- l Review
- 2 Use of natural products for weed management in
- 3 high-value crops: An Overview
- 5 Rupinder Saini*and Sukhbir Singh
- 6 Department of Plant and Soil Science, Texas Tech University, Lubbock, TX 79409, USA.
- 7 * Correspondence: r.saini@ttu.edu; Tel.: +806-834-7296

- Abstract: Over the last five decades, weed management systems have relied primarily on synthetic herbicides. Due to the concerns over the potential impact of chemicals on human health and the environment, efforts are being made to reduce the heavy reliance on synthetic herbicides. To reduce the use of synthetic herbicides, the use of natural products such as essential oils, plant extracts, allelochemicals, agricultural by-products, and some microbes are gaining attention because of their short environmental half-life and low toxicity. They are a good alternative to synthetic herbicides, especially in organic agriculture, since they focus on environmental protection, and ecological stability. Most of the commercially available natural herbicides are non-selective and require careful application in order to preserve the cash crops. Although many studies in this direction have been undertaken, the use of these natural products is still not common because of their cost the difficulties in their synthesis due to their complex structure, cost effectiveness, poor performance, and rapid degradation. When used singly, these natural herbicides do not perform as well as the chemical herbicides. An integrated approach may provide better results. Using a combination of natural herbicides may be more effective than using just one.
- **Keywords:** allelopathy, bioherbicides, corn gluten meal, essential oils, mustard seed meal, pathogens, plant extracts

1. Introduction

Weeds are arguably some of the most troublesome pests to control in crop production. Weeds compete with cash crops for nutrients, water and light. They can have negative impact on crop yield and quality if remained uncontrolled. On an average, weeds can lower crop productivity by 34% [1]. Weed management is mostly achieved through cultural, mechanical, chemical and/or biological methods. Throughout the last half century, the use of chemicals has been one of the most dominant methods for weed control. Although the use of synthetic herbicides is apparently an easy and cost effective method for controlling weeds, their widespread use has resulted in soil and groundwater pollution, enhanced accumulation of toxic herbicide residues in agricultural products, increased resistance of weeds to herbicides, and potential damage to human and animal health [2]. Several studies have shown that synthetic herbicides could cause health problems such as cancer, birth defects and nerve damage [3]. Also, synthetic herbicides residue persists in the soil and injure nontarget plants.

Concerns of ecological, environmental, and health problems associated with intensive use of chemicals have encouraged many producers to adopt organic practices and explore other alternatives to control weeds [4,5]. The replacement of synthetic herbicides with natural herbicides would be a

42

43

44

45

46

47

48

49

50

51

52

53

54

55

56

57

58

59

60

61

62

63

64

65

66

67

68

69

70

71

72

73

74

75

76

77

78

79

80

81

2 of 14

sustainable approach in protection of the environment. Unlike the chemical herbicides, the use of natural products such as essential oils, agricultural by-products, plant extracts, and living organisms (bacteria, fungi and insects) is considered to be more environmental friendly. These natural products are rapidly degraded in the environment. They don't stay long in the soil and they don't leach to ground water [6]. Thus, they are considered safe for the environment. In addition, the use of plant species that are able to produce and release phytotoxic allelochemicals could be an effective tool for weed control. Several plant species such as sunflower (Helianthus annuus L.), cereal rye (Secale cereale L.), and mustards (Brassicaceae) have allelopathic effects on other plant species [7-10]. There are different ways of using allelopathy to control weeds. First is to use allelopathic cover crops in rotations, or apply residues of allelopathic plants as mulches [10,11]. Another promising way to use allelopathy in weed control is to use water extracts of allelopathic plants as herbicides [9,12-14]. The use of allelopathic plants/crops with significant weed inhibition qualities, together with common weed control tactics could play an important role in the establishment of sustainable agriculture. In high value crops, such as vegetables there are very few registered herbicides for weed control and secondly, people are more interested in organic products, therefore, today's agriculture requires a modified weed management system to deal with the problems associated with the use of synthetic herbicides. Keeping these problems in view, here we provide a short review of the existing natural products in the market and their use as an alternative method for weed control.

2. Weed control using agricultural by-products

Weed control using agricultural by-products provide an attractive and promising alternative solution to chemical herbicides. There are a number of natural products being used for weed management [15-17] such as corn gluten meal (CGM), Brassicaceae seed meals (BSMs), and soybean meal. CGM, the protein fraction of corn grain, is a by-product of the wet milling of corn kernels for use in corn syrup and corn starch [18]. The remaining material has herbicidal properties that can suppress seedling root formation and plant survival of germinating plants but does not inhibit root growth of established plants [19]. In the early 1990s, CGM was identified and patented as a natural pre-emergent herbicide for use in organic production systems [20]. Bingaman and Christians [20] showed that CGM when applied on the soil-surface at rates of 300-1000g m⁻² caused reductions in plant survival, shoot length, and root development of common lambsquarters (Chenopodium album L.), curly dock (Rumex crispus L.), purslane (Portulaca oleracea L.), black nightshade (Solanum nigrum L.), creeping bentgrass (Agrostis palustris Huds.), and redroot pigweed (Amaranthus retroflexus L.). In a greenhouse and field study, Nonnecke and Christians [21] reported that incorporated CGM significantly reduced weed density in strawberry plots and had no detrimental effect on the 'Honeoye' strawberry plants. Incorporating CGM in the soil before planting at a rate of 100-400 g m ² reduced weed cover by 50-84% as compared to unweeded control but showed toxicity on direct seeded vegetables [onion (Allium cepa L.), beet (Beta vulgaris L.), radish (Raphanus raphanistrum subsp. sativus), bean (Phaseolus vulgaris L.), carrot (Daucus carota subsp. sativus), pea (Pisum sativum L.), lettuce (Lactuca sativa L.), and sweet corn (Zea mays L. var. rugosa) [22]. Similarly, in a recent greenhouse study, Yu and Morishita [23] found that application of CGM significantly decreased broadleaf and grass weeds, indicating CGM has a potential to be used as a weed suppressive soil amendment.

83

84

85

86

87

88

89

90

91

92

93

94

95

96

97

98

99

100

101

102

103

104

105

106

107

108

109

110

111

112

113

114

115

116

117

118

119

120

121

122

123

3 of 14

Dried distillers' grains with solubles (DDGS) is another natural by-product that is used for weed control. DDGS is a byproduct of ethanol production that is commonly used as cattle feed. DDGS typically contains 4.4% N, 0.16% P, 0.79% K, and 0.5% S [24]. Due to its high nitrogen content it is used as a fertilizer supplement in horticultural crops. Other than fertilizer supplement it is also used for weed control in organic production systems. Boydston, Collins and Vaughn [24] found that the application of DDGS on the soil surface at 800-1600 g m-2 significantly reduced annual bluegrass (*Poa annua* L.) number by 40-57% and common chickweed [*Stellaria media* (L.) Vill.] by 33 -58%, respectively in the container-grown ornaments, with no injury on ornamental plants.

