computer Science, Tsinghua University, Beijing, China
- ² School of Information Science and Technology, Fudan University, Shanghai, China
- ³ School of Computer Science and Technology, Harbin Institute of Technology, Harbin, China
- * Correspondence: liurong@asmail.cn

Abstract

Underwater Wireless Sensor Networks (UWSNs) represent a paradigmatic shift in marine exploration and monitoring technologies, enabling unprecedented scientific research and industrial applications in aquatic environments. The unique challenges posed by underwater communication, including severely limited bandwidth, substantial propagation delays, stringent energy constraints, and highly dynamic network topologies, necessitate the development of sophisticated routing protocols specifically tailored for these harsh operating conditions. This comprehensive survey examines the state-of-the-art in advanced routing protocols designed for UWSNs, with particular emphasis on energy optimization strategies and Quality of Service (QoS) enhancement mechanisms. We systematically analyze contemporary routing methodologies spanning fuzzy logic-based decision systems, machine learning approaches, bio-inspired optimization algorithms, and hybrid multi-objective techniques. Through exhaustive examination of research developments from 2018 to 2025, we establish a comprehensive taxonomy of routing strategies, evaluate critical performance metrics, and identify fundamental design principles that govern effective underwater routing protocols. Our analytical findings demonstrate that hybrid approaches integrating fuzzy logic with metaheuristic optimization algorithms consistently achieve superior performance across multiple dimensions, including energy efficiency improvements of 15-40%, packet delivery ratio enhancements of 10-25%, and significant network lifetime extensions. We provide detailed comparative analyses through comprehensive tabular summaries, introduce novel performance benchmarking frameworks, and establish a roadmap for future research directions in next-generation UWSN routing architectures.

Keywords: Underwater wireless sensor networks; routing protocols; energy optimization; quality of service; fuzzy logic; network lifetime; marine communication; IoT networks; metaheuristic optimization

I. Introduction

The exponential growth of underwater exploration activities and marine environmental monitoring requirements has catalyzed the development of Underwater Wireless Sensor Networks (UWSNs) as a fundamental enabling technology for oceanic research and industrial applications. These sophisticated network systems facilitate critical operations spanning oceanographic data collection, environmental pollution monitoring, offshore oil and gas exploration, disaster prevention and response, underwater navigation assistance, and marine ecosystem preservation efforts [1]. The strategic importance of UWSNs extends beyond scientific applications to encompass national security considerations, maritime border surveillance, and submarine communication systems, with recent advances in 6G underwater communication technologies further expanding their potential applications [18].

The operational environment of UWSNs presents a constellation of unique challenges that fundamentally distinguish these networks from their terrestrial counterparts. The underwater acoustic communication medium exhibits characteristics that severely constrain network design and protocol development. Acoustic waves, serving as the primary communication mechanism in underwater environments, propagate at approximately 1,500 meters per second, representing a five-order-of-magnitude reduction compared to electromagnetic wave propagation in terrestrial wireless networks [14]. This fundamental physical limitation introduces substantial propagation delays that can range from milliseconds to several seconds, depending on communication distances, thereby affecting real-time applications and time-sensitive protocol operations.

Recent technological breakthroughs in underwater acoustic modems and signal processing techniques have begun to address some of these limitations, with new hybrid acoustic-optical communication systems showing promise for short-range high-bandwidth applications [19]. Additionally, the integration of artificial intelligence-driven adaptive modulation schemes has demonstrated significant improvements in communication reliability under varying environmental conditions.

The bandwidth limitations inherent in underwater acoustic channels represent another critical constraint, with available frequency spectrum typically restricted to ranges from a few hertz to several hundred kilohertz. This severe bandwidth limitation directly impacts data transmission rates, network capacity, and the overall throughput achievable by underwater communication systems [13]. Furthermore, the underwater acoustic channel exhibits frequency-dependent attenuation characteristics, multipath propagation effects, Doppler frequency shifts due to water currents and node mobility, and ambient noise interference from marine life and human activities.

Energy optimization emerges as perhaps the most critical challenge in UWSN design and deployment. Underwater sensor nodes typically operate on battery power with extremely limited opportunities for energy replenishment due to the harsh and often inaccessible deployment environments. The energy consumption characteristics of underwater acoustic modems significantly exceed those of radio frequency transceivers used in terrestrial networks, primarily due to the higher power requirements for acoustic signal generation and processing [7]. Recent advances in energy harvesting technologies, including thermal gradient exploitation and piezoelectric wave energy conversion, offer promising solutions for extending operational lifetimes, though these technologies remain in early development stages for underwater applications.

Quality of Service (QoS) requirements in UWSNs encompass multiple interdependent performance dimensions that must be simultaneously optimized. These include packet delivery ratio as a measure of network reliability, end-to-end delay for time-sensitive applications, network throughput for data-intensive monitoring tasks, and overall system reliability in the face of node failures and environmental disturbances [16]. The dynamic nature of underwater environments, characterized by water currents, marine life interference, temperature and salinity variations, and seasonal changes, demands adaptive routing protocols capable of maintaining consistent QoS levels under varying operational conditions.

Recent technological advances have witnessed the emergence of intelligent routing approaches that leverage sophisticated decision-making algorithms to address the complex optimization challenges inherent in UWSN design. Fuzzy logic-based systems have demonstrated particular effectiveness in handling the uncertainty and imprecise information characteristic of underwater environments [15]. Machine learning algorithms enable adaptive routing decisions based on historical network performance data and environmental conditions. Bio-inspired optimization techniques offer robust solutions for multi-objective optimization problems encountered in underwater routing protocol design.

The integration of Internet of Things (IoT) paradigms with underwater sensor networks has opened new possibilities for comprehensive marine monitoring systems that seamlessly connect underwater sensing capabilities with terrestrial communication infrastructure [12]. This convergence presents

both opportunities for enhanced functionality and challenges related to protocol interoperability, data integration, and cross-domain security considerations.

This comprehensive survey provides an in-depth analysis of advanced routing protocols specifically designed for UWSNs, with focused examination of energy optimization strategies and QoS enhancement mechanisms. Our research contributions encompass several key areas that advance the current understanding of underwater routing protocol design and optimization.

First, we establish a comprehensive taxonomy of contemporary UWSN routing protocols based on their fundamental design principles, optimization objectives, and implementation methodologies. This taxonomic framework facilitates systematic comparison and evaluation of different routing approaches while identifying common design patterns and optimization strategies.

Second, we conduct detailed analysis of energy optimization techniques employed in state-of-the-art routing protocols, examining both theoretical foundations and practical implementation considerations. This analysis includes evaluation of clustering strategies, power control mechanisms, sleep scheduling approaches, and energy harvesting integration techniques.

Third, we provide exhaustive examination of QoS enhancement mechanisms, analyzing how different routing protocols address reliability, delay, throughput, and fault tolerance requirements. This examination includes detailed performance comparisons based on simulation results and practical deployment experiences reported in the literature.

Fourth, we present comprehensive comparative evaluation of routing protocols published between 2018 and 2025, establishing performance benchmarks and identifying trends in protocol evolution. This evaluation considers multiple performance metrics and provides insights into the relative strengths and limitations of different approaches.

Fifth, we identify critical open research challenges that require continued investigation and propose specific research directions for future development of next-generation UWSN routing protocols. These recommendations are based on gap analysis of current capabilities and emerging application requirements.

The organization of this survey follows a logical progression that begins with fundamental concepts and builds toward advanced optimization techniques and future research directions. Section II presents the foundational characteristics and challenges specific to underwater wireless sensor networks, establishing the technical context for subsequent discussions. Section III develops a comprehensive taxonomy of advanced routing protocols, categorizing different approaches based on their core methodologies and optimization objectives. Section IV provides detailed analysis of energy optimization strategies, examining both theoretical principles and practical implementation techniques. Section V focuses on QoS enhancement mechanisms, analyzing how different protocols address various performance requirements. Section VI presents comparative analysis and performance evaluation based on published research results. Section VII discusses critical open challenges and proposes future research directions. Section VIII concludes the survey with synthesis of key findings and recommendations for continued research efforts.

II. Underwater Wireless Sensor Networks: Fundamentals and Challenges

The design and deployment of underwater wireless sensor networks require comprehensive understanding of the unique characteristics that distinguish aquatic communication environments from terrestrial wireless systems. This section provides detailed examination of fundamental UWSN concepts, architectural considerations, and the specific challenges that drive routing protocol design requirements.

A. Network Architecture and Operational Characteristics

Underwater wireless sensor networks typically employ sophisticated three-dimensional network topologies that must accommodate the complexities of aquatic environments while providing reliable data collection and transmission capabilities. The architectural design of UWSNs represents a careful

balance between functional requirements, physical constraints, and economic considerations that influence every aspect of network deployment and operation [2].

The hierarchical structure commonly employed in UWSN deployments incorporates multiple classes of network nodes, each serving specific functions within the overall system architecture. Underwater sensor nodes constitute the fundamental sensing elements, equipped with specialized transducers for environmental monitoring, acoustic modems for communication, and onboard processing capabilities for local data analysis. These nodes must operate autonomously for extended periods while maintaining communication connectivity and data quality standards.

Intermediate relay nodes serve critical functions in extending communication range and providing network connectivity in sparse deployment scenarios. These nodes typically feature enhanced communication capabilities, increased power reserves, and sophisticated routing algorithms that enable efficient data forwarding and network maintenance operations. The strategic placement of relay nodes significantly impacts overall network performance, coverage area, and operational lifetime.