BSMs are the by-products of edible and industrial-grade oil production after oil extraction from crops like mustard (Brassica juncea L. and Sinapis alba L.) and canola (Brassica napus L.). These seed meals possess herbicidal activity and are used as soil amendments to control weeds in vegetable cropping systems [25,26]. Brassicaceae plants contain allelopathic compounds known as glucosinolates (GSL), which on hydrolysis by the enzyme myrosinase releases biologically active compounds such as isothiocyanates, thiocyanates, nitriles, epithionitriles, and oxazolidinethione, that are toxic to weeds [25,27]. In Brassica species, there are about twenty GSLs and their concentrations vary among species and plant tissues [28]. For example, white mustard 'IdaGold' seed meal has 4hydroxybenzyl glucosinolates (glucosinalbin), whereas Indian mustard 'Pacific Gold' seed meal 'contains 2-propenyl GSL (sinigrin) [29]. Furthermore, GSLs are found throughout Brassicaceae plant tissues but they are most concentrated in the seeds [30,31]. Evidence from previous studies have confirmed that BSMs can be used as a potential bioherbicide [25,32-34]. Applying 3% Indian mustard seed meal in the soil reduced plant biomass of redroot pigweed by 74% as compared to unamended control [26]. In another study, mustard seed meal application decreased the emergence of barnyardgrass (Echinochloa spp.), common lambsquarters, and kochia (Bassia scoporia) by 66%, 73% and 83%, respectively as compared to non-treated control [23]. Similarly, in strawberry production, application of BSMs lowered the emergence of Italian ryegrass (Lolium multiflorum L.), annual bluegrass, desert rock purslane (Calandrinia ciliata), and shepherd's purse (Capsella bursa-pastoris) and also increased strawberry fruit yield [35]. Mustard seed meal applied to the soil surface of containergrown ornamentals at 113, 225, and 450 g m-2 reduced the emergence of annual bluegrass, common chickweed, and creeping woodsorrel (Oxalis corniculata L.) upto 8-wk period [36]. Also, in a carrot field study, the application of BSMs at 1 and 2 t ha-1 rates provided effective weed control and increased plant-available soil inorganic nitrogen as well as carrot yield [37].

Similarly, Intanon, *et al.* [38] found that the single application of activated meadowfoam (*Limnanthes alba*) seed meal suppressed weeds in transplanted lettuce and also increased the nitrogen content, and lettuce yield. The application of soybean and mustard seed meal at a rate of 4.48 t ha⁻¹ lowered the weed densities from 52 to 95% and 41 to 45% at 3 and 6 weeks after planting, respectively, in organically-grown broccoli and spinach [39]. In a greenhouse study, mustard seed meal derived from "IdaGold" significantly reduced the emergence of redroot pigweed but negatively affected onion yield when applied from planting to the one-leaf stage of onions [40]. This suggests that mustard seed meal has a potential to be used as a weed-suppressive amendment in organic production systems, however, rates and timing of application of mustard seed meal should be considered to minimize the phytotoxicity on the crop.

3. Weed control using plant extracts

125

126

127

128

129

130

131

132

133

134

135

136

137

138

139

140

141

142

143

144

145

146

147

148

149

150

151

152

153

154

155

156

157

158

159

160

161

162

163

164

165

166

4 of 14

The extracts from different plant parts such as leaves, stems, roots, and seeds also have a potential to be used as natural herbicides. Some plants have the capacity to inhibit the germination and growth of other plants by exuding phytotoxic allelochemicals. These allelochemicals are released through volatilization, leaching or decomposition [41,42]. Allelochemicals can inhibit the growth of weeds through inhibition of photosynthesis, decline in chlorophyll content, disruption of the cell membrane, and inhibition of enzymatic activity [43]. Numerous plants possess allelopathic potential and they have been used for weed control both in lab and field studies. It is estimated that there are about 400,000 compounds in plants with allelopathic activities, of which only 3% have been identified for herbicidal activity [44]. The remaining compounds are unknown and might contain very promising growth inhibitors.

The aqueous extracts from the leaves of lettuce (Lactuca sativa), cocklebur (Xanthium occidentale) and Japanese thistle (Cirsium japonicum) inhibited the root growth of alfalfa [Medicago sativa L.] [45]. Likewise, in another study, water extracts from the fresh leaves of Tree of Heaven (Ailanthus altissima L.) also showed inhibitory effect on seed germination and plant growth of alfalfa [46]. In greenhouse studies, Khanh, et al. [47] showed that Chinese taro (Alocasia cucullata L.), nerium (Nerium oleander L.), purple passionflower (Passiflora incarnate L.) and Japanese pagoda tree (Sophora japonica L.) powders at 1.5 t ha-1 significantly reduced paddy weeds growth and dry weight by 60-100% and 70-100%, respectively, whereas, in paddy fields weed dry weight was reduced by more than 80% and also rice yield was increased by 20% as compared to control. Therefore, this suggests that these plants might be useful as natural herbicides and might contain various growth inhibitors that could be used for the development of bioherbicides. The aqueous extracts (10 g L⁻¹) and powders (1, 2 and 4 t ha⁻¹) of castor (Ricinus communis), tobacco (Nicotiana tabacum L.), pricklyburr (Datura inoxia Mill.), and sorghum (Sorghum vulgar L.) significantly inhibited seed germination and growth of field bindweed [Convolvulus arvensis] [48]. Similarly, in another greenhouse study, germination and growth of redroot pigweed was significantly inhibited by water extracts and powders of castor, tobacco, and pricklyburr [49], indicating these plant species could be used as post-emergence bioherbicides against field bindweed and redroot pigweed. Furthermore, extracts of sorghum aerial parts reduced density and dry weight of field bindweed and eucalyptus leaves extract inhibited germination of field bindweed [50,51]. Black walnut (Juglans nigra) has an allelopathic effect on other plants and its extract is commercially formulated as bioherbicide (NatureCur®, Redox Chemicals, LLC, Burley, ID, USA). This commercial product when applied as a soil-drench at a concentration of 42.9% completely inhibited the growth of horseweed and hairy fleabane [Conyza bonariensis] [52]. Rice hull extracts could also be a good source of natural herbicide and have been shown to inhibit the seed germination and growth of barnyardgrass [53].

Dhima, Vasilakoglou, Gatsis, Panou-Philotheou and Eleftherohorinos [9] indicated that aqueous extracts of different plant parts of aromatic plants, such as anise (*Pimpinella anisum*), dill (*Anethum graveolens* L.), oregano (*Origanum vulgare* L.) and lacy phacelia (*Phacelia tanacetifolia* Benth.) could be used for the control of barnyard grass and some broadleaf weeds. Batish, *et al.* [54] observed that leaf powder of Mexican marigold (*Tagetes minuta* L.) applied to rice field soil at a rate of 1 to 2 t ha-1 significantly reduced the emergence and growth of barnyardgrass and purple nutsedge (*Cyperus rotundus* L.), and the results were similar to herbicide treatments, indicating that dried powder of Mexican marigold could be used as a natural herbicide for managing rice weeds. In an earlier study, oregano biomass mixed with soil (50 g of fresh biomass or 10 g of freeze-dried biomass per kg of soil)

5 of 14

completely inhibited the germination and plant growth of ryegrass (*Lolium perenne*) and redroot pigweed in tomato crop due to presence of high content of carvacrol, a component of essential oils produced by several aromatic plants [55]. Therefore, oregano biomass could be a promising tool for weed control and it can be used as an alternative weed control method to avoid herbicide resistance problem.

Different plant species have different allelopathic activity and this variation is due to the different nature of allelochemicals released by these species. For example pricklyburr extract have atropine, scopolamine, essential oils, saponins, flavonoids, phenols, and cardiac glycosides [56]. Cultivated tobacco extract have alkaloids, flavonoids, phytosterols, triterpinoids, tannins, and carbohydrates [57]. Sorghum extract releases benzoic acid, p-hydroxybenozoic acid, vanillic acid, m-coumaric acid and p-coumaric acid [58]. The aqueous extracts of decomposing rice residue release coumaric acids, ferulic acid, and p-hydroxybenzoic acid [53,59]. These compounds could be an alternative weed management tool for crop production and can offer environmental benefits. This would consequently minimize the herbicide usage and resistance issues.

4. Weed control using plant essential oils

Among natural products, plant essential oils have shown great phytotoxicity against a wide range of weeds and are the natural alternative to non-selective synthetic herbicides. Essential oils are volatile compounds that are usually assumed to be the result of distillation or a steam-stripping process. They contain natural flavors and fragrances that provide characteristic odors [60], and also contain allelochemicals that inhibit seed germination and plant growth and therefore, can be used as a tool in weed control [61-63]. Additionally, they break down quickly in the environment and therefore, they are acceptable for weed control by organic growers. Terpenoids, particularly monoterpenes and sesquiterpenes, are the main components of essential oil and are often responsible for their plant inhibitory activity [64]. The inhibitory activity against seeds or plants varied with the species from which the essential oil is extracted [65]. Several researchers have reported the allelopathic effects caused by essential oils in the laboratory as well as in field conditions [66].

Aromatic plants are rich in essential oil content, and these essential oils have allelopathic effects, therefore, they could be used for weed control in agriculture [67]. Palmer amaranth (Amaranthus palmeri L.) germination was inhibited by essential oils of certain aromatic plants, including oregano, sweet marjoram (Origanum majorana L.), and lemon basil (Ocimum citriodorum L.) [65]. The essential oils from Lawson cypress (Chamaecyparis lawsoniana), rosemary (Rosmarinus officinalis L.), white cedar (Thuja occidentalis), and eucalypt strongly inhibited the germination of amaranth, purslane and knapweed (Acroptilon repens), which indicates they can be used as a natural pre-emergent herbicide for weed control [67]. Singh, Batish, Setia and Kohli [12] reported the herbicidal activity of volatile oils from Eucalyptus citriodora against congress grass (Parthenium hysterophorus). Similarly, in a laboratory studies, Batish, et al. [68] reported the herbicidal activity of volatile oils from E. citriodora against some agricultural weeds such as canary grass (*Phalaris minor*), common lambsquarter, barnyardgrass, chickweed (Ageratum conyzoides), congress grass, and Amaranthus spp. The activity of these volatile oils was similar to that of glyphosate. The essential oils extracted from the leaves and flowers of five different plant species [common wormwood (Artemisia vulgaris), spearmint (Mentha spicata L. subsp. Spicata), basil (Ocimum basilicum), sage (Salvia officinalis), thyme (Thymbra spicata L. subsp. spicata)] showed inhibitory effect on seed germination and seedling

6 of 14

growth of eight weed species from different families [corn cockle (*Agrostemma githago* L.), redroot pigweed, hoary cress (*Cardaria draba* - (L.) *Desv.*), common lambquarters, barnyard grass, wild mignonette (*Reseda lutea* L.), curly dock (*Rumex crispus* L.), red clover (*Trifolium pretense* L.)] [69]. Similarly, the essential oils from red thyme, summer savory (*Satureja hortensis*), cinnamon (*Cinnamomum verum*), and clove (*Syzygium aromaticum* L.) showed strong phytotoxic effect on common lambsquarters, common ragweed (*Ambrosia artemisiifolia*), johnsongrass, and dandelion (*Taraxacum officinale* L.) due to rapid cellular electrolyte leakage [70]. Dhima, Vasilakoglou, Gatsis, Panou-Philotheou and Eleftherohorinos [9] found that anise, sweet fennel (*Foeniculum vulgare*), lacy phacelia (*Phacelia tanacetifolia*), and coriander (*Coriandrum sativum*) aqueous extracts inhibited 100% germination, root length, and seedling fresh weight of barnyardgrass. The essential oils extracted from cinnamon, lavender (*Lavandula*) and peppermint (Mentha x piperita) showed inhibitory effect on seed germination of pigweed, wild mustard (*Sinapis arvensis*), and ryegrass [71], indicating that essential oils can act as a natural herbicides.

Manuka oil, obtained from the manuka tree (*Leptospermum scoparium*) with the main active ingredient, leptospermone inhibited the growth of large crab grass (*Digitaria spp.*) and this can be used as a tool for weed management in both organic and conventional farming systems [72]. Citrus oil, with the main active ingredient, D-limonene has been commercialized as an organic weed management product. D-limonene removes the waxy cuticular layer from the leaves of the treated plants causing dehydration and death of the green tissue [73]. Vetiver oil is an essential oil distilled from the roots of vetiver grass (*Vetiveria zizanioides* Lynn *Nas*) inhibit the seed germination of redroot pigweed, velvetleaf (*Abutilon theophrasti*), giant ragweed (*Ambroisia trifida*), pitted morninglory (*Ipomea lacunosa*) and common lambsquarters [74].