Surface stations function as gateway nodes that bridge underwater networks with terrestrial communication infrastructure. These stations must handle protocol translation, data aggregation, and long-range communication with onshore monitoring facilities. The design of surface stations requires consideration of harsh marine surface conditions, including wave action, corrosion, and extreme weather events.

Autonomous Underwater Vehicles (AUVs) represent an increasingly important component of modern UWSN architectures, providing mobile data collection capabilities, network maintenance functions, and adaptive topology management. AUVs can serve as mobile sink nodes that collect data from static sensors, thereby reducing communication energy requirements and extending network operational lifetime. Recent developments in swarm robotics and coordinated AUV operations have further enhanced the potential of mobile underwater platforms for network optimization.

The three-dimensional nature of underwater deployments introduces unique considerations for network topology design and maintenance. Unlike terrestrial networks that typically operate in essentially two-dimensional space, underwater networks must account for depth variations, water column stratification effects, and three-dimensional node mobility patterns. These factors significantly complicate routing protocol design and require sophisticated algorithms for maintaining network connectivity and optimizing data transmission paths.

B. Physical Layer Constraints and Communication Challenges

The underwater acoustic communication channel presents a complex set of physical constraints that fundamentally limit network performance and drive routing protocol requirements. Understanding these limitations is essential for developing effective routing strategies that can operate within the constraints imposed by the aquatic environment.

Bandwidth limitations represent one of the most severe constraints affecting underwater communication systems. The available acoustic frequency spectrum for underwater communication typically ranges from a few hertz to several hundred kilohertz, with usable bandwidth often limited to narrow frequency bands to avoid interference and minimize power consumption [8]. This bandwidth limitation directly constrains data transmission rates, with practical systems achieving throughput ranging from hundreds of bits per second to several kilobits per second, depending on range and environmental conditions.

The frequency-dependent nature of acoustic attenuation in seawater creates complex tradeoffs between communication range, data rate, and power consumption. Higher frequencies enable higher data rates but suffer increased attenuation and reduced communication range. Lower frequencies provide extended range capability but with severely limited bandwidth and data rate constraints. This fundamental tradeoff requires routing protocols to consider frequency selection and power allocation as integral components of routing decision algorithms.

Propagation delay characteristics in underwater acoustic channels introduce timing challenges that significantly impact protocol design. The relatively slow propagation speed of acoustic waves

results in round-trip times that can exceed several seconds for long-range communications, making traditional acknowledgment-based protocols impractical for many underwater applications [4]. These delays also complicate synchronization requirements and affect the performance of contention-based medium access control protocols.

Multipath propagation effects in underwater environments create additional complexity for communication system design. Acoustic signals can propagate through multiple paths due to reflections from the sea surface, seafloor, temperature and salinity gradients, and underwater obstacles. These multipath effects can cause intersymbol interference, signal fading, and temporal dispersion that degrade communication reliability and require sophisticated signal processing techniques for mitigation.

Doppler effects introduced by water currents, node mobility, and surface wave action create frequency shifts that can disrupt communication synchronization and degrade signal quality. The magnitude of Doppler effects depends on the relative motion between communicating nodes and can be particularly severe in environments with strong currents or significant surface wave activity [10].

Ambient noise in underwater environments originates from multiple sources including marine life, shipping traffic, seismic activity, and environmental factors such as rain and wave action. This noise can significantly impact communication performance and requires adaptive algorithms that can adjust transmission parameters based on current noise conditions.

C. Energy Consumption Characteristics and Constraints

Energy management represents perhaps the most critical challenge in UWSN design, requiring comprehensive understanding of energy consumption patterns and optimization strategies. The energy constraints of underwater sensor networks are significantly more severe than those encountered in terrestrial wireless systems due to several fundamental factors that limit energy availability and increase consumption requirements.

Table 1 provides detailed analysis of energy consumption characteristics across different UWSN components and operational modes.

Table 1. Energy Consumption Analysis for UWSN Components.

Component	Operational Mode	Power Consumption	Energy Efficiency	Optimization Potential
Acoustic Modem	Transmission (Short Range)	0.5-2.0 W	Medium	High
	Transmission (Long Range)	2.0-8.0 W	Low	Very High
	Reception/Listening	0.1-0.5 W	High	Medium
	Sleep Mode	1-10 mW	Very High	Low
Processing Unit	Active Processing	0.2-1.0 W	Medium	High
	Idle State	50-200 mW	Medium	Medium
	Deep Sleep	1-5 mW	Very High	Low
Sensors	Continuous Monitoring	10-100 mW	High	Medium
	Periodic Sampling	1-20 mW	Very High	Low
	Standby Mode	0.1-2 mW	Very High	Very Low
Memory Systems	Read/Write Operations	20-100 mW	High	Low
	Retention	1-10 mW	Very High	Very Low

The energy consumption characteristics of underwater acoustic modems differ substantially from radio frequency transceivers used in terrestrial networks. Acoustic signal generation requires significantly higher power levels to achieve adequate signal-to-noise ratios for reliable communication, particularly over extended ranges. The power consumption of acoustic modems can range from hundreds of milliwatts to several watts, depending on transmission range and data rate requirements [5].

Signal processing requirements for underwater communication systems contribute additional energy overhead due to the complexity of algorithms required for channel equalization, noise mitiga-

tion, and error correction. These processing requirements can represent a significant portion of total energy consumption, particularly for nodes performing sophisticated signal processing or data fusion operations.

The harsh underwater deployment environment severely limits opportunities for energy replenishment through traditional means such as battery replacement or wired power connections. Solar energy harvesting is not feasible for submerged nodes, and other energy harvesting techniques such as thermal gradient exploitation or water current energy capture remain largely experimental and provide limited power output.

Battery technology constraints further complicate energy management in underwater applications. The combination of size and weight limitations, pressure requirements, and corrosion resistance needs restricts the selection of suitable battery technologies. Additionally, battery performance can be affected by temperature variations and pressure changes encountered in underwater environments.

The economic and logistical costs associated with underwater deployments create strong incentives for maximizing operational lifetime through energy-efficient design. The expenses related to ship time, diving operations, and specialized equipment required for underwater node deployment and maintenance can be substantial, making energy efficiency a critical factor in deployment viability.

D. Quality of Service Requirements and Challenges

Quality of Service (QoS) requirements in underwater wireless sensor networks encompass multiple interdependent performance dimensions that must be carefully balanced to meet application requirements while operating within the constraints imposed by the underwater environment. The definition and achievement of appropriate QoS levels require consideration of application-specific requirements, environmental factors, and technological limitations.

Table 2 summarizes QoS requirements for different underwater applications, highlighting the diverse performance needs across application domains.

Table 2. QoS Requirements for Different Underwater Applications.

Application Domain	Reliability Requirement	Latency Tolerance	Throughput Requirement	Energy Constraint	Priority Level
Environmental Monitoring	Medium (85-95%)	High (>10s)	Low (1-10 kbps)	High	Medium
Disaster Response	Very High (>99%)	Very Low (<1s)	Medium (10-100 kbps)	Medium	Critical
Military/Security	Extremely High (>99.9%)	Low (<5s)	High (>100 kbps)	Low	Critical
Oil & Gas Exploration	High (95-99%)	Medium (1-10s)	Medium (10-100 kbps)	High	High
Marine Biology Research	Medium (80-90%)	High (>30s)	Low (0.1-1 kbps)	Very High	Low
Underwater Navigation	High (95-99%)	Very Low (<0.5s)	Low (1-10 kbps)	Medium	High
Oceanographic Studies	Medium (85-95%)	High (>60s)	Low (0.1-5 kbps)	Very High	Medium
Industrial Monitoring	High (95-99%)	Low (1-5s)	Medium (5-50 kbps)	High	High

Reliability requirements vary significantly among different underwater applications, ranging from non-critical environmental monitoring that can tolerate occasional data loss to safety-critical applications that require extremely high reliability guarantees. The challenge of achieving high reliability in underwater networks stems from the combination of harsh environmental conditions, limited communication resources, and constraints on redundancy implementation [9].

Latency requirements present particular challenges in underwater networks due to the fundamental propagation delay limitations of acoustic communication. Applications requiring real-time or near-real-time data delivery must account for propagation delays that can range from milliseconds for short-range communications to several seconds for long-range transmissions. The variable nature of these delays due to environmental factors further complicates latency management.

Throughput requirements must be balanced against energy consumption considerations and communication reliability needs. The limited bandwidth available in underwater acoustic channels constrains achievable throughput levels, requiring careful optimization of data transmission strategies

and potential implementation of data compression or aggregation techniques to maximize effective information transfer rates.

Network availability and fault tolerance requirements are particularly challenging in underwater deployments due to the difficulty of performing maintenance operations and the potential for environmental factors to cause node failures or communication disruptions. Routing protocols must incorporate mechanisms for detecting and adapting to network topology changes while maintaining service quality for critical applications.

III. Comprehensive Taxonomy of Advanced UWSN Routing Protocols

The evolution of underwater wireless sensor network routing protocols has witnessed the emergence of sophisticated approaches that leverage advanced computational techniques to address the unique challenges of underwater communication. This section presents a comprehensive taxonomic classification of contemporary routing protocols, organized according to their fundamental design methodologies, optimization objectives, and implementation strategies.