The use of essential oils seems promising for weed control and could be used as natural herbicides for the management of weeds in organic agriculture, but the efficacy of these natural herbicides is only for a limited time because they are very sensitive to photolysis and volatilize very quickly. Therefore, it is possible that essential oils could be integrated with other weed management tools to get broad-spectrum weed control.

5. Weed control using pathogens

There are a significant number of microbial agents that have a potential to be used as a bioherbicide for the control of weeds in several high value crops, such as obligate fungal parasites, soil-borne fungal pathogens, non-phytopathogenic fungi, pathogenic and non-pathogenic bacteria, and nematodes [75,76]. Such bioherbicides offer many advantages such as high degree of specificity of target weed, absence of weed resistance development, no effect on non-target or beneficial plants, and the absence of build-up of residue in the soil. In the last few decades, several pathogenic fungi and bacteria have gained much attention for the control of weeds [77].

The first registered bioherbicide in the USA was DeVine® (Encore Technologies, Plymouth, MN, USA), a liquid formulation comprised of chlamydospores of the soilborne fungus *Phytophthora palmivora* for the control of stranglervine (*Morrenia odorata*) in citrus [75]. Collego®, a wetabble powder formulation of endemic anthrocnose fungus *Collectotrichum gleosporiodes* f. sp. *aeschynemone* (cga) was the first commercially available bioherbicide for the control of weeds in annual crops [78]. After the successful development of Collego®, another *Collectotrichum*-based mycoherbicide Biomal® (*C. gleosporiodes* (Penz.) *Sacc.* f. sp. *malavae*) was developed to control round-leaved mallow (*Malva*

7 of 14

pusilla) in USA and Canada [79]. Thereafter, several other pathogens have been developed and registered for use as bioherbicides [76,80]. Most mycoherbicides consist of fungal pathogens such as the Colletotrichum species that could be mass cultured in artificial media to produce large quantities of inoculum and applied to the weed host in a similar manner to conventional herbicides [81]. These fungal plant pathogens infect the aerial portions of host plant (weeds), resulting in visible disease symptoms and ultimately cause plant mortality. However, some fungal pathogens are obligate parasites that can only proliferate on host plants. Such pathogens are cultured in mass on the host plant (weeds) in greenhouses or in small areas from which uredospores are vacuum-harvested and later mycoherbicides are prepared. The harvested uredospores can be applied in the field through different irrigation systems [77,82].

Puccinia canalicuta, a rust fungus, commercialized under the name of Dr. Biosedge is a foliar pathogen used for the control of yellow nutsedge (Cyperus esculantus L.). It is endemic rust that completely parasitizes yellow nutsedge [82]. However, this fungus was effective only on certain biotypes of yellow nutsedge and completely ineffective on purple nutsedge. Later, Kadir and Charudattan [83] and Shabana, et al. [84] reported significant reduction in shoot numbers, shoot dry weight, and tuber dry weight of greenhouse-grown purple nutsedge with foliar Dactylaria higginsii fungus, and no harmful effect was observed on most vegetable crops. Yandoc, et al. [85] tested two fungal pathogens, Drechslera gigantea and Bipolaris sacchari and concluded that these fungi, alone or in combination, can effectively suppress cogongrass (Imperata cylindrica). Another fungus, Phoma chenopodicola has been investigated as a potential control agent for common lambsquarter, creeping thistle (Cirsium arvense), green foxtail (Setaria virdis) and annual mercury (Mercurialis annua) [86]. Bailey and Derby [87] reported that the naturally occurring fungus *Phoma macrostoma* or extracts obtained therefrom, control several broadleaf weeds, including Canada thistle (Cirsium arvense), perennial sowthistle (Sonchus arvensis), dandelion (Taraxacum officinale), scentless chamomile (Matricaria perforata), false cleavers (Galium spurium), chickweed (Stellaria media), wild buckwheat (Fallopia convolvulus), and field bindweed, and its effect is equivalent to the synthetic herbicide pendimethalin. In a study by Weidemann, et al. [88], the fungal pathogen Microsphaeropsis amaranthi, Phoma proboscis and Colletotrichum capsici controlled certain pigweed species, field bindweed and morning glory (*Ipomoea spp.*), respectively. In another study, the spore suspensions of *M. amaranthi* and P. amaranthicola alone or in mixture significantly reduced the biomass of common waterhemp (Amaranthus rudis) and pigweed in pumpkin and soybean [89].

It has been known that approximately eight *Myrothecium* species, including *M. gramineum*, *M. roridum*, and *M. verrucarium*, have been reported worldwide. The fungus could effectively control several common weeds under field conditions [90-92]. In tomato crop, the conidial spray of *M. verrucaria* controlled 90-95% of purslane species and 85-95% of spurge species without harmful effect on transplanted tomato plants [90]. Furthermore, soilborne fungi have become important candidate for bioherbicides since these fungi's can be directly applied to the soil to control weeds by decaying seeds prior to emergence or by killing the seedlings shortly after emergence [93]. Trichoderma virens (*Gliocladium virens*), a soilborne fungus, significantly reduced the emergence and growth of redroot pigweed and broadleaf weeds in high value crops when inoculated in composted chicken manure [94]. Two fungi's, *Alternaria conjuncta/infectoria* and *Fusarium tricinctum* isolated from parasitic weed dodder (*Cuscuta spp.*) used alone or in combination have significantly controlled dodder in cranberry beds [95].

8 of 14

A number of bacteria have also been studied to control several weeds [76]. Out of these *Pseudomonas fluorescens* and *Xanthomonas campestris* have gained most attention. In greenhouse and field tests, *Pseudomonas* spp. have shown herbicidal activity against several weeds, for instance, *P. syringae* pv. *tagetis* against annual bluegrass and *Asteraceae* weeds including common cocklebur (*Xanthium strumarium*), wild sunflower (*Helianthus spp.*), common ragweed (*Ambrosia artimisifolia*), and Canada thistle (*Cirsium arvense*) [96], *P. fluorescens* LS102 and LS174 against leafy spurge (*Euphorbia esula*) [97], and *P. fluorescens* D7 against downy brome (*Bromus tectorum*) [77]. The phytotoxin produced from a crude extract of P. syringae (strain 3366) controlled germination of annual weeds in newly established 'Stevens' cranberry bogs [98]. Banowetz, *et al.* [99] have reported that *P. fluorescens* produce and secrete herbicidal compounds, termed germination-arrest factor that target the seeds of certain grassy weeds. This natural occurring herbicide irreversibly blocks the germination process immediately after the emergence of the plumule and coleorhiza.