A. Fuzzy Logic-Based Routing Paradigms

Fuzzy logic-based routing protocols have gained considerable traction in underwater network applications due to their inherent capability to handle uncertainty, imprecise information, and the complex decision-making requirements characteristic of aquatic environments. These protocols employ fuzzy inference systems to evaluate multiple network parameters simultaneously and make routing decisions that account for the inherent uncertainty in underwater communication channels.

The Enhanced Fuzzy Routing Protocol developed by Tarif et al. [15] represents a significant advancement in fuzzy logic-based underwater routing. This protocol implements a sophisticated multi-parameter optimization framework that utilizes fuzzy inference systems to simultaneously evaluate node energy levels, link quality indicators, communication distance, and network topology information. The fuzzy inference engine processes these parameters through carefully designed membership functions and rule sets that capture expert knowledge about optimal routing decisions in underwater environments.

The protocol architecture incorporates adaptive fuzzy rule modification mechanisms that enable the system to learn from network performance feedback and adjust decision-making parameters based on observed environmental conditions. This adaptive capability allows the protocol to maintain optimal performance across varying underwater conditions, including changes in water temperature, salinity, current patterns, and ambient noise levels.

Performance evaluation results demonstrate that the Enhanced Fuzzy Routing Protocol achieves significant improvements in energy efficiency, with reported energy consumption reductions of 15-20% compared to conventional routing approaches. Additionally, the protocol shows substantial improvements in packet delivery ratio, achieving 10-15% higher success rates in challenging underwater environments characterized by high mobility and variable channel conditions.

The Trust-Aware Fuzzy Logic Protocol introduced by Han et al. [9] extends fuzzy logic routing concepts by incorporating trust evaluation mechanisms that enhance network security and reliability. This protocol combines fuzzy decision-making with distributed trust management systems that evaluate node behavior patterns and communication reliability to identify potentially compromised or malfunctioning network nodes.

The trust evaluation component employs multiple metrics including packet forwarding accuracy, energy consumption patterns, and communication consistency to build comprehensive trust profiles for each network node. These trust values are then integrated into the fuzzy inference system as additional parameters for routing decisions, enabling the protocol to avoid unreliable nodes and maintain network security.

The implementation of trust-aware routing demonstrates particular effectiveness in scenarios involving node mobility, environmental interference, or potential security threats. Simulation results indicate that the trust-aware approach achieves improved network reliability and reduced vulnerability

to various attack scenarios while maintaining competitive performance in terms of energy efficiency and packet delivery success rates.

The Depth-Based Routing (DBR) enhancement proposed by Karimi et al. [8] illustrates the application of fuzzy logic techniques to improve existing routing protocols. This work demonstrates how fuzzy logic can be integrated with traditional routing approaches to achieve enhanced performance through intelligent parameter tuning and decision-making refinement.

The enhanced DBR protocol incorporates fuzzy logic controllers that dynamically adjust routing parameters based on current network conditions, including node density, traffic load, and channel quality measurements. The fuzzy logic system optimizes forwarding decisions by considering multiple factors simultaneously, including depth differences, energy consumption estimates, and expected transmission success probabilities.

Integration of Bloom filter techniques with the fuzzy logic controller provides additional optimization benefits by reducing control message overhead and improving memory efficiency. The combined approach demonstrates superior performance in terms of packet delivery ratio, energy consumption, and network lifetime compared to the original DBR protocol and other contemporary routing approaches.

B. Machine Learning and Artificial Intelligence Approaches

The integration of machine learning and artificial intelligence techniques into underwater routing protocols represents a paradigm shift toward autonomous, adaptive network management systems capable of learning from environmental conditions and optimizing performance through experience-based decision making.

Dynamic decision-making routing methods, as proposed by Tarif and Moghadam [6], exemplify the application of intelligent algorithms to underwater IoT environments. These protocols implement reinforcement learning algorithms that enable network nodes to learn optimal routing strategies through interaction with the underwater environment and feedback from communication success rates.

The learning framework incorporates multiple state variables representing current network conditions, including node energy levels, communication success rates, environmental parameters, and traffic patterns. The reinforcement learning algorithm uses this state information to select routing actions that maximize long-term network performance objectives, including energy efficiency, packet delivery success, and network lifetime.

The adaptive nature of machine learning-based protocols enables them to handle the dynamic characteristics of underwater environments more effectively than static routing algorithms. These protocols can automatically adjust to seasonal variations, changes in marine life activity patterns, variations in water conditions, and evolving traffic demands without requiring manual reconfiguration or parameter tuning.

Performance evaluation results demonstrate that machine learning-based routing protocols achieve superior adaptability and long-term performance optimization compared to conventional approaches. The learning algorithms show particular effectiveness in scenarios with high environmental variability or complex traffic patterns that challenge traditional routing methods.

Optimization-based protocols incorporating advanced search algorithms represent another significant development in intelligent underwater routing. The Tabu Search optimization approach investigated by Tarif et al. [3] demonstrates how metaheuristic optimization techniques can be applied to routing protocol parameter optimization and path selection decisions.

The Tabu Search algorithm maintains a memory structure that records previously explored routing solutions and uses this information to guide the search toward improved network configurations. This approach enables the protocol to escape local optima that might trap conventional optimization algorithms and discover routing solutions that provide superior overall network performance.

The integration of optimization algorithms with routing protocols enables comprehensive multi-objective optimization that simultaneously considers energy efficiency, communication reliability,

network lifetime, and quality of service requirements. This multi-objective approach addresses the complex tradeoffs inherent in underwater routing protocol design and provides more balanced solutions than single-objective optimization methods.

C. Bio-Inspired and Metaheuristic Optimization Techniques

Bio-inspired algorithms have demonstrated remarkable effectiveness in addressing the complex optimization challenges encountered in underwater routing protocol design. These approaches leverage principles derived from natural systems and biological processes to develop robust, adaptive solutions for network optimization problems.

Metaheuristic clustering approaches, as exemplified by the work of Subramani et al. [4], demonstrate the application of nature-inspired algorithms to optimize network clustering and routing decisions simultaneously. These protocols employ genetic algorithms, particle swarm optimization, or other metaheuristic techniques to solve the complex combinatorial optimization problems associated with cluster formation and maintenance.

The metaheuristic optimization framework addresses multiple objectives including energy consumption minimization, load balancing among cluster heads, communication range optimization, and cluster stability maintenance. The algorithm explores the solution space using population-based search strategies that maintain diversity while converging toward optimal or near-optimal solutions.

Implementation results demonstrate that metaheuristic clustering approaches achieve significant improvements in network lifetime and energy efficiency compared to conventional clustering protocols. The optimization algorithms show particular effectiveness in large-scale networks where the complexity of optimal clustering decisions exceeds the capabilities of traditional heuristic approaches.

Cooperative routing strategies represent another important category of bio-inspired protocols that leverage principles of cooperation and collaboration observed in natural systems. The cooperative energy-efficient routing protocol developed by Ahmad et al. [5] implements collaborative mechanisms that enable network nodes to work together to achieve optimal routing decisions and resource utilization.

The cooperative framework incorporates game-theoretic principles that model routing decisions as strategic interactions among network nodes. Each node makes routing decisions that consider both individual objectives and collective network welfare, leading to emergent behavior that optimizes overall network performance.

The implementation of cooperative mechanisms demonstrates substantial improvements in energy efficiency and network lifetime through better load distribution and resource sharing among network nodes. The cooperative approach shows particular effectiveness in scenarios with heterogeneous node capabilities or varying traffic demands that benefit from collaborative resource management strategies.

D. Cross-Layer and Hybrid Protocol Architectures

The complexity of underwater communication challenges has driven the development of sophisticated protocol architectures that integrate optimization techniques across multiple network layers and combine different algorithmic approaches to achieve comprehensive performance optimization.

Cross-layer optimization protocols, such as the QoS-aware routing approach developed by Faheem et al. [16], demonstrate the benefits of coordinated optimization across physical, medium access control, and network layers. These protocols implement feedback mechanisms that enable routing decisions to incorporate real-time information about channel conditions, interference levels, and physical layer performance metrics.

The cross-layer approach enables more informed routing decisions by providing access to detailed information about communication link quality, environmental conditions, and hardware capabilities. This information integration allows routing protocols to make more accurate predictions about communication success probabilities and optimize routing paths accordingly.

Implementation results demonstrate that cross-layer optimization achieves superior performance in dynamic underwater environments where channel conditions vary significantly over time and

space. The integrated approach shows particular effectiveness in scenarios with high mobility, variable environmental conditions, or demanding quality of service requirements.

Hybrid protocol architectures that combine multiple optimization techniques represent the current frontier in advanced underwater routing protocol development. These protocols integrate fuzzy logic decision-making with metaheuristic optimization, machine learning adaptation mechanisms, and cross-layer information sharing to achieve comprehensive network optimization.

The hybrid approach addresses the limitations of individual techniques by combining their complementary strengths. For example, fuzzy logic provides effective handling of uncertainty and imprecise information, while metaheuristic optimization enables exploration of complex solution spaces, and machine learning provides adaptive capabilities for handling environmental variability.

Performance evaluation results consistently demonstrate that hybrid approaches achieve superior performance across multiple metrics compared to single-technique protocols. The integration of multiple optimization strategies provides robustness against various failure modes and environmental challenges while maintaining competitive computational complexity and implementation requirements.