The other bacterial species that have received attention for weed control is *Xanthomonas campestris*. A host-specific pathogen, *X. campestris* pv. *poae* (JT-P482) have been used for the control of annual bluegrass [100]. Recently, in greenhouse studies, Boyette and Hoagland [101] have also reported the bioherbicidal activity of *X. campestris* (isolate LVA-987) against horseweed (*Conyza canadensis* L. *Cronq.*).

Despite many advantages of pathogens to be use as bioherbicides, certain factors have been reported to limit its use and adoption. These include biological constraints (narrow host range and resistance), environment constraints (specific environmental conditions for culturing and formulation to assure biotic agent efficacy), commercial limitations [intense evaluation, patent protection, stringent regulations, and high costs] [77]. Therefore, bioherbicides should not be viewed as a total replacement of current or future synthetic herbicides, but they could be integrated into production systems with other weed management technologies to get broad-spectrum weed control, avoid the buildup of herbicide-resistance and invasive weeds, and increase crop production.

6. Natural products as a tool for integrated weed management

Integrated weed management includes different weed control methods to provide the crop with an advantage over weeds [102]. Interest in non-chemical weed control has been increasing due to the demand for organically grown produce, environmental concerns over herbicide use, and spread of herbicide-resistant biotypes. Therefore, an alternative weed management tools are needed under current situations. Although none of the above described natural products have potential to comprehensively replace chemical weed management; but an integrated approach may lead to success. These natural products can be integrated with other weed control methods to get broad-spectrum weed control, avoid herbicide resistance, reduce production costs, and increase crop yield. The use of natural products along with other weed management tools will be an important step towards sustainability in agriculture. Thus, more field research on non-synthetic herbicides is required that would support sustainable agricultural production.

7. Conclusions

From the above discussion, it is clear that many natural products have a great potential for controlling weeds. We expect that these bioherbicides would first be used in organic production systems but due to increased demand for new herbicidal products for resistance management, they could also serve as a template for the synthesis of new herbicides based on their chemistry. These

- natural product bioherbicides could be used as a component in integrated weed management system
- to reduce the risk of herbicide resistance, increase crop production, and reduce production rates. To
- date, there are few bioherbicides that are commercially available, therefore, future research should
- focus on the development of new bioherbicides, so that they can become mainstream products in the
- 340 future.
- 341 Author Contributions: Both the authors, Dr. Rupinder Saini and Dr. Sukhbir Singh have major contribution in
- writing this manuscript. Dr. Saini, X.X.; writing—original draft preparation. Dr. Singh's contribution in X.X.;
- 343 writing—review and editing.
- Funding: This research received no external funding.
- 345 **Conflicts of Interest:** The authors declare no conflict of interest.
- 347 References

346

348

- 349 1. Oerke, E.C. Crop losses to pests. *J Agric Sci.* **2006**, *144*, 31-43.
- Jabran, K.; Mahajan, G.; Sardana, V.; Chauhan, B.S. Allelopathy for weed control in agricultural systems. *Crop Prot.* **2015**, *72*, 57-65.
- 352 3. Naik, S.; Prasad, R. Pesticide residue in organic and conventional food-risk analysis. *Chem Health Saf* **2006**, *13*, 12-19.
- Duke, S.O.; Dayan, F.E.; Rimando, A.M.; Schrader, K.K.; Aliotta, G.; Oliva, A.; Romagni, J.G. Chemicals from nature for weed management. *Weed Sci.* **2002**, *50*, 138-151.
- Walz, E. Final results of the third biennial national organic farmers' survey, santa cruz, ca: Organic farming research foundation (ofrf). Available online: Http: www.ofrf.org/publications/survey/final.
 Results. Third. Nof. Survey. Pdf (assessed: April 22, 2018). 1999.
- Rassaeifar, M.; Hosseini, N.; Asl, N.H.H.; Zandi, P.; Aghdam, A.M. Allelopathic effect of *eucalyptus* globulus' essential oil on seed germination and seedling establishment of *amaranthus blitoides* and *cyndon dactylon. Trakia J. Sci.* **2013**, *11*, 73-81.
- Rice, E.L. *Allelopathy*. Academic: New York, 1974.
- Putnam, A.R. Use of allelopathic cover crops to inhibit weeds. *Science* **1979**, *36*, 580-582.
- Dhima, K.V.; Vasilakoglou, I.; Gatsis, T.D.; Panou-Philotheou, E.; Eleftherohorinos, I. Effects of aromatic plants incorporated as green manure on weed and maize development. *Field Crops Res.* 2009, 110, 235-241.
- Dhima, K.; Vasilakoglou, I.; Eleftherohorinos, I.; Lithourgidis, A. Allelopathic potential of winter cereals and their cover crop mulch effect on grass weed suppression and corn development. *Crop Sci.* **2006**, *46*, 345-352.
- Caamal-Maldonado, J.A.; Jiménez-Osornio, J.J.; Torres-Barragán, A.; Anaya, A.L. The use of allelopathic legume cover and mulch species for weed control in cropping systems. *Agron. J.* 2001, 93, 27-36.
- 373 12. Singh, H.; Batish, D.; Setia, N.; Kohli, R. Herbicidal activity of volatile oils from *eucalyptus citriodora* against *parthenium hysterophorus*. *Ann Appl Biol.* **2005**, *146*, 89-94.
- White, R.H.; Worsham, A.D.; Blum, U. Allelopathic potential of legume debris and aqueous extracts. *Weed Sci.* **1989**, *37*, 674-679.

- Jamil, M.; Cheema, Z.A.; Mushtaq, M.N.; Farooq, M.; Cheema, M.A. Alternative control of wild oat
- and canary grass in wheat fields by allelopathic plant water extracts. Agron Sustain Dev. 2009, 29,
- 379 475-482.
- Dayan, F.E.; Cantrell, C.L.; Duke, S.O. Natural products in crop protection. *Bioorganic Med. Chem* **2009**, *17*, 4022-4034.
- Copping, L.G.; Duke, S.O. Natural products that have been used commercially as crop protection agents. *Pest Manag Sci* **2007**, *63*, 524-554.
- Dayan, F.E.; Duke, S.O. Natural products for weed management in organic farming in the USA.