IV. Energy Optimization Strategies and Mechanisms

Energy optimization in underwater wireless sensor networks requires sophisticated approaches that address multiple aspects of network operation, from individual node power management to network-wide energy distribution strategies. This section provides comprehensive analysis of contemporary energy optimization techniques and their implementation in advanced routing protocols.

A. Hierarchical Energy Management and Clustering Strategies

Hierarchical network organization through intelligent clustering represents one of the most effective approaches for achieving energy optimization in large-scale underwater sensor deployments. These strategies reduce energy consumption by minimizing long-range communications, enabling data aggregation, and distributing energy consumption responsibilities across network nodes.

Table 3 provides comparative analysis of different clustering strategies and their energy optimization effectiveness.

Table 3. Clustering Strategies for Energy Optimization in UWSNs.

Clustering Strategy	Energy Savings	Scalability	Complexity	Adaptability	Best Application
Static Geographic Clustering	15-25%	Medium	Low	Low	Stable environments
Dynamic Energy-Based	25-35%	High	Medium	High	Variable energy nodes
Density-Adaptive Clustering	20-30%	High	Medium	Medium	Irregular deployments
Multi-Objective Optimization	30-45%	Very High	High	Very High	Large-scale networks
Fuzzy Logic Clustering	25-40%	High	Medium	Very High	Uncertain environments
Machine Learning-Based	35-50%	Very High	High	Extremely High	Dynamic environments
Hybrid Metaheuristic	40-55%	Very High	Very High	Extremely High	Complex networks

The energy-efficient clustering multi-hop routing protocol developed by Nguyen et al. [7] exemplifies sophisticated approaches to hierarchical energy management. This protocol implements a multi-stage optimization process that simultaneously optimizes cluster formation, cluster head selection, and intra-cluster communication patterns to minimize overall network energy consumption.

The cluster formation algorithm employs advanced optimization techniques that consider multiple factors including node energy levels, communication capabilities, geographical distribution, and expected traffic patterns. The algorithm uses iterative refinement processes that evaluate different clustering configurations and select arrangements that minimize total communication energy requirements while maintaining network connectivity and coverage objectives.

Cluster head selection mechanisms incorporate predictive algorithms that estimate the energy consumption implications of different cluster head assignments. These algorithms consider factors

such as expected data traffic volumes, communication ranges to cluster members and other cluster heads, and the remaining energy capacity of candidate nodes. The selection process aims to balance energy consumption across cluster heads while maintaining optimal communication efficiency.

The implementation of adaptive cluster maintenance mechanisms enables the protocol to respond to changes in network topology, energy availability, and traffic patterns without requiring complete network reconfiguration. These mechanisms monitor cluster performance metrics and trigger selective cluster reorganization when performance degradation is detected or when energy imbalances develop among cluster heads.

Performance evaluation results demonstrate that the hierarchical clustering approach achieves energy consumption reductions of 25-35% compared to flat routing protocols while maintaining competitive performance in terms of packet delivery ratio and end-to-end delay. The energy savings are particularly pronounced in large-scale networks where the benefits of hierarchical organization become more significant.

Data aggregation and fusion techniques implemented within the clustering framework provide additional energy optimization benefits by reducing the volume of data that must be transmitted through the network. These techniques employ statistical analysis, compression algorithms, and intelligent filtering to minimize redundant information transmission while preserving essential data quality requirements.

B. Adaptive Power Control and Transmission Optimization

Dynamic power control mechanisms enable underwater sensor nodes to optimize transmission power levels based on current communication requirements, channel conditions, and energy availability constraints. These mechanisms represent critical components of energy-efficient routing protocols that must balance communication reliability with energy conservation objectives.

Distance-adaptive power control algorithms adjust transmission power levels based on the distance to intended receivers and current channel propagation characteristics. These algorithms employ channel estimation techniques to predict the minimum power level required for successful communication and adjust transmission parameters accordingly. The implementation of predictive power control enables nodes to avoid over-transmission that wastes energy while maintaining adequate signal quality for reliable communication.

The development of sophisticated channel estimation algorithms enables more accurate power control decisions by providing detailed information about current propagation conditions. These algorithms analyze received signal characteristics, ambient noise levels, and propagation delay measurements to build comprehensive models of channel behavior that inform power control decisions.

Quality-adaptive transmission strategies implement dynamic modulation and coding schemes that optimize the tradeoff between energy consumption and communication reliability. These strategies adjust transmission parameters including modulation type, coding rate, and error correction capabilities based on current channel conditions and energy availability constraints.

The implementation of cooperative transmission techniques enables multiple nodes to collaborate in transmission processes, potentially reducing individual node energy requirements through spatial diversity and transmission power sharing. These techniques can be particularly effective in scenarios where multiple nodes have information to transmit to the same destination or where relay cooperation can reduce total transmission energy requirements.

Link quality assessment mechanisms provide essential feedback for power control algorithms by monitoring communication success rates, signal quality metrics, and error statistics. These mechanisms enable power control algorithms to adapt to changing channel conditions and optimize transmission parameters based on observed performance feedback.

C. Sleep Scheduling and Duty Cycle Optimization

Efficient sleep scheduling represents a fundamental energy conservation strategy that enables nodes to reduce energy consumption during periods of network inactivity while maintaining essential

network functions and connectivity requirements. The design of effective sleep scheduling mechanisms requires careful consideration of application requirements, network topology, and coordination complexity.

Coordinated sleep scheduling protocols implement distributed algorithms that enable network nodes to coordinate sleep periods while ensuring continuous network coverage and connectivity. These protocols must address the challenge of maintaining synchronized schedules across nodes with limited communication opportunities and potentially unreliable message delivery.

The development of traffic-aware scheduling algorithms enables nodes to optimize sleep periods based on expected data traffic patterns and application requirements. These algorithms analyze historical traffic patterns, predict future communication needs, and adjust sleep schedules to minimize energy consumption while ensuring adequate network responsiveness for anticipated traffic demands.

Adaptive duty cycle mechanisms enable nodes to dynamically adjust their active periods based on current network conditions, energy availability, and performance requirements. These mechanisms monitor network performance metrics and energy consumption patterns to optimize the balance between energy conservation and network functionality.

The implementation of hierarchical sleep scheduling approaches leverages network clustering structures to enable more efficient coordination and reduced scheduling overhead. In these approaches, cluster heads maintain more active schedules to provide network coordination functions, while cluster members implement more aggressive sleep scheduling to maximize energy conservation.

Energy harvesting integration techniques enable sleep scheduling algorithms to consider energy availability predictions when optimizing duty cycles. These techniques incorporate information about energy harvesting rates, energy storage capacity, and expected energy demands to develop scheduling strategies that maximize operational lifetime while maintaining required network functionality.

D. Energy-Aware Routing Metrics and Path Selection

The development of sophisticated energy-aware routing metrics enables routing protocols to make path selection decisions that optimize energy consumption while satisfying other network performance requirements. These metrics must capture the complex relationships between energy consumption, communication reliability, and network lifetime objectives.

Remaining energy consideration algorithms incorporate current node energy levels into routing decision processes to avoid depleting critical nodes and extend overall network operational lifetime. These algorithms implement load balancing strategies that distribute communication responsibilities across nodes with adequate energy reserves while avoiding nodes approaching energy depletion.

Predictive energy consumption models enable routing protocols to estimate the energy implications of different routing decisions and select paths that minimize total energy consumption while maintaining required communication quality. These models consider factors such as transmission power requirements, processing overhead, and expected retransmission needs to provide accurate energy consumption predictions.

Multi-hop energy optimization strategies enable routing protocols to evaluate the energy efficiency of different path lengths and routing topologies. These strategies consider the tradeoffs between single-hop high-power transmissions and multi-hop lower-power alternatives to identify routing approaches that minimize total network energy consumption.

Energy gradient routing techniques implement forwarding strategies that direct traffic toward areas of the network with higher energy availability, thereby promoting energy balance and extending network lifetime. These techniques maintain distributed information about energy availability across network regions and use this information to guide routing decisions.

Load balancing mechanisms distribute communication responsibilities across multiple network paths to prevent energy depletion of individual nodes or network regions. These mechanisms implement traffic splitting strategies that consider both energy availability and communication efficiency to optimize overall network performance and lifetime.

V. Quality of Service Enhancement Mechanisms and Strategies

Quality of Service (QoS) optimization in underwater wireless sensor networks requires comprehensive approaches that address multiple performance dimensions while operating within the severe constraints imposed by the underwater communication environment. This section examines advanced QoS enhancement mechanisms and their integration into contemporary routing protocols.

A. Reliability Enhancement and Fault Tolerance Mechanisms

Reliability represents a fundamental QoS requirement that becomes particularly challenging in underwater environments due to the harsh operating conditions, limited communication resources, and difficulty of performing network maintenance operations. Advanced routing protocols implement sophisticated mechanisms to achieve high reliability while maintaining energy efficiency and performance objectives.

Table 4 provides comprehensive analysis of reliability enhancement techniques and their effectiveness in different underwater scenarios.

Table 4. Reliability Enhancement Mechanisms for UWSN Routing Protocols.

Reliability Mechanism	Effectiveness (% Improvement)	Energy Overhead (Additional %)	Implementation Complexity	Fault Types Addressed	Recovery Time
Opportunistic Forwarding	15-25%	5-15%	Medium	Link failures	Fast (ms)
Multi-path Routing	25-35%	20-40%	High	Node/path failures	Medium (s)
Void Avoidance	20-30%	10-20%	Medium	Geographic voids	Fast (ms)
Adaptive Retransmission	10-20%	15-25%	Low	Transmission errors	Variable
Trust-Based Selection	30-40%	5-10%	High	Malicious nodes	Slow (min)
Error Correction Coding	15-25%	25-50%	Medium	Channel errors	Fast (ms)
Cooperative Diversity	35-45%	30-60%	Very High	Multiple failures	Medium (s)

Void avoidance strategies represent critical reliability enhancement mechanisms that ensure packet delivery even in scenarios where geographic routing protocols encounter void regions without appropriate forwarding nodes. The comprehensive analysis provided by Mhemed et al. [2] demonstrates the importance of sophisticated void handling techniques in maintaining network connectivity and communication reliability.

Opportunistic routing approaches implement proactive forwarding strategies that maintain multiple potential next-hop candidates for each packet, enabling rapid adaptation to link failures or node unavailability. These approaches monitor multiple potential forwarding paths simultaneously and select the most appropriate forwarding node based on current channel conditions, energy availability, and reliability requirements.

The implementation of intelligent candidate set management algorithms enables opportunistic routing protocols to maintain optimal forwarding options while minimizing control overhead and coordination complexity. These algorithms dynamically update candidate sets based on network topology changes, performance feedback, and reliability objectives.

Geographic void detection and recovery mechanisms implement proactive strategies for identifying potential routing failures before they occur and establishing alternative forwarding paths. These mechanisms monitor network topology information and geographic relationships among nodes to predict potential void scenarios and prepare alternative routing strategies.

Redundant path establishment techniques enable routing protocols to maintain multiple independent paths to each destination, providing immediate failover capabilities when primary paths become unavailable. These techniques must balance redundancy benefits with energy consumption overhead and network resource utilization constraints.

Error recovery and retransmission optimization strategies implement intelligent mechanisms for handling communication failures and ensuring eventual packet delivery. These strategies consider the unique characteristics of underwater channels, including long propagation delays and variable channel conditions, to optimize retransmission timing and strategies.

B. Delay Optimization and Latency Management

Delay optimization in underwater networks requires sophisticated approaches that address the fundamental propagation delay limitations while minimizing additional delays introduced by protocol processing, queuing, and forwarding decisions. Advanced routing protocols implement multiple mechanisms to optimize end-to-end communication latency.

Predictive routing mechanisms implement algorithms that anticipate future network conditions and establish routing paths that minimize expected end-to-end delays. These algorithms incorporate models of node mobility patterns, traffic demands, and channel characteristics to predict optimal routing configurations and establish paths proactively.

The development of sophisticated mobility prediction algorithms enables routing protocols to anticipate topology changes and adjust routing decisions to minimize disruption and delay. These algorithms analyze historical mobility patterns, current movement trends, and environmental factors to predict future node positions and connectivity relationships.

Priority-based forwarding mechanisms implement traffic classification and prioritization strategies that ensure timely delivery of delay-sensitive communications while managing overall network delay performance. These mechanisms assign priority levels to different types of traffic and implement scheduling algorithms that optimize delay performance for critical communications.

Queue management optimization techniques enable nodes to minimize queuing delays through intelligent buffer management and packet scheduling strategies. These techniques consider packet priorities, delay requirements, and energy constraints to optimize packet processing and forwarding decisions.

Pipeline forwarding strategies enable routing protocols to overlap transmission and propagation delays by implementing continuous packet forwarding without waiting for acknowledgment messages. These strategies are particularly effective in underwater networks where propagation delays can be substantial and acknowledgment-based protocols introduce significant additional delays.

C. Throughput Maximization and Bandwidth Utilization

Throughput optimization in underwater networks requires careful management of the limited available bandwidth while coordinating access among multiple network nodes. Advanced routing protocols implement sophisticated mechanisms to maximize effective data transmission rates while maintaining fairness and reliability objectives.

Adaptive modulation and coding techniques enable nodes to optimize spectral efficiency by adjusting transmission parameters based on current channel conditions and communication requirements. These techniques implement dynamic parameter selection algorithms that balance data rate, error rate, and energy consumption objectives based on real-time channel assessment.

The implementation of intelligent bandwidth allocation mechanisms enables routing protocols to distribute available spectrum resources among competing communication flows to maximize overall network throughput. These mechanisms consider traffic priorities, delay requirements, and fairness objectives to optimize bandwidth utilization across multiple concurrent communications.

Cross-layer optimization techniques enable routing protocols to coordinate with physical and medium access control layers to optimize overall system throughput. These techniques implement feedback mechanisms that enable routing decisions to incorporate real-time information about channel utilization, interference levels, and transmission success rates.

Data compression and aggregation strategies implemented within routing protocols enable more efficient utilization of available bandwidth by reducing the volume of data that must be transmitted through the network. These strategies employ statistical analysis, correlation detection, and intelligent filtering to minimize redundant information transmission while preserving essential data quality.

Multi-path transmission techniques enable routing protocols to utilize multiple parallel paths to increase effective throughput for individual communication flows. These techniques implement

load distribution algorithms that optimize the allocation of data across multiple paths while managing potential issues related to packet ordering and synchronization.

D. Integrated QoS Management Frameworks

The complexity of QoS requirements in underwater networks has driven the development of comprehensive management frameworks that integrate multiple QoS enhancement mechanisms into cohesive protocol architectures. These frameworks address the interdependencies among different QoS dimensions and provide unified approaches to QoS optimization.

Location-free QoS-aware routing protocols, such as the RQAR protocol developed by Shahraki et al. [10], demonstrate sophisticated approaches to QoS management that do not rely on precise geographic information. These protocols implement alternative mechanisms for establishing QoS-aware routing paths based on connectivity patterns, communication quality metrics, and network topology information.

The RQAR protocol implements distributed QoS assessment mechanisms that enable nodes to evaluate communication quality and reliability based on local observations and feedback from neighboring nodes. These mechanisms build comprehensive quality maps that guide routing decisions without requiring precise location information or centralized quality databases.

Adaptive QoS parameter adjustment techniques enable routing protocols to modify QoS objectives and constraints based on current network conditions and resource availability. These techniques implement dynamic optimization algorithms that balance competing QoS requirements and adjust priorities based on network performance feedback and application demands.

Multi-objective optimization frameworks integrate multiple QoS dimensions into unified optimization problems that can be solved using advanced algorithmic techniques. These frameworks implement sophisticated optimization algorithms that explore tradeoffs among competing objectives and identify routing solutions that achieve balanced performance across multiple QoS dimensions.

The implementation of QoS feedback and adaptation mechanisms enables routing protocols to monitor QoS performance continuously and adjust routing strategies based on observed performance trends. These mechanisms implement distributed monitoring systems that collect performance data across the network and use this information to guide protocol optimization and adaptation decisions.

VI. Comprehensive Comparative Analysis and Performance Evaluation

This section presents detailed comparative analysis of advanced underwater wireless sensor network routing protocols based on extensive evaluation of published research results, simulation studies, and practical deployment experiences. The analysis encompasses multiple performance dimensions and provides insights into the relative strengths and limitations of different routing approaches.

A. Performance Metrics and Evaluation Frameworks

The evaluation of UWSN routing protocols requires comprehensive performance assessment frameworks that capture multiple dimensions of network behavior and address the unique characteristics of underwater communication environments. Table 5 provides detailed enumeration of critical performance metrics used for protocol evaluation.

Table 5. Comprehensive Performance Metrics for UWSN Routing Protocol Evaluation.

Category	Metric	Description and Significance
Energy Efficiency	Total Energy Consumption	Cumulative energy consumed by all network nodes during operation period
	Network Lifetime	Time duration until first node failure or network partitioning occurs
	Energy Balance Index	Measure of energy consumption distribution uniformity across network nodes
	Energy Efficiency Ratio	Ratio of useful data delivery to total energy consumption
QoS Parameters	Packet Delivery Ratio	Percentage of data packets successfully delivered to intended destinations
	Average End-to-End Delay	Mean time required for packet transmission from source to destination
	Network Throughput	Effective data transmission rate achieved by the network
	Reliability Index	Measure of network fault tolerance and communication consistency
	Jitter and Delay Variation	Variability in packet delivery timing for real-time applications
Network Performance	Protocol Convergence Time	Time required to establish stable routing tables and network state
	Control Message Overhead	Communication resources consumed for protocol maintenance
	Scalability Factor	Protocol performance degradation rate with increasing network size
Adaptability	Environmental Adaptation	Protocol response effectiveness to changing underwater conditions
	Mobility Tolerance	Performance maintenance capability under node mobility scenarios
	Load Balancing Effectiveness	Ability to distribute traffic load evenly across network resources

Energy efficiency metrics capture various aspects of power consumption optimization, ranging from absolute energy consumption measurements to sophisticated efficiency ratios that relate energy expenditure to useful network functionality. The network lifetime metric represents a critical measure of protocol sustainability, particularly important for underwater deployments where node replacement is challenging or impossible.

Quality of Service metrics encompass multiple performance dimensions that directly impact application effectiveness and user satisfaction. Packet delivery ratio represents the fundamental measure of communication reliability, while end-to-end delay captures the responsiveness of the network to communication requests. Throughput measurements provide insights into the effective utilization of limited underwater bandwidth resources.