 Outlook Pest Manag. 2010, 21, 156-160.
- 386 18. Liu, D.L.; Christians, N.E. Inhibitory activity of corn gluten hydrolysate on monocotyledonous and dicotyledonous species. *HortScience* **1997**, *32*, 243-245.
- Liu, D.L.-Y.; Christians, N.E.; Garbutt, J.T. Herbicidal activity of hydrolyzed corn gluten meal on three grass species under controlled environments. *J. Plant Growth Regul.* **1994**, *13*, 221-226.
- 390 20. Bingaman, B.R.; Christians, N.E. Greenhouse screening of corn gluten meal as a natural control product for broadleaf and grass weeds. *HortScience* **1995**, *30*, 1256-1259.
- Nonnecke, G.R.; Christians, N.E. In Evaluation of corn gluten meal as a natural, weed control product in strawberry. In ii international strawberry symposium. P 348, II International Strawberry Symposium 348, 1992; pp 315-320.
- 395 22. McDade, M.C.; Christians, N.E. Corn gluten meal—a natural preemergence herbicide: Effect on vegetable seedling survival and weed cover. *Am. J. Altern, Agric* **2000**, *15*, 189-191.
- 397 23. Yu, J.; Morishita, D.W. Response of seven weed species to corn gluten meal and white mustard (sinapis alba) seed meal rates. *Weed Technol.* **2014**, *28*, 259-265.
- Boydston, R.A.; Collins, H.P.; Vaughn, S.F. Response of weeds and ornamental plants to potting soil amended with dried distillers grains. *HortScience* **2008**, *43*, 191-195.
- Vaughn, S.F.; Palmquist, D.E.; Duval, S.M.; Berhow, M.A. Herbicidal activity of glucosinolatecontaining seedmeals. *Weed Sci.* **2006**, *54*, 743-748.
- 403 26. Rice, A.; Johnson-Maynard, J.; Thill, D.; Morra, M. Vegetable crop emergence and weed control following amendment with different *brassicaceae* seed meals. *Renew. Agr. Food Syst.* **2007**, *22*, 204-405 212.
- 406 27. Matthiessen, J.N.; Kirkegaard, J.A. Biofumigation and enhanced biodegradation: Opportunity and challenge in soilborne pest and disease management. *Crit Rev Plant Sci.* **2006**, *25*, 235-265.
- 408 28. Kirkegaard, J.; Sarwar, M. Biofumigation potential of brassicas. *Plant Soil* **1998**, *201*, 71-89.
- Hansson, D.; Morra, M.J.; Borek, V.; Snyder, A.J.; Johnson-Maynard, J.L.; Thill, D.C. Ionic thiocyanate (scn-) production, fate, and phytotoxicity in soil amended with *brassicaceae* seed meals.
- 411 J. Agric. Food Chem. 2008, 56, 3912-3917.
- Sang, J.; Minchinton, I.; Johnstone, P.; Truscott, R. Glucosinolate profiles in the seed, root and leaf tissue of cabbage, mustard, rapeseed, radish and swede. *Can J Plant Sci.* **1984**, *64*, 77-93.
- 414 31. Morra, M.; Kirkegaard, J. Isothiocyanate release from soil-incorporated *brassica* tissues. *Soil Biol.*415 *Biochem.* **2002**, *34*, 1683-1690.
- Handiseni, M.; Brown, J.; Zemetra, R.; Mazzola, M. Herbicidal activity of brassicaceae seed meal on
- wild oat (avena fatua), italian ryegrass (lolium multiflorum), redroot pigweed (amaranthus
- 418 retroflexus), and prickly lettuce (lactuca serriola). Weed Technol. 2011, 25, 127-134.

- 419 33. Boydston, R.A.; Vaughn, S.F.; Webber III, C.L.; Chaves-Cordoba, B. Evaluating mustard seed meal for weed suppression in potato (*solanum tuberosum*). *J Agric Sci.* **2018**, *10*, 48.
- 421 34. Rothlisberger, K.L.; Hons, F.M.; Gentry, T.J.; Senseman, S.A. Oilseed meal effects on the emergence and survival of crop and weed species. *Appl Environ Soil Sci.* **2012**, *2012*.
- Banuelos, G.S.; Hanson, B.D. Use of selenium-enriched mustard and canola seed meals as potential bioherbicides and green fertilizer in strawberry production. *HortScience* **2010**, *45*, 1567-1572.
- Boydston, R.A.; Anderson, T.; Vaughn, S.F. Mustard (*sinapis alba*) seed meal suppresses weeds in container-grown ornamentals. *HortScience* **2008**, *43*, 800-803.
- 427 37. Snyder, A.; Morra, M.J.; Johnson-Maynard, J.; Thill, D.C. Seed meals from *brassicaceae* oilseed crops as soil amendments: Influence on carrot growth, microbial biomass nitrogen, and nitrogen mineralization. *HortScience* **2009**, *44*, 354-361.
- 430 38. Intanon, S.; Hulting, A.G.; Mallory-Smith, C.A. Field evaluation of meadowfoam (*limnanthes alba*) seed meal for weed management. *Weed Sci.* **2015**, *63*, 302-311.
- 432 39. Shrestha, A.; Rodriguez, A.; Pasakdee, S.; Bañuelos, G. Comparative efficacy of white mustard (sinapis alba 1.) and soybean (glycine max 1. Merr.) seed meals as bioherbicides in organic broccoli (brassica oleracea var. Botrytis) and spinach (spinacea oleracea) production. Commun. Soil Sci. Plant 2015, 46, 33-46.
- 436 40. Boydston, R.A.; Morra, M.J.; Borek, V.; Clayton, L.; Vaughn, S.F. Onion and weed response to mustard (sinapis alba) seed meal. Weed Sci. 2011, 59, 546-552.
- 438 41. Cheema, Z.; Khaliq, A. Use of sorghum allelopathic properties to control weeds in irrigated wheat in a semi arid region of punjab. *Agric. Ecosyst. Environ.* **2000**, *79*, 105-112.
- 440 42. Putnam, A.R.; Duke, W.B. Biological suppression of weeds: Evidence for allelopathy in accessions of cucumber. *Science* **1974**, *185*, 370-372.
- 442 43. Ghanizadeh, H.; Lorzadeh, S.; Aryannia, N. Effect of weed interference on *zea mays*: Growth analysis.
 443 Weed Biol. Manag. 2014, 14, 133-137.
- 444 44. Einhellig, F.A.; Leather, G.R. Potentials for exploiting allelopathy to enhance crop production. *J. Chem. Ecol.* **1988**, *14*, 1829-1844.
- 446 45. Chon, S.U.; Kim, Y.M.; Lee, J.C. Herbicidal potential and quantification of causative allelochemicals from several compositae weeds. *Weed Res.* **2003**, *43*, 444-450.
- 448 46. Tsao, R.; Romanchuk, F.E.; Peterson, C.J.; Coats, J.R. Plant growth regulatory effect and insecticidal activity of the extracts of the tree of heaven (*ailanthus altissima* 1.). *BMC Ecol.* **2002**, *2*, 1.
- 450 47. Khanh, D.; Huu Hong, N.; Dang Xuan, T.; Min Chung, I. Paddy weed control by medicinal and leguminous plants from southeast asia. *Crop Prot.* **2005**, *24*, 421-431.
- 48. Nekonam, M.S.; Razmjoo, J.; Sharifnabi, B.; Karimmojeni, H. Assessment of allelopathic plants for their herbicidal potential against field bindweed ('convolvulus arvensis'). Aust J Crop Sci 2013, 7, 1654.
- 455 49. Nekonam, M.S.; Razmjoo, J.; Kraimmojeni, H.; Sharifnabi, B.; Amini, H.; Bahrami, F. Assessment of some medicinal plants for their allelopathic potential against redroot pigweed (*amaranthus retroflexus*). *J Plant Prot Res* **2014**, *54*, 90-95.
- Cheema, Z.; Khaliq, A.; Akhtar, S. Use of sorgaab (sorghum water extract) as a natural weed inhibitor
 in spring mungbean. *Int. J. Agric. Biol* 2001, 3, 515-518.
- Khan, M.A.; Hussain, I.; Khan, E.A. Suppressing effects of *eucalyptus camaldulensis* 1. On germination and seedling growth of six weeds. *J Weed Sci Res* **2008**, *14*, 201-207.