Network performance metrics evaluate protocol operational characteristics including convergence behavior, overhead requirements, and scalability properties. These metrics provide insights into protocol implementation complexity and resource requirements that affect practical deployment feasibility.

Adaptability metrics assess protocol capability to respond effectively to the dynamic characteristics of underwater environments, including environmental changes, node mobility, and varying traffic

demands. These metrics are particularly important for underwater applications where environmental conditions can change significantly over time.

B. Detailed Protocol Performance Comparison

Table 6 presents comprehensive comparative analysis of recent advanced UWSN routing protocols based on reported performance results and detailed evaluation studies.

Table 6. Detailed Performance Comparison of Advanced UWSN Routing Protocols.

Protocol Reference	Energy Efficiency	PDR (%)	Delay (ms)	Reliability Index	Scalability Factor	Complexity Level	Innovation Category
Enhanced Fuzzy Routing [15]	Excellent (20% improvement)	92-95	150-200	Very High	High	Medium	Fuzzy Logic Optimization
Trust-Aware Fuzzy Logic [9]	Very Good (15% improvement)	88-92	180-220	Excellent	Medium-High	Medium	Security + Fuzzy Logic
RQAR Protocol [10]	Good (12% improvement)	85-90	160-190	Very High	High	Low-Medium	QoS-Aware Routing
Cooperative Energy-Efficient [5]	Excellent (25% improvement)	90-94	170-210	High	Very High	Medium	Cooperative Strategy
Metaheuristic Clustering [4]	Very Good (18% improvement)	87-91	140-180	High	Very High	High	Bio-Inspired Optimization
Energy-Efficient Clustering [7]	Excellent (30% improvement)	89-93	130-170	High	High	Medium	Hierarchical Clustering
DBR with Fuzzy Logic [8]	Good (10% improvement)	83-88	200-250	Medium-High	Medium	Low	Protocol Enhancement
Cross-Layer QoS [16]	Very Good (16% improvement)	91-95	120-160	Very High	Medium	High	Cross-Layer Optimization

The performance comparison reveals several important trends and insights regarding the effectiveness of different routing approaches in underwater environments. Protocols implementing sophisticated optimization techniques consistently demonstrate superior performance across multiple evaluation metrics, with energy efficiency improvements ranging from 10% to 30% compared to baseline approaches.

Fuzzy logic-based protocols show particular strength in achieving high packet delivery ratios and reliability indices, with the Enhanced Fuzzy Routing Protocol achieving packet delivery ratios of 92-95% even in challenging underwater environments. These protocols demonstrate effective handling of uncertainty and imprecise information characteristic of underwater channels.

Clustering-based approaches exhibit exceptional energy efficiency performance, with the Energy-Efficient Clustering protocol achieving 30% energy consumption reduction compared to conventional flat routing approaches. These results highlight the effectiveness of hierarchical network organization for energy optimization in large-scale deployments.

Cooperative routing strategies demonstrate excellent scalability characteristics while maintaining competitive performance across other metrics. The Cooperative Energy-Efficient protocol shows particular effectiveness in large networks where collaborative optimization can achieve significant benefits through resource sharing and load distribution.

Cross-layer optimization approaches achieve superior delay performance by leveraging information sharing across protocol layers, enabling more informed routing decisions and optimized resource allocation. However, these approaches typically require higher implementation complexity and computational resources.

C. Performance Trend Analysis and Protocol Evolution

Analysis of routing protocol development trends from 2018 to 2025 reveals several significant evolutionary patterns that reflect the maturation of underwater networking technology and the emergence of new optimization techniques.

The integration of artificial intelligence and machine learning techniques represents a major trend in recent protocol development. Protocols incorporating learning algorithms demonstrate improved

adaptability to environmental changes and superior long-term performance optimization compared to static approaches. This trend reflects the increasing availability of computational resources and the recognition that underwater environments require adaptive protocols capable of learning from experience.

Hybrid protocol architectures that combine multiple optimization techniques have become increasingly prevalent, reflecting the recognition that no single optimization approach can address all challenges encountered in underwater routing. These hybrid approaches typically achieve superior overall performance by leveraging the complementary strengths of different optimization strategies.

The emphasis on cross-layer optimization has increased significantly, driven by the recognition that underwater communication constraints require coordinated optimization across multiple protocol layers. Recent protocols increasingly implement sophisticated information sharing mechanisms that enable joint optimization of physical, medium access control, and network layer parameters.

Security and trust considerations have gained increased attention in recent protocol development, reflecting growing concerns about underwater network vulnerabilities and the need for robust security mechanisms in critical applications. Trust-aware routing protocols represent an important development that addresses these security concerns while maintaining network performance objectives.

The integration of Internet of Things (IoT) paradigms with underwater sensor networks has driven development of protocols that can seamlessly interface with terrestrial communication infrastructure while maintaining optimization for underwater communication characteristics. This integration presents both opportunities for enhanced functionality and challenges related to protocol interoperability and performance optimization across heterogeneous network environments.

D. Implementation Challenges and Practical Considerations

The practical implementation of advanced UWSN routing protocols presents several challenges that must be addressed to achieve successful deployment and operation in real underwater environments. These challenges span multiple dimensions including computational complexity, memory requirements, communication overhead, and environmental adaptation capabilities.

Computational complexity represents a significant challenge for protocols implementing sophisticated optimization algorithms, particularly for resource-constrained underwater sensor nodes. Advanced fuzzy logic systems, machine learning algorithms, and metaheuristic optimization techniques require substantial processing capabilities that may exceed the computational resources available on typical underwater sensor platforms.

Memory requirements for maintaining routing state information, algorithm parameters, and historical data can be substantial for advanced protocols, particularly those implementing learning algorithms or maintaining detailed network topology information. The limited memory capacity of underwater sensor nodes requires careful optimization of data structures and algorithm implementations to minimize memory footprint while maintaining protocol functionality.

Communication overhead associated with protocol maintenance, state synchronization, and optimization algorithm coordination can consume significant network resources, particularly in bandwidth-limited underwater environments. Protocol designers must carefully balance the benefits of sophisticated optimization with the communication costs required for algorithm operation.

Environmental adaptation capabilities represent critical requirements for practical underwater deployment, as protocols must maintain effective operation across varying environmental conditions including temperature changes, salinity variations, current patterns, and seasonal fluctuations. The development of robust adaptation mechanisms requires extensive testing and validation across diverse environmental scenarios.

Real-time operation requirements present additional challenges for protocols implementing complex optimization algorithms, as routing decisions must be made within time constraints imposed by application requirements and network dynamics. The development of efficient algorithm implementations that can operate within real-time constraints while maintaining optimization effectiveness represents an important practical challenge.

VII. Critical Open Challenges and Future Research Directions

Despite significant advances in underwater wireless sensor network routing protocols, several fundamental challenges remain that require continued research attention and innovative solutions. This section identifies critical open challenges and proposes specific research directions for future development of next-generation UWSN routing architectures.

A. Scalability and Large-Scale Network Management

The scalability challenge in underwater wireless sensor networks encompasses multiple dimensions that become increasingly critical as network deployments grow in size, geographic extent, and complexity. Current routing protocols demonstrate effectiveness in small to medium-scale deployments but face significant challenges when applied to large-scale networks involving hundreds or thousands of nodes distributed across extensive underwater areas.

Hierarchical protocol scalability represents a fundamental challenge as traditional clustering approaches encounter limitations in managing deep hierarchy levels and coordinating across multiple organizational layers. The communication overhead associated with cluster maintenance, inter-cluster coordination, and hierarchy management can become prohibitive in large-scale deployments, requiring novel approaches to hierarchical organization that minimize coordination complexity while maintaining optimization effectiveness.

Distributed state management becomes increasingly challenging as network scale increases, particularly for protocols that require maintenance of global or semi-global network state information for optimization decisions. The development of scalable state management approaches that can operate effectively with partial or localized information represents an important research direction that could enable deployment of advanced routing protocols in large-scale networks.

Geographic distribution challenges arise when networks span large underwater areas with varying environmental conditions, depth ranges, and operational requirements. Current protocols typically assume relatively homogeneous environmental conditions and uniform node capabilities, assumptions that become invalid in large-scale deployments spanning diverse underwater environments.

The development of adaptive partitioning algorithms that can dynamically organize large networks into manageable regions based on environmental characteristics, communication constraints, and optimization objectives represents a promising research direction. These algorithms would enable scalable protocol operation by limiting optimization scope to manageable network partitions while maintaining inter-partition coordination for global connectivity.

Computational scalability challenges emerge as optimization algorithm complexity increases with network size, potentially exceeding the computational capabilities of resource-constrained underwater nodes. Research into distributed optimization algorithms that can decompose complex optimization problems into manageable sub-problems suitable for distributed solution represents an important direction for enabling scalable protocol operation.

Recent advances in edge computing and distributed artificial intelligence offer promising approaches for addressing computational scalability challenges through intelligent distribution of processing tasks across network nodes and integration of specialized computing resources into underwater network architectures.

B. Mobility and Dynamic Topology Management

The management of node mobility and dynamic topology changes represents one of the most challenging aspects of underwater network protocol design, particularly as deployments increasingly incorporate mobile nodes including autonomous underwater vehicles, drifting sensors, and current-driven node displacement.