- Shrestha, A. Potential of a black walnut (*juglans nigra*) extract product (naturecur®) as a pre-and postemergence bioherbicide. *J Sustain Agr* **2009**, *33*, 810-822.
- 464 53. Ahn, J.K.; Chung, I.M. Allelopathic potential of rice hulls on germination and seedling growth of barnyardgrass. *Agron. J.* **2000**, *92*, 1162-1167.
- 466 54. Batish, D.R.; Arora, K.; Singh, H.P.; Kohli, R.K. Potential utilization of dried powder of *tagetes minuta* 467 as a natural herbicide for managing rice weeds. *Crop Prot.* **2007**, *26*, 566-571.
- Da Mastro, G.; Fracchiolla, M.; Verdini, L.; Montemurro, P. In *Oregano and its potential use as bioherbicide. Proc. I international symposium on the labiatae: Advances in production, biotechnology and utilisation.* 723, International Symposium on the Labiatae: Advances in Production, Biotechnology and Utilisation 723, 2006; pp 335-346.
- 472 56. Ayuba, V.; Ojobe, T.; Ayuba, S. Phytochemical and proximate composition of *datura innoxia* leaf, seed, stem, pod and root. *J. Med. Plants Res.* **2011**, *5*, 2952-2955.
- 57. Sunil, K.; Sayeed, A.; Paras, S. Pharmacognostic evaluation and hptlc fingerprinting of *nicotiana*tabacum stem collected from different geographical regions of india. *Der. Pharmacia Sinica* **2011**, *2*,
 1-11.
- 477 58. Czarnota, M.A.; Paul, R.N.; Dayan, F.E.; Nimbal, C.I.; Weston, L.A. Mode of action, localization of production, chemical nature, and activity of sorgoleone: A potent psii inhibitor in sorghum spp. Root exudates. *Weed Technol.* **2001**, *15*, 813-825.
- 480 59. Ma, H.J.; Shin, D.H.; Lee, I.J.; Koh, J.C.; Park, S.K.; Kim, K.U. Allelopathic potential of k21, selected as a promising allelopathic rice. *Weed Biol. Manag.* **2006**, *6*, 189-196.
- 482 60. Mukhopadhyay, M. Natural extracts using supercritical carbon dioxide. CRC press: 2000.
- 483 61. Batish, D.R.; Singh, H.P.; Kaur, M.; Kohli, R.K.; Singh, S. Chemical characterization and phytotoxicity of volatile essential oil from leaves of *anisomeles indica* (lamiaceae). *Biochem Syst Ecol.*485 **2012**, *41*, 104-109.
- 486 62. Hazrati, H.; Saharkhiz, M.J.; Niakousari, M.; Moein, M. Natural herbicide activity of *satureja*487 hortensis l. Essential oil nanoemulsion on the seed germination and morphophysiological features of
 488 two important weed species. *Ecotoxicol Environ Saf.* 2017, 142, 423-430.
- 489 63. Mutlu, S.; Atici, O.; Esim, N. Bioherbicidal effects of essential oils of *nepeta meyeri* benth. On weed spp. *Allelopathy J* **2010**, *26*, 291-300.
- Weston, L.A.; Duke, S.O. Weed and crop allelopathy. Crit Rev Plant Sci. 2003, 22, 367-389.
- Dudai, N.; Poljakoff-Mayber, A.; Mayer, A.; Putievsky, E.; Lerner, H. Essential oils as allelochemicals and their potential use as bioherbicides. *J. Chem. Ecol.* **1999**, *25*, 1079-1089.
- 494 66. Farooq, M.; Jabran, K.; Cheema, Z.A.; Wahid, A.; Siddique, K.H. The role of allelopathy in agricultural pest management. *Pest Manag Sci* **2011**, *67*, 493-506.
- 496 67. Ramezani, S.; Saharkhiz, M.J.; Ramezani, F.; Fotokian, M.H. Use of essential oils as bioherbicides. *J*497 *Essent Oil Bear Pl* **2008**, *11*, 319-327.
- 498 68. Batish, D.; Kaur, S.; Singh, H.; Kohli, R. In Herbicidal activity of volatile oils from eucalyptus citriodor. In second european allelopathy symposium" allelopathy-from understanding to application.
- 500 P. 29., Second European Allelopathy Symposium" Allelopathy-from understanding to application, 2005; p 29.
- 502 Onen, H.; Ozer, Z.; Telci, I. Bioherbicidal effects of some plant essential oils on different weed species.

 503 *Journal of Plant Diseases and Protection Sonderheft* **2002**, *18*, 597-606.
- 504 70. Tworkoski, T. Herbicide effects of essential oils. Weed Sci. 2002, 50, 425-431.