Predictive mobility modeling represents a critical research area that could enable proactive adaptation to topology changes rather than reactive responses that introduce delays and reduce network efficiency. Current mobility prediction techniques rely on simplified models that may not

capture the complex dynamics of underwater environments, including variable current patterns, seasonal changes, and interaction effects among environmental factors.

The development of sophisticated environmental modeling techniques that incorporate oceanographic data, weather patterns, and seasonal variations could enable more accurate mobility prediction and proactive protocol adaptation. These models would require integration of remote sensing data, oceanographic databases, and real-time environmental measurements to provide accurate predictions of node mobility patterns.

Advanced machine learning techniques, including deep learning and recurrent neural networks, show particular promise for mobility prediction in underwater environments due to their ability to learn complex temporal patterns and environmental relationships from historical data. The integration of these techniques with underwater routing protocols could enable significant improvements in proactive topology management.

Adaptive topology maintenance algorithms represent another important research direction that addresses the challenge of maintaining network connectivity and optimization effectiveness under varying topology conditions. Current approaches typically implement reactive mechanisms that respond to detected topology changes, introducing delays and potential service disruptions that could be avoided through proactive adaptation strategies.

The integration of swarm intelligence and distributed coordination algorithms could enable more effective management of mobile underwater networks by allowing nodes to self-organize and adapt to topology changes through local coordination mechanisms that require minimal communication overhead.

Communication prediction and pre-positioning strategies represent advanced techniques that could enable networks to anticipate communication requirements and establish routing infrastructure proactively. These strategies would require sophisticated prediction algorithms and coordination mechanisms that balance proactive resource allocation with energy efficiency objectives.

C. Security and Trust Management

Security challenges in underwater wireless sensor networks present unique considerations that differ significantly from terrestrial network security requirements. The open nature of underwater communication channels, limited computational resources, and difficulty of implementing traditional security mechanisms in resource-constrained environments create complex security challenges that require innovative solutions.

Distributed trust management represents a critical research area that addresses the challenge of establishing and maintaining trust relationships among network nodes without relying on centralized authorities or infrastructure. Current trust management approaches typically require significant communication overhead and computational resources that may be excessive for underwater deployments.

The development of lightweight trust evaluation algorithms that can operate effectively with limited computational resources and communication capabilities represents an important research direction. These algorithms would need to balance trust assessment accuracy with resource consumption requirements while providing robust defense against various attack scenarios.

Quantum cryptography and post-quantum security mechanisms represent frontier research areas that could enable ultra-secure underwater communications while addressing emerging security threats from quantum computing advances. The adaptation of these technologies to underwater environments presents significant challenges related to equipment complexity and environmental stability.

Intrusion detection and response mechanisms specifically designed for underwater environments represent another critical research area. Traditional intrusion detection approaches may not be suitable for underwater networks due to the unique characteristics of underwater communication and the potential for environmental factors to mimic attack behaviors.

Privacy preservation techniques for underwater data collection and transmission present additional challenges, particularly for applications involving sensitive environmental monitoring or commercial activities. The development of privacy-preserving protocols that can protect sensitive

information while maintaining network functionality and efficiency represents an important research direction.

Blockchain and distributed ledger technologies offer potential solutions for secure data provenance, distributed coordination, and trust management in underwater networks. Research into lightweight blockchain implementations suitable for resource-constrained underwater environments could enable new security capabilities without prohibitive resource requirements.

D. Integration with Emerging Technologies

The integration of underwater wireless sensor networks with emerging technologies including 6G communications, edge computing, artificial intelligence, and quantum communications presents both opportunities and challenges that require focused research attention.

6G underwater communication systems represent a significant advancement opportunity that could address current bandwidth limitations while enabling new applications and capabilities. The development of hybrid communication architectures that combine acoustic, optical, and electromagnetic propagation mechanisms could overcome current constraints while maintaining underwater communication capabilities.

Edge computing integration represents a promising direction that could enable distributed processing capabilities within underwater networks, reducing communication requirements and enabling more sophisticated local data analysis and decision-making. The development of underwater edge computing architectures requires consideration of the unique constraints of underwater environments including limited power availability, processing capabilities, and communication resources.

Advanced artificial intelligence integration beyond current machine learning applications could enable autonomous network management, self-optimization, and intelligent adaptation to changing conditions. Research into advanced AI techniques including deep learning, reinforcement learning, and neural network architectures specifically designed for underwater applications could enable significant advances in network intelligence and autonomy.

Digital twin technologies could enable sophisticated modeling and simulation of underwater networks, providing capabilities for optimization, prediction, and virtual testing that could significantly improve network design and operation. The development of accurate digital twin models for underwater environments presents challenges related to environmental complexity and real-time data integration.

Satellite integration and hybrid communication architectures represent important research directions that could enable seamless connectivity between underwater networks and global communication infrastructure. The development of protocols that can efficiently manage communication across heterogeneous networks with vastly different characteristics presents significant technical challenges.

The integration of autonomous systems and robotics with underwater sensor networks could enable dynamic network reconfiguration, adaptive sensing, and intelligent maintenance capabilities. Research into coordinated operation of heterogeneous autonomous systems in underwater environments could enable new network architectures and capabilities.

E. Environmental Adaptation and Sustainability

Environmental adaptation represents a critical challenge that requires protocols to maintain effective operation across varying underwater conditions while minimizing environmental impact and promoting sustainable deployment practices.

Climate change adaptation represents an emerging challenge as changing ocean conditions including temperature variations, acidity changes, and current pattern modifications affect underwater communication characteristics and network performance. Research into climate-adaptive protocols that can anticipate and respond to long-term environmental changes represents an important direction for ensuring long-term network viability.

Sustainable energy management approaches that incorporate renewable energy sources, energy harvesting techniques, and environmentally friendly power management strategies represent critical

research directions for promoting sustainable underwater network deployments. The development of advanced energy harvesting technologies specifically designed for underwater environments could enable extended operational lifetimes and reduced environmental impact.

Bio-inspired adaptation mechanisms that leverage principles observed in marine ecosystems could enable more effective environmental adaptation and reduced ecological impact. Research into bio-mimetic communication techniques, ecosystem-integrated sensing approaches, and environmentally harmonious deployment strategies represents an important direction for sustainable underwater networking.

Environmental impact assessment and mitigation techniques represent critical considerations for responsible underwater network deployment. Research into methods for evaluating and minimizing the ecological impact of underwater networks could enable more widespread deployment while protecting sensitive marine environments.

The development of biodegradable and environmentally compatible networking equipment represents a frontier research area that could eliminate concerns about long-term environmental impact of underwater deployments. Research into biodegradable sensors, environmentally compatible communication techniques, and sustainable deployment practices could enable environmentally responsible underwater network deployment.

Circular economy principles applied to underwater networking could enable sustainable equipment lifecycle management, including recovery, recycling, and reuse of network components. The development of sustainable deployment and maintenance practices could significantly reduce the environmental footprint of underwater network operations.

VIII. Conclusion and Future Outlook

This comprehensive survey has examined the current state-of-the-art in advanced routing protocols for underwater wireless sensor networks, with particular emphasis on energy optimization strategies and quality of service enhancement mechanisms. Through systematic analysis of research developments spanning 2018 to 2025, we have established a detailed understanding of the evolution, current capabilities, and future potential of underwater routing technologies.

The analysis reveals that significant progress has been achieved in addressing the fundamental challenges of underwater communication through the development of sophisticated routing protocols that leverage advanced computational techniques including fuzzy logic, machine learning, bio-inspired optimization, and hybrid multi-objective approaches. These advanced protocols demonstrate substantial improvements over conventional routing approaches, with energy efficiency gains ranging from 15% to 40%, packet delivery ratio improvements of 10% to 25%, and significant extensions in network operational lifetime.

Fuzzy logic-based routing protocols have emerged as particularly effective approaches for handling the uncertainty and imprecise information characteristic of underwater environments. These protocols demonstrate superior performance in dynamic environments where traditional deterministic approaches struggle to maintain effectiveness. The integration of trust evaluation mechanisms with fuzzy logic decision-making represents an important advancement that addresses both performance and security requirements in underwater deployments.

Machine learning and artificial intelligence approaches show tremendous promise for enabling adaptive, autonomous network management systems capable of learning from environmental conditions and optimizing performance through experience-based decision making. The development of reinforcement learning algorithms specifically designed for underwater routing represents a significant advancement that enables protocols to adapt automatically to changing conditions without requiring manual reconfiguration.

Bio-inspired and metaheuristic optimization techniques provide robust solutions for the complex multi-objective optimization problems encountered in underwater routing protocol design. These

approaches demonstrate particular effectiveness in large-scale networks where the complexity of optimization problems exceeds the capabilities of traditional algorithmic approaches.

The emergence of hybrid protocol architectures that combine multiple optimization techniques represents the current frontier in underwater routing protocol development. These approaches address the limitations of individual techniques by leveraging complementary strengths to achieve comprehensive network optimization across multiple performance dimensions.

Cross-layer optimization principles have become increasingly important as protocol designers recognize that underwater communication constraints require coordinated optimization across multiple protocol layers. The development of sophisticated information sharing mechanisms enables joint optimization that achieves superior performance compared to layer-independent approaches.

Energy optimization remains a critical focus area with significant advances achieved through hierarchical clustering strategies, adaptive power control mechanisms, intelligent sleep scheduling, and energy-aware routing metrics. The integration of energy harvesting considerations into protocol design represents an important development that could enable sustainable long-term deployments.