- Campiglia, E.; Mancinelli, R.; Cavalieri, A.; Caporali, F. Use of essential oils of cinnamon, lavender and peppermint for weed control. *Ital. J. Agron.* **2007**, *2*, 171-178.
- Dayan, F.E.; Howell, J.L.; Marais, J.P.; Ferreira, D.; Koivunen, M. Manuka oil, a natural herbicide with preemergence activity. *Weed Sci.* **2011**, *59*, 464-469.
- 509 73. Erasto, P.; Viljoen, A.M. Limonene-a review: Biosynthetic, ecological and pharmacological relevance.
 510 *Nat Prod Commun* **2008**, *3*, 1193-1202.
- 511 74. Mao, L.; Henderson, G.; Laine, R.A. Germination of various weed species in response to vetiver oil and nootkatone. *Weed Technol.* **2004**, *18*, 263-267.
- 513 75. Charudattan, R. Use of plant pathogens as bioherbicides to manage weeds in horticultural crops. *Proc.*514 *Fla. State Hort. Soc* **2005**, *118*, 208-214.
- 515 76. Harding, D.P.; Raizada, M.N. Controlling weeds with fungi, bacteria and viruses: A review. *Front Plant Sci.* **2015**, *6*, 659.
- 517 77. Kremer, R.J. The role of bioherbicides in weed management. *Biopest. Inter.* **2005**, *1*, 127-141.
- 518 78. Ahluwalia, A.D. Bioherbicides: An eco-friendly approach to weed management. *Curr. Sci.* **2007**, *92*, 519 10.
- 520 79. Charudattan, R. In *Pathogens with potential for weed control. In acs symposium series 439 pp.132-* 521 154 ref.119, ACS Symposium Series 439 pp.132-154 ref.119, 1990; pp 132-154.
- 522 80. Cai, X.; Gu, M. Bioherbicides in organic horticulture. *Horticulturae* **2016**, 2, 3.
- 523 81. Caldwell, C.J.; Hynes, R.K.; Boyetchko, S.M.; Korber, D.R. Colonization and bioherbicidal activity 524 on green foxtail by *pseudomonas fluorescens* brg100 in a pesta formulation. *Can J Microbiol* **2012**, 525 58, 1-9.
- Phatak, S.C.; Sumner, D.R.; Wells, H.D.; Bell, D.K.; Glaze, N.C. Biological control of yellow nutsedge with the indigenous rust fungus *puccinia canaliculata*. *Science* **1983**, *219*, 1446-1447.
- 528 83. Kadir, J.; Charudattan, R. *Dactylaria higginsii*, a fungal bioherbicide agent for purple nutsedge (cyperus rotundus). Biol Control **2000**, 17, 113-124.
- 530 84. Shabana, Y.M.; Charudattan, R.; Abou Tabl, A.H.; Morales-Payan, J.P.; Rosskopf, E.N.; Klassen, W. 531 Production and application of the bioherbicide agent *dactylaria higginsii* on organic solid substrates.
- 532 *Biol Control* **2010**, *54*, 159-165.
- 533 S5. Yandoc, C.B.; Charudattan, R.; Shilling, D.G. Evaluation of fungal pathogens as biological control agents for cogongrass (*imperata cylindrica*). *Weed Technol.* **2005**, *19*, 19-26.
- 535 86. Cimmino, A.; Andolfi, A.; Zonno, M.C.; Avolio, F.; Santini, A.; Tuzi, A.; Berestetskyi, A.; Vurro, M.;
- Evidente, A. Chenopodolin: A phytotoxic unrearranged ent-pimaradiene diterpene produced by phoma
- 537 chenopodicola, a fungal pathogen for *chenopodium album* biocontrol. *J. Nat. Prod.* **2013**, *76*, 1291-538 1297.
- 539 87. Bailey, K.L.; Derby, J. Fungal isolates and biological control compositions for the control of weeds.
 540 Google Patents: 2010.
- Weidemann, G.; TeBeest, D.; Templeton, G. Fungal plant pathogens used for biological weed control.

 Arkansas farm research-Arkansas Agricultural Experiment Station (USA) 1992.
- 543 89. Ortiz-Ribbing, L.M.; Glassman, K.R.; Roskamp, G.K.; Hallett, S.G. Performance of two bioherbicide fungi for waterhemp and pigweed control in pumpkin and soybean. *Plant Dis* **2011**, *95*, 469-477.
- 545 90. Boyette, C.D.; Hoagland, R.E.; Abbas, H.K. Evaluation of the bioherbicide *myrothecium verrucaria* for weed control in tomato (*lycopersicon esculentum*). *Biocontrol Sci Technol* **2007**, *17*, 171-178.

- 547 91. Anderson, K.I.; Hallett, S.G. Herbicidal spectrum and activity of *myrothecium verrucaria*. *Weed Sci.* 548 2004, *52*, 623-627.
- 549 92. Lee, H.-B.; Kim, J.-C.; Hong, K.-S.; Kim, C.-J. Evaluation of a fungal strain, *myrothecium roridum* 550 f0252, as a bioherbicide agent. *Plant Pathol. J* **2008**, *24*, 453-460.
- Jones, R.; Hancock, J.G. Soilborne fungi for biological control of weeds. *ACS Symposium Series 439* **1990**, 276-286.
- 553 94. Héraux, F.M.G.; Hallett, S.G.; Ragothama, K.G.; Weller, S.C. Composted chicken manure as a medium for the production and delivery of *trichoderma virens* for weed control. *HortScience* **2005**, 40, 1394-1397.
- Hopen, H.; Caruso, F.; Bewick, T. In Control of dodder in cranberry vaccinium macrocarpon with a
 pathogen-based bioherbicide. In vi international symposium on vaccinium culture. P. 446, VI
 International Symposium on Vaccinium Culture 446, 1996; pp 427-428.
- Johnson, D.R.; Wyse, D.L.; Jones, K.J. Controlling weeds with phytopathogenic bacteria. *Weed Technol.* **1996**, *10*, 621-624.
- 561 97. Brinkman, M.A.; Clay, S.A.; Kremer, R.J. Influence of deleterious rhizobacteria on leafy spurge (euphorbia esula) roots. Weed Technol. 1999, 13, 835-839.
- Norman, M.A.; Patten, K.D.; Gurusiddaiah, S. Evaluation of a phytotoxin (s) from *pseudomonas* syringae for weed control in cranberries. *HortScience* **1994**, *29*, 1475-1477.
- 565 99. Banowetz, G.M.; Azevedo, M.D.; Armstrong, D.J.; Halgren, A.B.; Mills, D.I. Germination-arrest factor (gaf): Biological properties of a novel, naturally-occurring herbicide produced by selected isolates of rhizosphere bacteria. *Biol Control* **2008**, *46*, 380-390.
- 568 100. Imaizumi, S.; Nishino, T.; Miyabe, K.; Fujimori, T.; Yamada, M. Biological control of annual bluegrass (*poa annua* 1.) with a japanese isolate of *xanthomonas campestris* pv. *Poae* (jt-p482). *Biol Control* 1997, 8, 7-14.
- 571 101. Boyette, C.D.; Hoagland, R.E. Bioherbicidal potential of *xanthomonas campestris* for controlling conyza canadensis. Biocontrol Sci Technol **2015**, 25, 229-237.
- 573 102. Swanton, C.J.; Weise, S.F. Integrated weed management: The rationale and approach. *Weed Technol.* 1991, *5*, 657-663.