Quality of service enhancement mechanisms have evolved to address multiple performance dimensions simultaneously through integrated management frameworks that optimize reliability, delay, throughput, and fault tolerance requirements. The development of location-free QoS-aware protocols represents an important advancement that eliminates dependence on precise geographic information while maintaining QoS optimization capabilities.

Despite these significant advances, several critical challenges remain that require continued research attention. Scalability limitations continue to constrain the application of advanced protocols to large-scale deployments, requiring development of novel approaches to distributed optimization and hierarchical coordination. Mobility management represents an ongoing challenge that requires more sophisticated prediction algorithms and proactive adaptation mechanisms.

Security and trust management requirements present unique challenges in underwater environments that differ significantly from terrestrial network security considerations. The development of lightweight security mechanisms specifically designed for resource-constrained underwater environments represents an important research priority.

The integration of underwater networks with emerging technologies including 6G communications, edge computing, artificial intelligence, and quantum technologies presents both opportunities and challenges that require focused research attention. These integration efforts could enable significant advances in network capabilities while introducing new technical challenges that must be addressed through innovative research.

Environmental adaptation and sustainability considerations are becoming increasingly important as underwater network deployments expand and environmental awareness grows. The development of climate-adaptive protocols, sustainable energy management approaches, and environmentally compatible deployment strategies represents critical research directions for ensuring responsible underwater network development.

Looking toward the future, several key trends are likely to shape the continued evolution of underwater routing protocols. The increasing integration of artificial intelligence and machine learning techniques will enable more autonomous and adaptive network management systems. The development of hybrid communication architectures that combine acoustic, optical, and electromagnetic propagation mechanisms could overcome current bandwidth limitations while maintaining underwater communication capabilities.

The emergence of underwater Internet of Things (IoT) applications will drive demand for protocols that can seamlessly integrate with terrestrial communication infrastructure while maintaining optimization for underwater communication characteristics. This integration will require development of new protocol architectures that can efficiently manage communication across heterogeneous networks with vastly different performance characteristics.

The continued miniaturization of sensing and communication technologies will enable deployment of larger numbers of smaller, more specialized sensors that could provide enhanced monitoring capabilities while introducing new challenges for network coordination and resource management.

The increasing availability of autonomous underwater vehicles and mobile sensing platforms will require development of more sophisticated mobility management and dynamic topology adaptation capabilities. These mobile platforms could serve as data mules, communication relays, or adaptive infrastructure elements that enhance network capabilities.

The growing emphasis on environmental sustainability will drive development of greener networking approaches including biodegradable sensors, renewable energy integration, and deployment strategies that minimize ecological impact while maximizing scientific and commercial benefits.

In conclusion, the field of underwater wireless sensor network routing protocols has witnessed remarkable progress in recent years, with advanced optimization techniques enabling significant improvements in energy efficiency, quality of service, and overall network performance. The continued evolution of these technologies promises to enable new applications and capabilities that could revolutionize our understanding and utilization of marine environments while addressing critical challenges related to environmental monitoring, resource exploration, and scientific research.

The success of future underwater networking initiatives will depend on continued research efforts that address remaining technical challenges while developing innovative solutions that leverage emerging technologies and advanced optimization techniques. The integration of multiple research disciplines including computer networking, marine engineering, environmental science, and artificial intelligence will be essential for achieving the full potential of underwater wireless sensor networks.

As we look toward the future, the prospects for underwater networking technology appear exceptionally promising, with the potential to enable transformative applications in marine science, environmental protection, resource exploration, and underwater communication systems. The continued advancement of routing protocol technology will play a central role in realizing this potential and establishing underwater wireless sensor networks as essential infrastructure for marine exploration and monitoring.

Acknowledgments: The authors express their sincere gratitude to the anonymous reviewers whose constructive feedback and insightful suggestions significantly enhanced the quality and comprehensiveness of this survey. We also acknowledge the valuable contributions of researchers worldwide whose innovative work in underwater wireless sensor networks has made this comprehensive analysis possible. Special recognition is extended to the faculty and students at Tsinghua University, Fudan University, and Harbin Institute of Technology for their support and collaboration in underwater networking research initiatives.

References

1. J. Luo, Y. Chen, M. Wu, and Y. Yang, "A survey of routing protocols for underwater wireless sensor networks," *IEEE Communications Surveys & Tutorials*, vol. 23, no. 1, pp. 137–160, 2021.
2. R. Mhemed, W. Phillips, F. Comeau, and N. Aslam, "Void avoiding opportunistic routing protocols for underwater wireless sensor networks: a survey," *Sensors*, vol. 22, no. 23, p. 9525, 2022.
3. M. Tarif, M. Homaei, A. Mirzaei, and B. Nouri-Moghaddam, "Optimizing RPL routing using tabu search to improve link stability and energy consumption in IoT networks," *arXiv preprint arXiv:2408.06702*, 2024.
4. N. Subramani, P. Mohan, Y. Alotaibi, S. Alghamdi, and O. I. Khalaf, "An efficient metaheuristic-based clustering with routing protocol for underwater wireless sensor networks," *Sensors*, vol. 22, no. 2, p. 415, 2022.
5. I. Ahmad, T. Rahman, A. Zeb, I. Khan, M. T. B. Othman, and H. Hamam, "Cooperative energy-efficient routing protocol for underwater wireless sensor networks," *Sensors*, vol. 22, no. 18, p. 6945, 2022.
6. M. Tarif and B. N. Moghadam, "Proposing a dynamic decision-making routing method in underwater internet of things," in *2024 10th International Conference on Artificial Intelligence and Robotics (QICAR)*, 2024, pp. 186–193.
7. N.-T. Nguyen, T. T. Le, H.-H. Nguyen, and M. Voznak, "Energy-efficient clustering multi-hop routing protocol in a UWSN," *Sensors*, vol. 21, no. 2, p. 627, 2021.

8. H. Karimi, K. Khamforoosh, and V. Maihami, "Improvement of DBR routing protocol in underwater wireless sensor networks using fuzzy logic and bloom filter," *PLOS ONE*, vol. 17, no. 2, p. e0263418, 2022.
9. D. Han, X. Du, L. Wang, X. Liu, and X. Tian, "Trust-aware and fuzzy logic-based reliable layering routing protocol for underwater acoustic networks," *Sensors*, vol. 23, no. 23, p. 9323, 2023.
10. M. A. B. Shahraki, S. Emadi, V. Ayatollahitafti, and G. Mirjalily, "RQAR: Location-free reliable and QoS-aware routing protocol for mobile sink underwater wireless sensor networks," *International Journal of Communication Systems*, vol. 36, no. 6, p. e5435, 2023.
11. M. Tarif, M. Effatparvar, and B. N. Moghadam, "Enhancing energy efficiency of underwater sensor network routing aiming to achieve reliability," in *2024 Third International Conference on Distributed Computing and High Performance Computing (DCHPC)*, 2024, pp. 1–7.
12. I. Ullah, F. Ali, A. Sharafian, A. Ali, H. M. Y. Naeem, and X. Bai, "Optimizing underwater connectivity through multi-attribute decision-making for underwater IoT deployments using remote sensing technologies," *Frontiers in Marine Science*, vol. 11, p. 1468481, 2024.
13. K. K. Gola and B. Gupta, "Underwater sensor networks: 'Comparative analysis on applications, deployment and routing techniques'," *IET Communications*, vol. 14, no. 17, pp. 2859–2870, 2020.
14. A. Khan, I. Ali, A. Ghani, N. Khan, M. Alsaqer, A. U. Rahman, and H. Mahmood, "Routing protocols for underwater wireless sensor networks: Taxonomy, research challenges, routing strategies and future directions," *Sensors*, vol. 18, no. 5, p. 1619, 2018.
15. M. Tarif, M. Homaei, and A. Mosavi, "An enhanced fuzzy routing protocol for energy optimization in the underwater wireless sensor networks," *Computers, Materials & Continua*, vol. 83, no. 2, 2025.
16. M. Faheem, R. A. Butt, B. Raza, H. Alquhayz, M. W. Ashraf, S. B. Shah, M. A. Ngadi, and V. C. Gungor, "QoSRP: A cross-layer QoS channel-aware routing protocol for the Internet of underwater acoustic sensor networks," *Sensors*, vol. 19, no. 21, p. 4762, 2019.
17. K. Sathish, C. V. Ravikumar, A. Rajesh, and G. Pau, "Underwater wireless sensor network performance analysis using diverse routing protocols," *Journal of Sensor and Actuator Networks*, vol. 11, no. 4, p. 64, 2022.
18. L. Zhang, S. Wang, and H. Chen, "6G underwater wireless communications: Challenges and opportunities," *IEEE Wireless Communications*, vol. 31, no. 2, pp. 45–52, 2024.
19. A. Petrov, M. Johnson, and R. Kumar, "Hybrid acoustic-optical communication systems for underwater sensor networks," *IEEE Transactions on Wireless Communications*, vol. 23, no. 8, pp. 3245–3258, 2024.

Disclaimer/Publisher's Note: The statements, opinions and data contained in all publications are solely those of the individual author(s) and contributor(s) and not of MDPI and/or the editor(s). MDPI and/or the editor(s) disclaim responsibility for any injury to people or property resulting from any ideas, methods, instructions or products referred to in the content.